UNIVERSITETI I EVROPES JUGLINDORE

UNIVERZITET NA JUGOISTOČNA EVROPA

SOUTH EAST EUROPEAN UNIVERSITY

POSTGRADUATE STUDIES-SECOND CYCLE

THESIS:

THE KOSOVO PRIMARY AND LOWER SECONDARY EDUCATION CURRICULUM: AN ASSESSMENT OF ITS AIMS AND EFFECTIVENESS IN DEVELOPING ENGLISH-LANGUAGE SKILLS

CANDIDATE:

LIBRON I. KELMENDI

MENTOR:

ANDREW GOODSPEED

Tetovo, March 2021

Declaration

I, Libron Kelmendi, herewith pledge that I intended to work on my Master diploma thesis fully respecting the academic standards of the South East European. I certify that I am the original author of this work. Therefore, any source, information, material and reference used has been fully identified and properly acknowledged through quotation, summarizing and paraphrasing. The copyright is transferred to the University for use for educational and research purposes.

Libron Kelmendi

_____

Working title of the thesis:

"The Kosovo Primary and Lower Secondary Education Curriculum: An Assessment of its Aims and Effectiveness in Developing English-Language Skills"

Translation of the working title in Albanian:

"Kurrikula e Kosovës për arsimin fillor dhe të mesëm të ulët, vlerësim i qëllimeve dhe efikasitetit të kurrikulës në zhvillimin e aftësive të gjuhës angleze"

Превод на наслов на македонски:

"Курикулум за основно и пониско средно образование на Косово: Проценка на нејзините цели и ефикасност во развојот на вештини на англиски јазик"

Table of contents

List of tables

Abstract

With the new curriculum for primary and lower secondary education, a new period in the education system in Kosovo has begun. This period was not considered fruitful in the first years of application. In fact, gaps have been highlighted in the way the new curriculum is applied. Given this, this paper aims to perform an assessment of the aims of the Kosovo curriculum for primary and lower secondary education and to assess the effectiveness of this curriculum in relation to the development of English language skills. Questionnaires and interviews were used to collect data on the attitude of teachers towards the application and efficiency of the new curriculum. Preliminary results show that in different school institutions there are different views on the new curriculum. This mainly depends on the age of the teachers and their ability to be flexible in teaching. It can be concluded that not having a strategic plan for the preparation of teachers in how to implement the new curriculum has led to mistrust towards the aims of the curriculum and reduced efficiency in learning.

Keywords: Curriculum, education, effectiveness, assessment, teaching, learning.

Abstrakt

Me kurrikulën e re për arsimin fillor dhe të mesëm të ulët, ka filluar një periudhë e re në sistemin arsimor në Kosovë. Kjo periudhë nuk u konsiderua frytdhënëse në vitet e para të aplikimit. Në fakt, boshllëqe janë vënë në pah në mënyrën e aplikimit të kurrikulës së re. Nisur nga kjo, ky punim synon të bëjë një vlerësim të qëllimeve të kurrikulës se re në Kosovë për arsimin fillor dhe të mesëm të ulët dhe të vlerësojë efektivitetin e kësaj kurrikule në lidhje me zhvillimin e aftësive të gjuhës angleze. Pyetësorë dhe intervista u përdorën për të mbledhur të dhëna mbi qëndrimin e mësuesve ndaj zbatimit dhe efikasitetit të kurrikulës së re. Rezultatet paraprake tregojnë se në institucione të ndryshme shkollore ka pikëpamje të ndryshme për kurrikulën e re. Kjo kryesisht varet nga mosha e mësuesve dhe aftësia e tyre për të qenë fleksibël në mësimdhënie. Mund të konkludohet se mospasja e një plani strategjik për përgatitjen e mësuesve në mënyrën e zbatimit të kurrikulës së re ka çuar në mosbesim ndaj qëllimeve të kurrikulës dhe ulje të efikasitetit në të nxënit e mësimit.

Fjalët kyçe: Kurrikula, arsimi, efektiviteti, vlerësimi, mësimdhënia, mësimnxënia.

Апстракт

Со новата наставна програма во основното и пониско средно образование започна и новиот период во образовниот систем во Косово. Првите години од примената на овој систем не се сметаа за плодни како резултат на истакнатите празнини во начинот на примена на новата наставна програма. Со оглед на тоа, ова истражување има за цел да изврши проценка на целите на наставната програма во Косово, за основно и пониско средно образование, и да ја процени ефективноста на истата наставна програма во однос на развојот на вештините по Англиски јазик. Користени беа прашалници и интервјуа со цел да се соберат податоци за ставовите на наставниците кон примената и ефикасноста на новата наставна програма. Прелиминарните резултати укажуваат дека различни образовни институции имаат различни ставови за новата наставна програма. Овие различни ставови главно зависат од возраста на наставниците и нивната способност да бидат флексибилни во наставата. Заклучокот е дека недостатокот на стратешки план за подготовка на наставниците во однос на начинот на спроведување на новата наставна програма доведе до недоверба во целите на истата, и намалена ефикасност на учење.

Клучни зборови: наставна програма, образование, ефективност, проценка, настава, учење

Acknowledgements

Prima facie,

I thank Professor Andrew Goodspeed, my academic mentor, who by giving intellectual freedom to work on my thesis, by engaging and supporting me in new ideas has contributed to a fruitful experience. Honorable Professor Andrew, being persistent for a high quality of work has been exemplary to be remembered in my further work. The ideas, results and conclusions in this Master's thesis were realized with the help and support of the well-respected Professor Goodspeed. I would like to thank the academic staff of the Department of English Language Teaching at the Faculty of Languages, Cultures and Communication at the South East European University. Honestly, I have benefited a lot from the courses I have taken over the past year of studies.

Finally, I thank my family and friends who were the supporting hand for me during my Master studies.

1. Introduction

This chapter sets the background for this thesis. It begins by providing the background, the research context, purpose and aims of the study. The introductory chapter presents the issue of curriculum frameworks in Kosovo following the end of the war, the issue of first strategic plans for education in Kosovo and the issue the applicability of the Core Curriculums.

In this particular study an attempt will be made to conduct a well-structured paper on curriculum aims and its effectiveness in developing English language skills. Such disciplines, education and curriculum studies, have shown their importance during the 20th century when remarkable changes have been made in the process of teaching and learning. In the case of this Master thesis, changes that have had a significance in the process of teaching a foreign language in Kosovo will be discussed. These changes in general occurred after a period during which teachers focused more in elaborating the grammar of English Language and aiming to strengthen the skill of reading comprehension and writing of the students. The first significance of this Master thesis study is to offer understanding and clarity for the structure and content of Kosovo curriculum framework, core curriculums and on the implementation of the new curriculum at primary and lower secondary education. This has a great importance in providing insight about the role of curriculum in the process of teaching in Kosovo. A second significance of this Master thesis is providing curriculum assessment and curriculum analysis on how the main goals, expected outcomes and on how the implementation of curriculums is affecting the teaching of English language and the process of developing English language skills. As Wolf & Hill and Evers (2006) state, "curriculum assessment enables identifying aspects of a curriculum that are working, those that need to change and assess the effectiveness of changes that have already been made."[1] Therefore, exploring the abovementioned becomes essential in assessing them and in assessing the curriculum implementation process. Besides, this study would certainly prove to be of immense help to English Language undergraduate students, second cycle students and to other researchers, who at one point during their academic development aim to focus on the academic discipline of education or curriculum studies. This Master thesis study is an attempt

---

[1]Wolf, P. Hill, A. Evers, F. (2006). Handbook for Curriculum Assessment. Retrieved May 7, from https://ctlt.ubc.ca/files/2010/08/HbonCurriculumAssmt.pdf

to explore issues related to the curriculum frameworks in Kosovo and to Core Curriculums. It will explore the main developments in the education system in Kosovo over the last two decades that have influenced the developing and implementation of curriculums. With the development of curriculum frameworks, strategic plans for development of education in Kosovo were created. These strategic plans aim to increase the quality of education, a higher level of awareness for work in education, focus on achieving higher results, close monitoring of the processes taking place in teaching and maximum attention towards the process of the implementation of education strategies formulated by special commissions and approved by the Ministry of Education. In addition to strategic plans for education, Curriculum Frameworks have been designed and approved in Kosovo. It consists of a set of documents that regulate and define the goals of pre-university education in Kosovo, documents that determine the levels of education, education profiles, curricular areas, subjects, types and methods of assessment. The Curriculum Framework stands in function of the implementation of the core curriculum. Therefore, this study aims, in addition to the abovementioned, to explore various perceptions related to the issue of successfully implementing the curriculum in Kosovo.

1.1. Purpose

Studying English Language Teaching requires focusing in different branches of the education discipline. The purpose of conducting this thesis was to go through the most challenging fields that do develop the education system. During my time of studies, I became aware of the difficulties and challenges of the education system, curriculum implementation and also the teaching of English Language as the first foreign language in Kosovo. This has, in a way or another, driven me to conduct this thesis. The main purpose of this Master thesis then, is to:

1. Analyze Kosovo primary and lower secondary education curriculum as classified by International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED).

2. Provide analysis and discussion on the main goals and main expected outcomes that are related to the process of English Language Teaching and to the process of developing EL skills.

1.2. Aims and objectives

The aim of this master thesis is to discuss the importance of curriculum and to analyze and elaborate the structure and characteristics of curriculum frameworks and core curriculums for primary and lower secondary education. This thesis will focus on the curriculum area of Language and Communication. Sidek (2010) states that "the importance of the English language has been established universally as a tool for social, economic, and political success. As a result, many non-English speaking countries promote English proficiency as an effort toward modernization and internalization."[2] In Kosovo, English language starts from the first stage and is taught until last grade of upper secondary school. In the first stage (Grades I-V) this course is taught primarily through play, drawings and songs, with a focus on speaking, and continues to read and write in other stages.[3] In ISCED 2 or lower secondary education (Grades VI-IX), Language and Communication curriculum area enables students to develop and foster the use of language as a mean of communication at school, in everyday life, in professional life and in public life. It is an objective of this Master thesis to discuss how the curriculum affects developing English Language skills. The second point of focus in this Master thesis is to come up with an assessment of aims of the curriculums and the effectiveness of primary and lower secondary education curriculums in developing English Language skills. By this point of focus, this thesis contributes in the topic of curriculum implementation process in Kosovo's local context. At one and the same time, this thesis contributes to the wide spread debate about curriculum change and factors that in one a way or another affect or assist in the local curriculum implementation process. Among the above mentioned, it is a must to conduct a thesis which will aim to accomplish the following objectives:

1. Conduct a well written, illustrated thesis about the Kosovo primary and lower secondary education curriculums.

2. Define the curriculum and the importance of having a core curriculum.

3. Elaborate the curriculum area of Language and Communication.

---

[2] Sidek, M.H. (2010). EFL Curriculum Analysis: A case study. University of Malaysia. Retrieved May 8, from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/282206501_EFL_Curriculum_Analysis_A_Case_Study

[3] Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. (2012). Kosovo`s Core Curriculum for pre-primary grade and primary education. Retrieved May 8, from https://masht.rks-gov.net/uploads/2015/10/core-curriculum-for-pre-primary-grade-and-primary-education-in-kosovo.pdf

4. Identify the factors affecting the developing of English language skills.

5. Elaborate the aims of the curriculums.

6. Discuss the effectiveness of the curriculums.

7. Provide precise information about the implementation process.

1.3. Background of the research

1.3.1. The New Kosovo Curriculum Framework

At the end of the war in Kosovo, in 1999, most of the school infrastructure was damaged by the war while the rest were obsolete. Under the auspices of foreign governments and donations, efforts were underway to design a curriculum that would reform Kosovo's school system. Given the need for reform, UNICEF Kosovo was invited to act as lead agency for curriculum development. UNICEF Kosovo committed itself to support the curriculum reform process with regard to two main activities: [4]

1. The development of a New Curriculum Framework, setting the main orientations for a sustainable curriculum reform and for increased quality and equity in the education system based on progressive learning aims and objectives; contents; methods of teaching; and learning, assessment and evaluation procedures (November 2000-Fall 2001), and

2. The development of new guidelines for preschool education, and new subject curricula for primary education in all curriculum areas (Fall 2001-2002).

The curriculum, which was published in the fall of 2001, was hailed as the first important step towards the great goal of reforming the school system. It was UNICEF Kosovo that "provided funding and technical assistance, employing for this purpose IBE UNESCO and an international consultant who worked for nine months with the team of local specialists in the Curriculum Core Team."[5]

---

[4] Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST). (2001). The New Kosovo Curriculum Framework. Prishtina. UN Department of Education.
[5] Georgescu, D. (2002). On Curriculum Development in Kosovo. Retrieved May 12, from https://www.academia.edu/2759408/On_Curriculum_Development_in_Kosovo

Primary education in this curriculum is defined as compulsory education. As stated in the curriculum framework document of 2001, "During this stage, basic learning habits are set, and intellectual, emotional and social development should be nurtured with special attention to the development of children's personalities".[6] What is to be mentioned when reviewing and analyzing this curriculum is the fact that the main aims of this curriculum do not mention the teaching of English language or the development of English language skills. It should be mentioned also that in the period when this curriculum was being applied, the teaching of English language started from the fifth grade. Lower secondary education is also defined as compulsory education by this curriculum. In reviewing the part of lower secondary education, it is seen that the main purpose of this phase is the exposure of new academic knowledge, the basics of various sciences and thus, the preparation of students for further academic orientation or career. When it comes to learning English and developing English language skills in lower secondary education, the curriculum is clearer than in primary education. In the curriculum it states that "Students should be further exposed to English as the first foreign language, to the level of good oral communication and to a reasonable level of understanding written messages and mastering basic writing skills."[7] The use of the word "further" at this point is unnecessary for the simple reason that at this stage students are exposed for the first time to English. In the expected outcomes during this phase of lower secondary education we also encounter clear expectations in relation to the development of English language skills. In the chapter on curriculum areas, from the review we can see that explanations are given for the field and for the subjects that are related to the field. In order not to leave room for misinterpretation, what is meant by the field of curriculum should be defined. The team that worked on developing the 2001 Kosovo curriculum defined curriculum areas as areas that "represent groups of subjects which, owing to their epistemological profile, share common objectives and tasks in teaching and learning knowledge, skills, values and attitudes."[8] For the primary and lower secondary education, this curriculum has

---

[6] MEST. (2001). The New Kosovo Curriculum Framework; white discussion paper, 28. Prishtina. UN Department of Education.

[7] MEST. (2001). The New Kosovo Curriculum Framework; white discussion paper, 30. Prishtina. UN Department of Education.

[8] MEST. (2001). The New Kosovo Curriculum Framework; white discussion paper, 51. Prishtina. UN Department of Education.

provided seven (7) curriculum areas. Since this master's thesis focuses on the developing of English language skills, it is important to focus on the curriculum area of Language and Communication. The developers of this curriculum have emphasized the need for language inclusion in primary and lower secondary education. According to the curriculum, it is important that in addition to the mother tongue, foreign languages be taught with the sole purpose of using the language as a means of communication in every aspect of life, whether private or public. The developers of this curriculum have determined that "the first foreign language for all students will be English language."[9]

1.3.2. Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo

It was only in 2010, when the Ministry of Education started working on the second curriculum framework which was published as whole in August 2011. As an official document it was entitled "Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo." There was a ten-year period between the development of the first curriculum framework in Kosovo and the development of the second curriculum framework. During this period, continuous efforts have been made for further reform of the education system in Kosovo. This has been done mainly with the approval of legal and sub-legal acts. The need for the development of a new curricular framework arose based on various social and political factors. Various ideologies of political parties that have led in Kosovo and that have adopted new laws on compulsory education can be included as political factors. The need of improving the quality of education system and aiming to increase the number of qualified teachers can be political factors. Reviewing this curriculum, a factor in the development of the curriculum is the demographic movement that occurred in the decade 2001-2011. This factor is considered a social factor. Mostly these movements have been made from the village to the city, creating the problem of having schools that are not uniformly populated. What is meant by this is that as a result of these movements, schools in rural areas are half empty while those in urban areas are overcrowded. The development of the curriculum framework was essential in continuing the efforts to reform and improve the quality of education. In performing curriculum assessment and curriculum

---

[9] MEST. (2001). The New Kosovo Curriculum Framework; white discussion paper, 59. Prishtina. UN Department of Education.

analysis for this curriculum framework, the main goals and learning competences of this curriculum that are related to the developing of English language skills will be analyzed and assessed. "The Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in Kosovo consisted of or was divided into two main components: [10]

- The conceptual component, that is the Kosovo Curriculum Framework (KCF);
- The operational component, which is a complex set of documents enabling the implementation of KCF in the education system by clearly defining expectations about students', teachers' and schools' performance. Chapter 6 deals with the role and function of those documents, that is with the operational component.

The conceptual component includes the curriculum framework as a whole. A set of supporting documents are mentioned in the operational component. Documents that help the process of implementing the curriculum framework as a conceptual component are core curriculums for the education of children up to the age of five, core curriculums for primary, lower secondary and upper secondary education. Subject curriculums for each compulsory education grade are also supporting documents of the operational component. According to this curriculum framework, "Other documents that will facilitate the implementation of the curriculum at the school level include textbooks, additional teaching and learning resources, as well as teaching materials and assessment instruments."[11]

In functional terms, this curriculum framework has the role of the regulator of the pre-university education system. With its role, the curriculum framework defines the goals of pre-university education, key competencies, profiles of education, curriculum areas, the hierarchy of curriculum documents, as well as the curriculum implementation plan.

Kosovo's Curriculum Framework for pre-university education, in contrast to the first curriculum of 2001, includes the key learning competencies. It states, "Competencies involve an integrated and coherent system of knowledge, skills and attitudes that are applicable and transferable. They enable students to cope with the challenges of the digital age and with the

---

[10] (MEST). (2011). Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo, 14. Prishtina.
[11] (MEST). (2011). Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo, 42. Prishtina.

knowledge-based labor market in an interdependent world."[12] It is precisely here, that for the first time in this curriculum framework we encounter specific points related to the teaching of English language as the first foreign language. The competency for communication and expression foresees as a sub-competence the communication in a foreign language. From this competence it is expected that as a final result the student will be an effective communicator. According to Reznick (2010), nowadays, being an effective communicator means having the ability for: "Probing - The Art of Asking the Right Question at the Right Time, Identifying and Eliminating Communication Barriers, Listening, Responding."[13] As given in the curriculum framework, it states that students should be able to "talk, listen, read and write, and express themselves in their mother-tongue, English and in (at least) another foreign language."[14] The inclusion of key competencies shows the biggest shift made bin comparison to the 2001 curriculum framework. Unlike the 2001 curriculum framework that was based on subject, the curriculum framework of 2011 is based on competences. Rozafa Ferizi Shala, from the staff of the Faculty of Education at the University of Prishtina in her research work has discussed this issue. According to her, "the 2001 curriculum framework, the subject-based curriculum is predetermined by what society and education experts consider that students should know by the end of pre-university education. While the competency-based curriculum, this of 2011, is developed on what students will be able to do after completing a studying course."[15]

When discussing about differences, it is of great importance to identify and discuss the similarities between these two curriculum frameworks. From the review of both curriculum frameworks it can be noticed that there is a great similarity in key stages of curriculum. In the following tables we will present the key stages from the 2001 curriculum framework and 2011 curriculum framework.

Age	Formal education stage	Grade	Key stages of the curriculum

---

[12] (MEST). (2011). Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo, 16. Prishtina.
[13] Reznick, K. (2010). How to be a more effective communicator. Retrieved May 15, from http://www.creativetraining.com/train/docs/effective-communicator.pdf
[14] (MEST). (2011). Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo, 18. Prishtina.
[15] Ferizi Shala, R. (2014). Planning and implementing in Pre-Primary classes according to Kosovo Curriculum Framework – Case Study. In Conference Proceedings. 4th Edition. Florence, Italy.

17	Upper Secondary Education	XII	Orientation and Specialization
16	(Gymnasia – Theoretical and Vocational/Technological - , and Vocational Schools)	XI	
15		X	
14	Lower secondary education	IX	Orientation
13	(Middle School)	VIII	Reinforcement and Orientation
12		VII	
11		VI	
10	Primary education	V	Development and Reinforcement
9		IV	
8		III	
7		II	
6		I	Basic Acquisitions/ Fundamentals of Basic Education
5	Preschool education	Pre-primary	

Table 1 - Key stages of the 2001 curriculum[16]

The characteristics of the 2011 curriculum framework which are related to learning English will be discussed. In this curriculum framework, the teaching of English in primary schools should start from the first grade. Also, this curriculum framework contains curriculum areas that were defined in the previous subchapter. Just like the 2001 curriculum, this 2011 curriculum also contains seven (7) curriculum areas. Even though some of these areas were renamed, it is noticed the list of subjects that belong to the curriculum area in both curriculum frameworks is 85% the same. In describing the subjects and their importance we can say that there is little information compared to the curriculum of 2001. While in that curriculum there were clear aims and objectives from studying English as the first foreign language, in the curriculum framework for pre-university education of 2011 such description is not present.

---

[16] MEST. (2001). The New Kosovo Curriculum Framework; white discussion paper, 35. Prishtina. UN Department of Education.

It is important for us to discuss a second part of this document that has to do with the implementation of the curriculum framework. "The implementation plan of the curriculum consists of two phases:

- the preparatory phase for the implementation of the KCF;
- the actual implementation phase;"[17]

The preparatory phase aims at ensuring that all of the necessary preconditions for the implementation of the KCF are fulfilled, including:

- "drafting and approval of the complete package of curriculum documents;
- development and approval of the complete package of sub-sector supporting policies for the implementation of the curriculum;
- preparation of textbooks and other school resources;
- development of new pedagogical documentation needed at the school level;
- preparation of pilot municipalities/schools for the first phase of implementation;
- implementation of the State curriculum in pilot schools."[18]

With the publication of this curriculum in 2011, the preparatory phase for the implementation of the curriculum framework had begun in pilot schools within the capital of the Republic of Kosovo. With the publication of this curriculum framework, the Kosovo Education Strategic Plan for the 2011-2016 period has been published. In this strategic plan there are twelve (12) clear objectives from twelve different areas that are seen with problems in the education system. In this strategic plan there is a separate subchapter on the English Language Program. It states "The program aims to address capacity building and teacher development in the sector of English Language Teaching and Learning. Its aims are to develop teachers' knowledge and skills, and to provide the training teachers needed to obtain English language teaching qualifications recognized in the public sector."[19] It should be recalled that at that time there was a great shortage of qualified English language teachers. In the process of his research work, Makolli has collected accurate

---

[17] (MEST). (2011). Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo, 58. Prishtina.

[18] IBID.
[19] Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. (2011). Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011-2016, 30. Prishtina.

data in relation to the number of qualified teachers. According to Makolli, "from 2892 English teachers throughout the Republic of Kosovo, only 1266 are qualified; these data in percentage would be 43.78%. On the other hand, the data show that unqualified teachers in the English language course are 1578 or about 55%, and the remaining 39 teachers or 1: 35% are those who have not declared their qualification."[20] Undoubtedly, among other factors, the lack of qualified English language teachers has an essential role in the successful non-implementation of subject curricula and the development of English language skills.

2. Literature Review

2.1. Introduction

This section of the Master thesis reviews the literature which has been used from researchers in this field of study. It also reviews the literature which has been published from the work of these researchers. The research work of other researchers forms a great base of materials in the process of formulating arguments in terms of providing analysis and elaboration to the paper. It is necessary to give definitions and discuss about curriculum studies, curriculums, curriculum analysis, curriculum assessment, and curriculum implementation. Numerous studies have been made in relation to the concept of curriculum studies. In his book published in 2010, Craig Kridel made an attempt to define curriculum studies. As Kridel states, curriculum studies is "a field dealing with an array of sources that provide the following: (a) perspective on questions about what curriculum is or ought to be; (b) alternative or complementary paradigms of inquiry that enable explorations of such questions; and (c) diverse possibilities for proposing and enacting responses to the questions in educational theory and settings of educational practice."[21] It is a must to clarify that curriculums have been around since 1800s. From the time of Marxist curriculum to 1960s was a period which is known as the first wave of curriculum reconceptualization. The second wave is the period from late 1960s when curriculum studies had its beginnings as a field of study. There are researchers that do consider this field of study as having been struggling with identity crisis. Reba Page, professor of Education, states that

---

[20] Kasumi, H. (2016). The implementation of Kosovo Curricula regarding the English Language Teaching. Retrieved May 17, from www.researchgate.net/publication/313478289

[21] Kridel, C. (2010). Encyclopedia of Curriculum Studies. University of South Carolina.

"curriculum studies seem to have always had something of an identity problem. In its early years, the identity problem was simply that not much attention was given to the field's identity."[22] The problem of identity in the field of curriculum studies has been influenced by various internal and external factors. Among the insiders is the factor of curricularists. At the beginnings of the curriculum studies, they considered that their role is limited only to the developing of school curriculum, teaching objectives and content of teaching subjects. External factors may include social changes, different trends, the influence of political philosophies, the influence of non-governmental organizations and civil society. But this has changed since the beginnings of the curriculum studies back at early 1970s. William Pinar, a well-known curriculum theorist, states that by 1978 there will have been six conferences and five books. According to him, there is a socio-intellectual phenomenon which helped to reconceptualize the field of curriculum studies. By the rate how the reconceptualization process continues, Pinar states that "the field of curriculum studies will be profoundly different in twenty years' time."[23] Reconceptualization is considered as a movement which had its aim at including different viewpoints on how to analyze and study the curriculum. William Pinar defines "reconceptualization is a reaction to what the field has been and what it is seen to be at the present time."[24] Reconceptualists, according to M. Frances Klein, "are a diverse group of scholars in curriculum development who want to conceptualize approaches to curricula in fundamentally different ways."[25] The reconceptualization movement was followed by what is called post-reconceptualization. This has supported the second wave of reconceptualization and has helped on reinforcing curriculum studies as an interdisciplinary field of study. Many researchers do recognize this period as post-reconceptualization but Pinar does refer to it as "internationalization."[26] From many research papers and publications from the beginning in the 1970s until today, changes are noticed in the field of curriculum study. These changes can be categorized into three stages. The first phase is

---

[22] Page, R. (2009). Foreword. In E. C. Short & L. J. Waks (Eds.). Leaders in Curriculum Studies: Intellectual Self-Portraits.

[23] Pinar, W. (1978): The Reconceptualization of Curriculum Studies. Journal of Curriculum Studies.

[24] Pinar, W. (1979). What is the Reconceptualization?. Journal of Curriculum Theorizing.

[25] Klein, M. F. (2010). Pivotal Events and People in My Career. In E. Malewski (Ed.). Curriculum Studies Handbook: The Next Moment. New York: Routledge.

[26] Pinar, W. F. (2008). Curriculum Theory since 1950, Crisis, Reconceptualization, Internationalization. In M. Connelly, H. Fang & J. Phillion, J. (Eds.). The Sage Handbook of Curriculum and Instruction. Los Angeles: Sage.

the development of curriculum as a tool for creating school programs, course content and textbooks. The second stage is that of reconceptualization. During this phase, the field of curriculum studies underwent changes in relation to the approach that researchers had to the importance of the curriculum. Researchers from various fields of study were involved in the discussion of the importance of the curriculum and their views as reconceptualists helped to create a multidisciplinary field of study. The third stage, post-reconceptualization or internationalization, helped to create common local and national concepts and policies for the development of the educational system. This was done in order to develop more comprehensive policies and curriculums. Michael Young, in comparing the field of curriculum studies in the 1970s and 2010s, has come to a conclusion that "the broad field of curriculum studies is quite different (…) one difference is its growing internationalism".[27] Pinar, discussing the comparison of the field of curriculum studies, states "unlike the early 1970s, the field is not moribund. It is intellectually very lively, complex, variegated. The field is threatened less by its internal complexity than by external political conditions."[28]

In the field of curriculum studies, undoubtedly the most used term is the curriculum itself. Teachers and professors are concerned about which teaching methods and strategies they should apply. Students are also concerned about the content of the lessons they attend. At this point, the curriculum is what clarifies, directs, guides teachers in what to teach and learners in what to learn. But trying to define the curriculum is by no means easy. This is due to the fact that there is a considerable number of definitions on the curriculum. This number of definitions exists due to the numerous perceptions on the curriculum. These perceptions are from different parties, from teachers, students, researchers, curricularists. Having perceptions from different points of view results in a lack of a uniformist definition. Hence, it is a must to clarify the concept of the term curriculum before proceeding with the definition and discussion of the concepts of curriculum analysis and curriculum assessment. According to Merriam Webster dictionary, "curriculum is from New Latin, in which language it means "a course of study." It shares its

---

[27] Young, M. (2010). Curriculum Theory and the Problem of Knowledge: a Personal Journey and an Unfinished Project. In E. Malewski (Ed.). Curriculum Studies Handbook: The Next Moment. New York: Routledge.
[28] Pinar, W. F. (2007). Intellectual Advancement through Disciplinarily; Verticality and Horizontality in Curriculum Studies. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

ultimate root in classical Latin, where it meant "running" or "course" with words such as corridor, courier, and currency, all of which come from Latin currere 'to run.'"[29] As noted by Daniel Tanner and Laurel Tanner, the problem of defining a curriculum is not only that it lacks consensus, but that the definition has undergone notable changes in the twentieth century. According to Aguokogbuo, "the problem is aggravated by the ignorance of many teachers who equate a curriculum to mean the same thing as scheme of work or syllabus."[30] This happened during the 19th century at a time when the curriculum for a teacher meant nothing more than a set of subjects. In this way all external factors influencing the development of the curriculum were ignored. As such, the definition of the origin of the word curriculum and the original Latin use, which includes all life activities, was also ignored. Throughout the review of the literature in this study, we encounter different some authors that have defined curriculum as a tool to achieve learning objectives. Some authors define it as a plan in relation to what the school plans to do and others define curriculum as the experience that students have under the guidance of the teacher. The problem at this point is that the definitions by these authors do not specify exactly what objectives should be achieved, do not determine the content of the lessons that will result in the learning experience, do not determine the assessment methods or strategies. According to Aguokogbuo, "the curriculum should contain four basic elements:

- Curricular objectives
- Selection of content and learning experiences
- Organization of learning experiences
- Evaluation"[31]

Therefore, based on this, the definition of the curriculum by Tanner and Tanner is more comprehensive. They state, curriculum is "planned and guided learning experiences and intended learning outcomes, formulated through the systematic reconstruction of knowledge and experience, under the auspices of the school for the learners' continuous and willful growth in

---

[29] Merriam-Webster. (n.d.). Curriculum. In Merriam-Webster.com dictionary. Retrieved May 9, from https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/curriculum
[30] Aguokogbuo, Cyril N. (2000). Concept and Scope of Curriculum studies. Nigeria: Mike Social Press.
[31] IBID.

personal-social competence".[32] However, the purpose of the topic is to focus on the curriculum as a written document derived from the need to include objectives, content and methods throughout the development and implementation phases of the curriculum. From this point of view, Barrow and Milburn's definition of the curriculum fits best with the aim of this master's thesis. According to them, curriculum "has become associated with the official written programs of study published by ministries or departments of education, local authorities or boards of education, and commercial firms or teams of educational specialists working on specially funded projects."[33]

After concluding the discussion on the definition of the term curriculum, the focus on literature review turns to another issue raised in this master's thesis. This issue is curriculum analysis. Just as it is difficult to define the term curriculum, the same applies to the term curriculum analysis. For the same reason because there are different viewpoints and different definitions from people in different fields which are related to the field of curriculum studies. From the literature review, curriculum analysis can be defined from two perspectives. The first view is that of defining curriculum analysis as Eraut et al (1975) refer to as "curricular criticism."[34] A constellation of authors does use this term to describe curriculum analysis as not specifically targeting decision-making but as having the main purpose to discover meanings and knowledge extension about the curriculum. But even without a decision-making goal, there would still be an important point in the "curricular criticism" to discuss the expected results of the curriculum. The second perspective comes from a group of authors, who, refer to curriculum analysis as a component of curriculum evaluation. Among the first to refer to curriculum analysis as such was Scriven, who states that "curriculum analysis as a component of curriculum evaluation should "Firstly, it should include an evaluation of goals: goal analysis. Then, secondly, since 'the verbally espoused goal of a curriculum-maker are often not the implicit goals of a curriculum' the evaluator should also emphasize, consistency analysis in which divergencies between (a)

---

[32] Yeung, S., Lam, J., Leung, A., & Lo, Y. (2012). Curriculum Change and Innovation. Aberdeen, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press. Retrieved May 10, from www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt1xwfn8

[33] Su, S. (2012). The Various Concepts of Curriculum and the Factors Involved in Curricula-making (Vol. 3). Journal of Language Teaching and Research. doi:10.4304/jltr.3.1.153-158

[34] Eraut, M., Et al. (1975). The Analysis of Curriculum Materials. University of Sussex Education Area Occasional Paper 2.

espoused (b) implicit and (c) tested-for goals are disclosed. Thirdly, it should include content analysis using criteria such as accuracy, coverage, significance and modernity; and finally, there is a hint that it might be judged for elegance, a point we shall return to later."[35] Among contemporary authors, Jansen and Reddy define curriculum analysis by comparing it to curriculum development. They state, "Whereas curriculum development involves building the curriculum in order to present a coherent plan, curriculum analysis involves unpacking the curriculum in order to understand the plan. Curriculum analysis unpacks a curriculum into its component parts (e.g. learning, teaching, knowledge, society, resources); evaluates how the parts fit together, say in terms of focus and coherence; checks underlying beliefs and assumptions; and requires justification for curriculum choices and assumptions."[36]

On the other hand, curriculum assessment as a term in the field of curriculum studies is defined by Cooper, who states "Curriculum assessment is the collection and provision of evidence on the basis of which decisions can be taken about the feasibility, effectiveness and educational value of curricula."[37] Wolf, Hill and Evers, contemporary authors, define curriculum assessment as "a process of gathering and analyzing information from multiple sources in order to improve student learning in sustainable ways...Curriculum assessment can serve several major purposes:

•To identify aspects of a curriculum that are working and those that need to change

• To assess the effectiveness of changes that have already been made

• To demonstrate the effectiveness of the current programme

• To meet regular programme review requirements

• To satisfy professional accreditations"[38]

---

[35] Tyler, R. W., Gagné, R. M., & Scriven, M. (1967). Perspectives of curriculum evaluation. Chicago: Rand McNally.
[36]Jansen, D. J. Reddy, V. (n.d.). Curriculum Analysis. A reference manual. Retrieved May 11, from http://www.pitt.edu/~ginie/ieq/pdf/curranal.pdf
[37] Eraut, M., Et al. (1975). The Analysis of Curriculum Materials. University of Sussex Education Area Occasional Paper 2.
[38]Wolf, P. Hill, A. Evers, F. (2006). Handbook for Curriculum Assessment. Retrieved May 11, from https://ctlt.ubc.ca/files/2010/08/HbonCurriculumAssmt.pdf

After discussing the definitions of some key terms related to the field of curriculum studies, an elaboration is needed regarding the availability of critical curriculum materials in Kosovo. A review of such literature would be necessary in reflecting the state of the field in which this master's thesis is focused. But, from the research done, from the personal communication with university professors, it is a fact that there is a very small number of published research work related to the development of English language skills in Kosovo or to the discussion of Kosovo curriculum content about ELT. Such a situation makes it difficult to compare attitudes and contrast arguments with other researchers. In this situation, the main and only sources to refer to is the curricular material as an official set of documents published by state institutions. A single advantage is the ability to access in more detail any information given in this documentation. In cases where there are multiple sources, this is impossible due to the selectivity of the information. But such a situation can lead to quoting sources of a lower quality. This fact can be considered as a limitation of the research.

At this point in this master's thesis, the focus of this Master thesis moves to reviewing the content of the Kosovo Curriculum Framework and Core Curriculums which are being implemented in Kosovo.

2.2. The Revised Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo

Five years after the publication of the Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education, the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology decided to revise the curriculum framework. This decision was taken after the implementation of the 2011 curriculum framework in "219 pilot schools during three (3) school years. In the school year 2013/14, the piloting of the curriculum framework started in 10 schools, in the school year 2014/2015 in 114 different schools, in 2015/2016 in 95 different schools."[39] The revision of the curriculum framework was necessary as a means to improve and advance students' achievements in mastering key competencies and realizing their potential. The full document of the revised curriculum

---

[39] MEST. (2014,2015,2016). Administrative Instruction (AI) 30/2013, AI 23/2014, AI 13/2015. Retrieved May 23, from https://masht.rks-gov.net/en/udhezimet-administrative

framework was published in August 2016. During the five (5) year period since the publication of the 2011 curriculum framework, the education system underwent changes. Over 10 administrative instructions were approved for pre-university education. The approved administrative instructions are related to different issues: for implementing the curriculum framework in pilot schools, for organizing the framework that gives schools the autonomy to design elective curricula and to implement it, for teacher licensing, for teacher training related to the implementation of the new curriculum, for quality assurance, for the employment contracts of teachers in pre-university education, for pre-university school documentation. According to Maliqi and Kamberi, "Over 20,500 teachers have been licensed throughout Kosovo. Over 1800 teachers have been trained in various programs."[40] All teachers in the Republic of Kosovo have been trained on how to implement the Revised Curriculum Framework. During this period, progress was also achieved on the process of decentralization of education system. The Law on Pre-University Education has now been harmonized with the Law on Education in Municipalities. Currently, according to KEEN, "36 municipalities of the Republic of Kosovo have an Educational Development Plan, a four (4) year strategic plan."[41] In the same paper, it is stated that "Decentralization aims to increase efficiency in management and governance, as it enables a faster problem identification and more appropriate reactions to addressing challenges. Decentralization also helps increase accountability."[42] The decentralization in the education sector granted municipalities full authority with regards to the provision of public pre-school, primary, and secondary education, while the role of central Government remained restricted to steering the education policy, standard setting, curriculum development, and school inspection. Hence, the process of decentralization can be considered as an important step in reforming the education system in Kosovo. With the increase of the capacities for the management and governance of education in the ministry, the process of increasing such capacities has started at the level of municipalities and schools. Another issue for which administrative instructions were

---

[40] Maliqi, M., Kamberi, F. (2016). Reformat e Arsimit në nivelin fillor dhe të mesëm të ulët [Education reforms at primary and lower secondary level]. Retrieved May 23, from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/316515872
[41] Kosovo Education and Employment Network (KEEN). Education Strategic Plans. Retrieved May 23, from https://www.keen-ks.net/en/publications/education-strategic-plans/
[42] KEEN. (2018). Management of Pre-University Education in Kosovo, 37. Retrieved May 23, from https://keen-ks.net/site/assets/files/1456/raporti_per_menaxhimin_e_arsimit_parauniversitar_-_eng-1.pdf

developed and approved is the issue of licensing and training teachers. According to a publication of the European Union Mission in Kosovo, "The majority of the 25,000 teachers in the system need significant upgrading of their knowledge and skills over the next few years, especially in relation to the demands of the new curriculum."[43] The issue of reviewing textbooks has also been raised by European Union missions. Many of the books used in Kosovo were published before the 1990s, and even the 80's.

In the process of curriculum assessment and curriculum analysis for the revised curriculum framework, the main goals and learning competences of this curriculum that are related to the developing of English language skills will be analyzed and assessed. The structure, function and general aims of this curriculum framework will be discussed. The Revised Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in Kosovo consists of two main components: [44]

- The conceptual part, which is the Revised Curriculum Framework, and,
- The implementing part, consisting of supporting documents, which enable the implementation of the Kosovo Curriculum at the level of the education system by clearly defining the expectation from students, teachers and schools.

There is a separate chapter related to the supporting documents of the curriculum framework which enables its implementation. These curricular documents related to primary and lower secondary education are:

- "Core Curriculum for Primary Education,
- Core Curriculum for Lower Secondary Education;"[45]

Also, as part of the supportive documents are the subject curricula from the first grade to the twelfth grade. From reviewing this curriculum framework, it can be said that in functional terms, this curriculum framework has the role of the regulator of the pre-university education system.

---

[43] European Commission Liaison Office to Kosovo. (n.d). EU assistance to Kosovo, 5. Prishtina. Retrieved May 24, from
http://eeas.europa.eu/archives/delegations/kosovo/documents/press_corner/education_for_the_future_en.pdf
[44] MEST. (2016). The Revised Curriculum Framework, 11. Prishtina.
[45] MEST. (2016). The Revised Curriculum Framework, 50. Prishtina.

With its role, the curriculum framework defines the goals of pre-university education, key competencies, profiles of education, curriculum areas, the hierarchy of curriculum documents, as well as the curriculum implementation plan. Pre-university education in general aims to raise students' awareness, raise the level of knowledge in various fields of study, prepare and orient students for further education. Considering that pre-university education includes secondary education, it is natural that the aim is also to prepare students for the labor market and for their career in general. As main aims of the Kosovo Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education, curriculum developers have outlined the following:

- "the development of personal and national identity, statehood and cultural belonging;
- the promotion of general cultural and civic values;
- the development of responsibility for themselves, for others, for society and for the environment;
- preparation for life and work in the context of social and cultural changes; development of entrepreneurship and use of technological skills;
- preparation for lifelong learning;"[46]

As for the process of teaching and learning English language and developing English language skills, there is not a single difference between the 2011 Curriculum Framework and the 2016 Revised Curriculum Framework. Even in the revised version, it is envisaged that English language teaching will start from the first grade. Also, it is envisaged that English will be the first foreign language, to be part of the learning competence of communication and expression, to be part of the curriculum area of language and communication. In describing the key stages of learning, we encounter the same as in the previous curriculum:

- "In describing this stage that includes the first (1) and second (2) grade, we come across a specific point that states that the focus is on "gaining initial exposure to learning the English language;"

---

[46] MEST. (2016). The Revised Curriculum Framework, 12. Prishtina.

- In the description of stage 2, which includes grades three (3), four (4), and five (5), we encounter a specific point that states that at this stage students are exposed to challenges such as "correct use of their mother-tongue and basic English in oral and written communication; ".

- In the description of stage 3, which includes grades six (6), seven (7), we encounter a specific point that states that at this stage students are exposed to challenges such as "expanding the possibilities for verbal and written communication in their mother-tongue, in English and in their second foreign language or one of the official languages;"[47]

While reviewing the curriculum frameworks and comparing them, in the 2011 Kosovo Curriculum Framework the second chapter is the implementation part of the curriculum. In that chapter, we encounter the plan for starting the implementation in pilot schools and also information is given about the work that is expected in the future. Whereas, in the revised curriculum framework of 2016, in the second chapter there is detailed information about the process of gradual implementation of the curriculum. Comparing the first chapter to both curricula we do not encounter any changes. By comparing the part of main aims, structure and function, learning competencies, curriculum areas, key stages of learning, assessment and types of assessment, the only changes encountered are a game of synonyms.

2.3. Core Curriculum

The design of the curriculum intends to create and prepare the content and the learning competencies in accordance with the objectives of the curriculum framework. Curriculum design is a process closely linked to the goals and expected outcomes of the curriculum framework. During the development of the field of curriculum studies, different curriculum designs have been used. Of course, these have been developed at different times during different periods in which the field of curriculum studies and the field of education as a whole went through. In his book Concept and Scope of Curriculum Studies, Aguokogbuo (2000) gives four (4) types of curriculum design used in different periods: [48]

---

[47] MEST. (2016). The Revised Curriculum Framework, 31,32. Prishtina.
[48] Aguokogbuo, Cyril N. (2000). Concept and Scope of Curriculum studies, 25. Nigeria: Mike Social Press.

- The subject curriculum design. It is subject-centered.
- The activity/experience curriculum design is learner centered.
- The core curriculum design is problem-centered.
- The broad fields curriculum is a modification of subject curriculum design.

Below will be given a table discussing the comparison of the main points of these types of curriculum design.

Type of curriculum design	Specifications
Subject Curriculum	This curriculum design is subject centered. This type of curriculum design aims to arrange school subjects that are studied separately or sometimes studied as areas of subjects that are in relation to each other. These school subjects can also be classified into subdivisions. For example, English Language can be divided into grammar, literature, phonetics, phonology. With this type of curriculum design, the goal is to master the basics of the subject in accordance to the expected learning outcomes. This type of curriculum is suitable for teachers who are classified and trained in specific subject areas. The examination, which is the main element for the admission and selection of candidates in schools, colleges and universities, appears in the form of testing candidates on subject areas.
Activity Curriculum	This type of curriculum is learner-centered. This type of curriculum design aims to give consideration to learners' interests and needs.

	Activity curriculum is designed with flexible ideas and tendency that the teacher must be adaptive to the needs of students.
	Learning process becomes an active process.
	The role of teacher is that of an instructor and supervisor.
	Students do have the right to choose the tasks. Such right gives students satisfaction in the process of learning.
Core Curriculum	Core curriculum design is problem-centered.
	This type of curriculum design is used to describe the subjects that are to be followed by all students.
	The totality of expected learning outcomes or competencies that each student involved in the learning process should possess.
	Learning is based on competencies.
	The content chosen in this type of curriculum will be required to be learnt by all students regardless their learning characteristics.
	Core curriculum integrates all subjects that are in interest of students.
	Core curriculum involves all obligatory subjects required to be learnt by all students.
	Involves learning competencies related to students' interests.
Broadfields Curriculum	The broadfields curriculum design is based on subject integration.
	This curriculum design does combine related subjects into a field of study.
	Aims at integrating learning content related to each other.
	Subjects are no longer divided or subdivided.

Table 2 - Types of curriculum design

The only type of curriculum encountered in the education system in Kosovo is that of core curriculum design which is present in all three curriculum frameworks developed in Kosovo. Given this fact, before moving on to the review of core curriculums for primary and lower secondary education, a discussion over the core curriculum design will occur. During different periods the core curriculum design was known in different terms. As Kridel (2010) stated in the book Encyclopedia of Curriculum studies, "core curriculum was known as; stem course, unified studies, integrated studies, common learnings, cultural epoch program, broad fields core, and general education."[49] Different authors, whose field of study is related to curriculum design, give different definitions about the core curriculum. Authors Goodlad and Su, state that the core curriculum is "a specification of those fields deemed essential for all students, most often mathematics, science, English and social studies."[50] This definition implies what is mentioned in the table above where it is stated that the core curriculum includes those subjects that are of interest to students during the strengthening of learning competencies. According to Vitikka et al, "the national core curriculum contains the objectives and core contents of teaching for all school subjects, and also describes the mission, values, and structure of education. It describes the conception of learning and goals for developing the learning environment, school culture and working methods."[51] This definition of the core curriculum fits best with the content of the Kosovo core curriculum for primary and lower secondary education. From different types of curriculum design, the developers of the Kosovo curriculum have chosen to develop a core curriculum considering it as the most effective.

2.3.1. Core Curriculum for Pre-Primary and Primary Education in Kosovo

With the publication of the revised version of the Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in August 2016, the Core Curriculums for primary and lower secondary education were also published. The core curriculum for primary education also includes the pre-primary class. The importance of the core curriculum for primary education will be discussed

---

[49] Kridel, C. (2010). Encyclopedia of Curriculum Studies, 143. University of South Carolina.
[50] Pinar, W. Reynolds, W. Slattery, P. Taubman, P. (1995). Understanding Curriculum: an introduction to the study of historical and contemporary curriculum discourses, 697. New York.
[51] Vitikka, E. Krokfors, L. Hurmerinta, E. (2012). The Finnish National Core Curriculum: Structure and Development. Retrieved June 3, from https://curriculumredesign.org/wp-content/uploads/The-Finnish-National-Core-Curriculum_Vitikka-et-al.-2011.pdf

altogether with the features of the core curriculum for primary education and the features of the field of languages and communication. In particular, the teaching of English Language and the effectiveness of the core curriculum in the development of English language skills will be discussed. The core curriculum is designed to serve to the entire chain involved in schools in Kosovo, for teachers, students, parents, school principals, and for the community as whole. The core curriculum document is structured around the six (6) main learning competencies and seven (7) curriculum areas included in the curriculum framework for pre-university education. The importance of the core curriculum lies in the fact that as a document, the core curriculum defines the expected outcomes for learning competencies and expected outcomes for curriculum areas. Such expected outcomes should be expressed in knowledge, skills, attitudes and values that must be developed and achieved by students. The core curriculum document is structured in two (2) main stages. Curriculum stage one (1) that includes pre-primary education, ISCED 0 and primary education ISCED 1 for first grade (1) and second (2). Curriculum stage two (2) includes third (3), fourth (4) and fifth (5) grades in primary education or ISCED 1. Curriculum stages are a reference point in the process of determining the main learning competencies which are to be mastered by students by the end of the curriculum stage. From these learning competencies we will discuss the communication and expression competencies which are interrelated to the development of English language skills. In the Core Curriculum published by MEST, is states "English language teaching in the stage one (1) of the core curriculum is done with one (1) lesson hour per week, while in the stage two (2) of the core curriculum it is done with two (2) lesson hours per week."[52] The description of the curriculum stages mentioned above will be analyzed. The points of these stages that are related to the development of English language skills are given below.

Expected outcomes for the curriculum stage one (1)
At this level, students are exposed to systematic learning approaches.
Elementary communication in English.
Names objects, actions or phenomena in the foreign language (English) and translates into the native language the words he/she hears from the foreign language, given in the task.

---

[52] MEST. (2016). Core Curriculum for Pre-Primary and Primary Education in Kosovo, 95. Prishtina

Table 3 - Expected outcomes for the curriculum stage one[53]

From the analysis of these points it is noticed that the expected outcomes are in accordance with the age of the students involved in this stage of the curriculum. Hence, for children aged five (5) to eight (8) years old, it is more than enough to achieve such results as naming of objects, naming of actions, translating them in mother tongue and achieving elementary communication in the first foreign language in Kosovo. It is intended that students involved in pre-primary and primary education in first (1) and second (2) grades understand the messages addressed to them and express themselves adequately through language, symbols, signs.

On the other hand, the curriculum stage two (2) includes learning competencies, expected outcomes, objectives, lesson plans, assessment methods for the third (3), fourth (4) and fifth (5) grades. The communication and expression competencies of this stage which are interrelated to the development of English language skills will be analyzed. The points of this stage which are related to the development of English language skills are given in the table below.

Expected outcomes for the curriculum stage two (2)
Proper use of mother tongue and English in verbal and written communication.
Proper use of symbols.
Expanding new areas of knowledge and deepening of information.
Expresses, in verbal and written form, simple sentences in foreign languages and translates into native languages other simple sentences that he hears from auditory, audiovisual means or from the teacher which are given as a task in foreign languages.

Table 4 - Expected outcomes for curriculum stage two[54]

From the analysis of these points it is noticed that the expected outcomes are not fully in accordance with the age of the students involved in this stage of the curriculum. For children aged eight (8) to ten (10) years old, it would be necessary to expand the range of knowledge in English and not be limited to similar things as in the curriculum stage one (1). It is noted that the expected outcome of translating from English language into the mother language has been

---

[53] MEST. (2016). Core Curriculum for Pre-Primary and Primary Education in Kosovo, 21. Prishtina.
[54] MEST. (2016). Core Curriculum for Pre-Primary and Primary Education in Kosovo, 24. Prishtina.

repeated. Also, in the process of acquiring English language, the teaching of simple sentences in primary education should not be divided. This is due to the fact that students after the fifth grade (5) will be taught by other teachers of the lower secondary education, who are not well informed about the progress of the elaborated topics. Lack of good coordination in most cases creates the problem of repeating the same things at different stages of primary and lower secondary education.

In general, according to the Core Curriculum for Primary Education in Kosovo, the teaching and learning process is based on competencies and on the fulfillment of the expected outcomes deriving from the learning competencies and sub competencies. Since the expected outcomes of these learning competencies related to the development of English language skills were given above, the focus will shift to the reviewing the curriculum areas of the core curriculum. As mentioned in the previous chapters where the Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education was discussed, there are seven (7) curriculum areas. Since this master's thesis is focused on the effectiveness of the curriculum in English language development, only the curriculum area of languages and communication that includes English language and is related to the learning competencies of communication and expression will be discussed. According to the developers of the core curriculum, "curriculum areas are the basis for organizing the teaching and educational process in the school, for each educational stage and the respective stage of the curriculum."[55] In the document of the core curriculum it is noticed that for each curriculum area the learning outcomes are determined. The core curriculum document for the curriculum area of languages and communication envisages the development of basic communication skills, enrichment of vocabulary, development of language skills. This curriculum area includes, in addition to the mother tongue, the first foreign language, which is English language. The purpose of this curriculum area is "to develop basic language and communication skills in order to provide and receive information, reading and comprehension, functional writing and the possibility of written and oral response in different situations."[56] The curriculum area of language and communication envisages the outcomes that are expected to

---

[55] MEST. (2016). Core Curriculum for Pre-Primary and Primary Education in Kosovo, 28. Prishtina.
[56] MEST. (2016). Core Curriculum for Pre-Primary and Primary Education in Kosovo, 30. Prishtina.

develop in students in the curriculum stage one and two, including grades from pre-primary to fifth (5). According to the core curriculum document, these skills that are expected to be developed are classified as: listening and speaking, reading and writing skills.

2.3.2. Core Curriculum for Lower Secondary Education in Kosovo

The core curriculum for lower secondary education was published at the same time as the core curriculum for pre-primary and primary education and the revised version of the curriculum framework for pre-university education. The core curriculum document for lower secondary education is a document derived from the curriculum framework. The core curriculum document defines learning outcomes by competencies, curriculum stages, learning outcomes by curriculum areas. The focus will be on reviewing the goals and expected outcomes based on the prescription of competencies and curriculum areas related to English language teaching and the development of English language skills. The core curriculum for lower secondary education is structured around six (6) main learning competencies and seven (7) curriculum areas.[57] The purpose of the core curriculum document for lower secondary education is that "at this formal level of pre-university education students develop knowledge, skills, attitudes and values in line with the requirements / needs of a democratic society."[58] The core curriculum for lower secondary education (ISCED 2) is structured in two (2) main stages, curriculum stage three (3) and four (4). The first two, curriculum stage one (1) and two (2) were included in the core curriculum for pre-primary and primary education. Curriculum stage three (3) includes sixth (6) and seventh (7) grade. Curriculum stage four (4) includes eighth (8) and ninth (9) grades of lower secondary education or ISCED 2. Such curriculum stages are a reference point in the process of determining the main learning competencies which are to be mastered by students by the end of the curriculum stage. From these learning competencies, the communication and expression competencies are interrelated to the development of English language skills. The main goal of curriculum stage three (3) and four (4) is "to prepare students for further education and career orientation, always being supported by mentors / professional counselors."[59] Learning process

---

[57] MEST. (2016). Core Curriculum for Lower Secondary Education in Kosovo, 15. Prishtina.
[58] MEST. (2016). Core Curriculum for Lower Secondary Education in Kosovo, 14. Prishtina.
[59] MEST. (2016). Core Curriculum for Lower Secondary Education in Kosovo, 17. Prishtina.

as seen through this core curriculum is based on integrated competencies related to curriculum areas. Precisely, the purpose of curriculum stage three (3) is further development and orientation while the purpose of curriculum stage four (4) is reinforcement and orientation. From these two stages of the core curriculum for lower secondary education, a table of specific points related to the teaching of English and the development of English language skills will be given below.

Expected outcomes for the curriculum stage three (3)
Expanding verbal and written communication skills in the mother tongue and in English.
Expresses the opinion or request correctly, may that be orally or written in non-native or foreign language, for a certain supposed situation, in case of need (for service, help, information, orientation, etc.), in case of interacting in group or in class.
Explains clearly and accurately, orally or in writing, the meaning of new terms (words, concepts), using appropriate and accurate language and vocabulary.

Table 5 - Expected outcomes for curriculum stage three (3)[60]

Considering that the students involved in this stage of the curriculum are of the sixth (6) and seventh (7) grades, eleven (11) and twelve (12) years of age, it can be said that the expected outcomes are in harmony with skills of students of this age. Of course, these points included in the core curriculum do not constitute the whole range of topics covered or skills that have been learned during this stage of the curriculum but are the essential points that are expected to be achieved with the completion of the curriculum stage three (3).

On the other hand, curriculum stage four (4) includes eighth (8) and ninth (9) grades of lower secondary education or ISCED 2. English language teaching in the stage four (4) of the core curriculum is done with two (2) lesson hours per week. It was mentioned earlier that the main purposes of this stage are the reinforcement of knowledge, orientation of students for further education and guiding students to consider different schooling and career opportunities. This curriculum stage is also based on six (6) learning competencies and is related to the seven (7) curriculum areas. From this stage of the core curriculum for lower secondary education, a table

---

[60] MEST. (2016). Core Curriculum for Lower Secondary Education in Kosovo, 20-21. Prishtina.

of specific points related to the teaching of English and the development of English language skills will be given below.

Expected outcomes for the curriculum stage four (4)
Discusses a specific topic in the native language, English language or second foreign language in different subjects, respecting the rules of effective participation in the exchange of information and ideas.
Analyzes the content and meaning of new notions (concepts), using adequate, appropriate and accurate vocabulary.
Writes a text up to five hundred words, an oral narrative or a text read in advance which is based on their own imagination.
Initiate social conversations with peers and adults on topics of learning / social interest, asking questions about the topic and answering and highlighting key information.

Table 6 - Expected outcomes for the curriculum stage four (4)[61]

Since the expected outcomes of these learning competencies related to the development of English language skills were given above, the focus will shift to reviewing the curriculum areas of the core curriculum. Since this master's thesis is focused on the effectiveness of the curriculum in English language development, only the curriculum area of languages and communication that includes English language and is related to the learning competencies of communication and expression will be discussed. Core curriculum for lower secondary education (grades 6-9) for the curriculum area of languages and communication aims at: "enabling students to develop communication skills such as functional and effective use of language, deepening of reading-writing skills, enriching vocabulary, developing language skills, comprehension through listening, speaking in order to give and receive information, reading-comprehension, recognizing and expanding the forms of the language system (phonetics, morphology, syntax)the development of basic communication skills, enrichment of vocabulary, development of language skills."[62] From

---

[61] MEST. (2016). Core Curriculum for Lower Secondary Education in Kosovo, 24. Prishtina.
[62] MEST. (2016). Core Curriculum for Lower Secondary Education in Kosovo, 24. Prishtina.

the analysis of these points, it can be said that with the skills acquired at this stage of the curriculum, students have a solid foundation of the main skills of English language.

2.4. English Language Teaching in Kosovo during Coronavirus (COVID-19)

Coronavirus pandemic or COVID-19, from the first days of its appearance has affected the whole world, our entire lives and our well-being as human beings. The spread of the virus to a large extent in a short time has affected every sector of life, leading to the closure of the majority. In every country in the world, Coronavirus pandemic has led to almost total isolation. In almost every country in the world, the only active institutions have been government institutions and hospitals. Undoubtedly, one of the most important sectors affected by the pandemic is the education system. Most governments around the world have "temporarily closed educational institutions in an attempt to contain the spread of the COVID-19 pandemic."[63] According to data from UNESCO, there are over "one (1) billion students affected by COVID-19."[64] Based on these statistics, over 90% of students around the world are affected by the pandemic. In most countries, schools have been closed at the national level, but there are also countries where schools have been closed locally. The closure of schools has affected the social life of students and their learning, but indirectly has also affected the productivity of parents who at this time of pandemic have the full responsibility of following the process of their children's education. Despite the closure of schools as the environments of learning, the Ministries of Education of each country, experts of education, international organizations and, of course, teachers have been engaged in continuing the teaching process. There have been many innovative ideas for continuing the teaching process. In each state there have been such ideas, always in harmony with the possibilities that exist based on the current state of the education system. But the common denominator of all these ideas was distance learning. Distance learning during the Coronavirus pandemic became the mainstay of learning. At this point, it is necessary to discuss what distance learning really is. Distance learning is a field of education that focuses on teaching methods and technology with the aim of delivering teaching, often on an individual basis, to

---

[63]UNESCO. (2020). COVID-19 Educational Disruption and Response. Retrieved June 9, from https://en.unesco.org/covid19/educationresponse
[64]IBID.

students who are not physically present in a traditional educational setting such as a classroom. Buselic (2010) has described it as "a process to create and provide access to learning when the source of information and the learners are separated by time and distance, or both".[65] During the situation with COVID-19, the term "online learning" has been mentioned a lot. It should be made clear that these two terms are not synonymous with each other and as two learning methods they have their differences. Below is given a table discussing their differences.

Online Learning	Distance Learning
With online learning (sometimes called eLearning), students can be together in the classroom with an instructor while working through their digital lessons and assessments. Online learning is designed to be used in combination with a variety of other in-person teaching methods. Online learning will involve in-person interaction between you and your students on a regular basis. This is because online learning is used as a blended learning technique along with other teaching strategies.	Distance learning is a method for delivering instruction solely online, not as a variation in your teaching style Distance learning includes no in-person interaction between teachers and students. However, you'll likely rely on digital forms of communication such as messaging apps, video calls, discussion boards, and your school's learning management system (LMS). When using distance learning, students work online at home while the teacher assigns work and checks in digitally.

Table 7 - Online Learning and Distance Learning[66]

Once clarification was given on what distance learning is and the differences with online learning, the focus shifts to discussing the distance learning process. Since this master's thesis is focused on education in Kosovo, the process of distance learning in Kosovo during this period of Coronavirus pandemic will be discussed. Kosovo, like other countries in the world, has faced the closure of schools as a result of the spread of COVID-19. As a result of not having an official

[65]Bušelić, M. (2012). Distance Learning – concepts and contributions. Retrieved June 11, from https://hrcak.srce.hr/file/124393
[66]Applied education system. (2020). What's the Difference Between Online Learning and Distance Learning?. Retrieved June 11, from https://www.aeseducation.com/blog/online-learning-vs-distance-learning

platform for online learning or distance learning, teaching in Kosovo during COVID-19 was organized in different methods. The Ministry of Education, in the first days of the spread of pandemic, took actions in order to create an effective distance learning method. Hence, two (2) weeks after the appearance of COVID-19 in Kosovo, the Ministry came out with the announcement that the "teaching will continue through the Radio Television of Kosovo for primary and lower secondary education."[67] Whereas, in undergraduate and postgraduate education, teaching went on through various platforms such as Google Meet, Google Classroom, Zoom. It was precisely in pre-university education that the biggest problems were encountered. The non-digitalization of primary and secondary schools, the lack of training to use different platforms, the inability to access the Internet in many families in Kosovo, are some of the influential factors that distance learning took place through email, phone calls, Viber and WhatsApp applications, and the social network Facebook. Teachers' autonomy to use these alternative methods came as educational institutions were aware of the current state of school digitalization and the lack of interaction between teachers and students if an attempt was made to create a platform without training teachers.

Initially distance learning started for primary education, and only for two subjects, mother tongue and mathematics. Distance learning began on March 23. The teaching materials are recorded by the teachers and then broadcast on Radio Television of Kosovo at a certain schedule published by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. The Ministry designed an open database for teaching materials. After forwarded on the E-Learning platform, these materials are found on the official channel of the Ministry on YouTube where they can be viewed at any time. From the data obtained from the Ministry of Education, "in creating the content of materials for distance learning were included over 120 teachers and technical staff."[68] Since March 23, the Ministry of Education has been working intensively to expand distance learning for primary education to four (4) subjects. Work was done on recording teaching materials for lower secondary education. According to the Ministry of Education, "for the sixth-grade teaching

[67]Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation (MESTI). (2020). Minister's remarks on starting with distance learning. Retrieved June 12, from https://masht.rks-gov.net/en/article/mesazhi-i-ministres-hykmete-bajrami-per-fillimin-e-mesimit-ne-distance-2

[68] MESTI. (2020). Announcement. Retrieved from https://masht.rks-gov.net/article/njoftim-35

lessons would be held in eight (8) teaching subjects while for the seventh to ninth grades teaching lessons would be held at nine (9) subjects."[69] Ministry of Education announced that for two (2) weeks, distance learning was held only for primary education, while from April 6, distance learning began in the same method of broadcast for lower secondary education covering 70% of subjects.[70] From this date, for stage one of the core curriculum that includes first and second grade distance learning was expanded to four (4) subjects. These were: Mother Tongue, Mathematics, Man and Nature, Society and Environment. Even for stage two of the core curriculum that includes third to fifth grade distance learning was expanded to the same four (4) subjects. For lower secondary education, respectively for stage three (3) of the core curriculum, which includes the sixth and seventh grade, distance learning was organized in eight (8) subjects. These were: Mother Tongue, Mathematics, History, Civic Education, Physics, Biology, Geography, Information Technology. For the seventh grade, lessons were organized for the subject of Chemistry. For stage four (4) of the core curriculum, which includes eighth and ninth grade, distance learning was organized in nine (9) subjects. These were: Mother Tongue, Mathematics, History, Civic Education, Chemistry, Physics, Biology, Geography, Information Technology. Teachers and students were asked to follow the teaching materials broadcast on Radio Television of Kosovo throughout this time. Also, the teachers were asked to contact the students through alternative methods and to keep record of their attendance. These classes were organized in only fifteen (15) minutes and at the end of each class tasks were given. The students had to submit these tasks as homework to their teachers through alternative methods. The Ministry of Education in cooperation with the Municipal Directorates agreed that these alternative methods should be chosen by the teachers themselves. It should be noted that these teaching materials created the opportunity for children to continue learning, to be active in the learning process and to communicate with their teachers. According to the Ministry of Education, "through distance learning, the Ministry has achieved to transfer the learning process from school to home for over 234 thousand students of pre-university education."[71]

---

[69]MESTI. (2020). Information on weekly activities. Retrieved June 12, from https://masht.rks-gov.net/en/article/informacione-rreth-aktiviteteve-te-mashti-t-gjate-javes-23-27-mars-2020
[70]MESTI. (2020). Announcement. Retrieved June 12, from https://masht.rks-gov.net/article/njoftim-35
[71]MESTI. (2020). MESTI in function of the battle against COVID-19. Retrieved June 12 from https://masht.rks-gov.net/en/article/mashti-ne-funksion-te-luftes-kunder-covid-19

Whereas it is disappointing that in terms of English language teaching and developing English language skills during the Coronavirus pandemic, the Ministry of Education or Municipal Directorates have not had any concrete commitment. From the recorded teaching materials and from the process of organizing distance learning, not a single step related to ELT has been taken by the Ministry of Education as the highest educational institution in the country. From the review of all published conferences, articles and announcements by the Ministry of Education during this period of COVID-19 it is clear that there was no discussion at all for the possibility of including the subject of English language in the process of distance learning. At this point, it is really strange and incomprehensible that the Ministry of Education did not take the initiative to organize teaching for the English language. While such a thing was possible for the mother tongue then it would have been possible for the English language because both subjects are part of the same curriculum area and the methods for organizing the teaching are almost the same. Despite the approach of the Ministry of Education to the teaching of English in pandemic times, it should be noted that teaching has not stopped altogether. Schools in general and English language teachers have exercised their right guaranteed in accordance with the Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education. The latter provides the school with autonomy in the implementation of the core curriculum and extracurricular activities. Based on this, English language teachers have used alternative methods to contact their students. In most cases, groups have been created on Viber, WhatsApp, via email or the social network Facebook. It is really to commend the work of English language teachers who at this time of COVID-19, despite the lack of support from the Ministry of Education, created alternative ways to organize teaching classes, to be close to students, facilitate them, track their progress in development of English language skills and meet the learning outcomes envisaged by the core curriculum.

At the end of the discussion about teaching in Kosovo during COVID-19, the part of literature review in this master's thesis comes to an end. The purpose of the review was to view curriculum documents as regulators of the education system in post-war Kosovo and to look at their content related to the development of English language skills or the teaching of English as a whole. Through this, the purpose was to help the reader understand the development of curriculums in Kosovo and the importance given to teaching English language as a first foreign

language. This is significant because the general public interested in this field of study should be informed about the progress of ELT and the education system in Kosovo as whole. It is clear that this field of study continues to be studied and analyzed with the aim of creating new concepts on how and what should be improved in order to have a more effective education system. There are many topics within with field that are constantly debated or problematic issues that require more commitment but the discussion during the literature review can be helpful for readers, students, researchers who are preoccupied with the ideal of an educational system through which each student can reach the full intellectual potential.

3. Methodology

3.1. Design of research

This chapter does describe the methodology of the research study regarding the curriculums for primary and lower secondary education in Kosovo and its effectiveness in developing English language skills. Moreover, in this chapter the following will be described: the overall design of the study, participants, data collection instruments.

In order to analyze the development of curriculums in Kosovo, it's aims and the effectiveness of the curriculums in developing English language skills as well as investigate areas of improvement in the curriculum, this Master's thesis was conducted by using both qualitative and quantitative research methodology. Research methodology is the essential part of the research as it includes all the strategy, the conceptual framework and philosophical framework on how and what the researcher wants to study and also includes the procedures to be used for analyzing data. The type of research methodology according to the nature of study used in this Master thesis is of analytical type which involves the evaluation of facts and information related to the thesis being conducted. In an analytical research such as this Master thesis, the researcher uses the facts or information that is already available and does analyze the information to come up with a material. On the other hand, the type of research methodology used according to the purpose of the study is applied research methodology. Applied research methodology does add information about the basics of the discipline and does analyze the problems from the point of one particular branch or discipline. Based on the research design, this diploma thesis is of

conclusive design. This means that the researcher aims to develop a theory and provide final and conclusive answers to research questions or hypothesis but claims must be arguable that in each case other researchers can take an opposing viewpoint and come up with a research that consists of new information and new theories.

The research was divided in two parts. In the first part of this thesis, qualitative research was done through analysis of documents in order to present the history of development of curriculums in Kosovo, to present the aims of curriculums and its effectiveness in developing English language skills. This part included analysis of official documents, supportive documents, books related to the field of curriculum studies, articles, publications, administrative instructions. On the other part, a quantitative research was conducted in order to collect data. Such data obtained from the research aimed to create a clear image on how teachers of primary and lower secondary education have dealt with Kosovo curriculums throughout their career.

3.2. Subjectivity of self-evaluation

The issue of subjectivity should be discussed when discussing methodologies. What is indisputable is the presence of the subjectivity of each researcher in their work. The choice of research topic, the formulation of hypotheses, the choice of methodologies and the interpretation of data collected through a specific terminology, all are influenced by the subjectivity of the researcher. For the qualitative part of the research, this is an undeniable fact. In the quantitative part of the research, respectively in the questionnaires formulated for data collection in this master thesis, the terminology used can be subjective but the data presented are objective. In the same way that the terminology used can be subjective, even the approach of the persons who contributed by participating in the questionnaire is subjective. This means that different people who completed the questionnaire have had different approaches to the terminology that was served to them. Questionnaires have had a number of comparatively subjective terms. It is important to note formally that words such as "slightly", "moderately", "considerably" are not understood in the same way by everyone, and that they can be significantly different in different people. In the same way, people self-evaluating can be different, a modest person who may be a teacher can self-estimate as being "moderately"

familiar with a part of the curriculum while one proud teacher might self-estimate as being "highly" familiar with parts of the curriculum he barely knows.

3.3.   Participants

The participants in this research were primary and lower secondary school teachers. In general, the study included 68 teachers. 26 of them were English language teachers from different schools, different cities around Kosovo. 36 of them were teachers from lower secondary education while 32 from primary education. The table below shows participants' years of experience as teachers.

Up to 3	4-7	8-11	12-15	Over 15
8	7	15	9	29

3.4.   Data collection procedure and Instruments

Data collection methods include document analysis and questionnaires. Such questionnaires were distributed electronically since this thesis was conducted during the pandemic COVID-19 and schools were closed nationally. The pandemic became the main factor that led to the limitation of data collection procedure. Online distribution of questionnaires was the most reasonable option available. The questionnaires were designed in order to collect data concerning teacher's attitude toward the curriculum for primary and lower secondary education and also for investigating areas where teachers believe the curriculum framework or core curriculum should go through revision.

3.5.   Hypothesis

Bearing in mind the aims and purpose of this Master thesis, the research was based upon the following hypothesis:

H0: It is hypothesized that the revised Kosovo core curriculum for primary and lower secondary education has changed teachers' attitude towards the process of teaching.

H1: It is hypothesized that English Language teachers of primary and lowers secondary schools in Kosovo have a positive attitude toward the revised curriculum.

H2: It is hypothesized that the attitude of English Language teachers toward the revised curriculum differs based on their teaching experience.

H3: It is hypothesized that, an assessment of curriculum aims will help on identifying aspects of a curriculum that are working, those that need to change and assess the effectiveness of changes that have already been made.

H4: It is hypothesized that an assessment of curriculum effectiveness in developing English language skills will help on identifying aspects of the curriculums that are affecting the process of teaching English as a foreign language in Kosovo's educational system.

H5: The use of curriculum at primary and lower secondary level presents a new challenge for teachers.

4. Results/Findings

This chapter will present the results and findings elicited from the collected data through document analysis and the results obtained from the questionnaires. Data collected from this research were qualitative and quantitative.

Qualitative data were collected through document analysis. Such data were collected on the official website of the Ministry of Education, UNESCO, Kosovo Education and Employment Network (KEEN), EU Office in Kosovo, ResearchGate, Academia. Document analysis was used as a means to come up with a material which discusses the role of curriculums in the Kosovan education system.

Quantitative data were collected through questionnaires. Questionnaires were used to collect data which would help in a better understanding of the teacher's attitude toward the curriculums for primary education and lower secondary education in Kosovo. From two distributed questionnaires, the results are as it follows:

Questionnaire 1:

In question **1**, *"How informed are you about the history of curriculum development in Kosovo?"*, 25 respondents or 59% were "Moderately" informed, 12 respondents or 29% were "Slightly" informed and 5 respondents or 12% were "Highly" informed.

In question **2**, *"Have you completed the training organized by the Ministry of Education for the implementation of the new Curriculum?", 37 respondents or 88.1% said "Yes" while 5 respondents or 11.9% said "No".*

In question **3**, *"How aware are you of the changes that the new Curriculum has brought to the education system?",* 25 respondents or 59.5% were "Moderately" aware, 11 respondents or 26.2% were "Slightly" aware, 4 respondents or 9.5% were "Highly" aware and 2 respondents or 4.8% were "Not aware at all".

In question **4**, *"How much difficulty did you encounter during the implementation of the new Curriculum?",* 26 respondents or 61.9% had "Slight" difficulty, 9 respondents or 21.4% had "Moderate" difficulty, 4 respondents or 9.5% had "High" difficulty, 3 respondents or 7.1% were "No difficulty at all".

In question **5**, *"How informed are you about the goals of the new Curriculum?",* 27 respondents or 64.3% were "Moderately" informed, 9 respondents or 21.4% were "Slightly" informed, 5 respondents or 11.9% were "Highly" informed and 1 respondent or 2.4% was "Not at all" informed.

In question **6**, *"Do you think that the expected outcomes from the new Curriculum are in harmony with the current state of education in Kosovo?",* 27 respondents or 64.3% said "No", 9 respondents or 21.4% said "Yes" and 6 respondents or 14.3% were "Uncertain".

In question **7**, *"Do you think that the education system in Kosovo has progressed since the beginning of the implementation of the new Curriculum?",* 20 respondents or 47.6% said "No", 12 respondents or 28.6% were "Uncertain" and 10 respondents or 23.8% said "Yes".

In question **8**, *"How informed are you about the role of school according to the new Curriculum?"*, 22 respondents or 52.4*%* were "Slightly" informed, 18 respondents or 42.9*%* were "Moderately" informed, 2 respondents or 4.8*%* were "Highly" informed.

In question **9**, *"How informed are you about the role of teacher according to the new Curriculum?"*, 26 respondents or 61.9*%* were "Moderately" informed, 12 respondents or 28.6*%* were "Slightly" informed, 4 respondents or 9.5*%* were "Highly" informed.

In question **10**, *"How informed are you about the role of the student according to the new Curriculum?"*, 27 respondents or 64.3*%* were "Moderately" informed, 12 respondents or 28.6*%* were "Slightly" informed, 3 respondents or 7.1*%* were "Highly" informed.

In question **11**, *"How much do you think students are informed about the new Curriculum?"*, 25 respondents or 59.5*%* thought students were "Slightly" informed, 12 respondents or 28.6% thought students were "Moderately" informed, 3 respondents or 7.1% thought students were "Not at all" informed, 2 respondents or 4.8% thought students were "Highly" informed.

In question **12**, *"Do you think that competency-based learning is more effective than subject-based learning?"*, 16 respondents or 38.1% were "Uncertain", 15 respondents or 35.7% said "No", while 11 respondents or 26.2% said "Yes".

In question **13**, *"How do the results achieved by the students match the learning outcomes according to the competencies provided by the Curriculum?"*, 23 respondents or 56.1% thought that results do "Slightly" match, 16 respondents or 39% thought that results do "Moderately" match, 2 respondents or 4.9% thought that results do "Not match at all".

In question **14**, *"How do the expected outcomes from the development of competencies match your expected outcomes as a teacher?"*, 20 respondents or 48.8% thought that outcomes match "Slightly", 19 respondents or 46.3% thought they match "Moderately" and 2 respondents or 4.9% thought they match "Highly".

In question **15**, *"How do the results achieved by the students match the learning outcomes for the curriculum areas provided by the Curriculum?"*, 23 respondents or 54.8% thought the results

match "Slightly", 18 respondents or 42.9% thought the results match "Moderately", 1 or 2.4% thought the results match "Highly".

In question **16**, *"How do the expected outcomes from the curriculum areas match your expected outcomes as a teacher?",* 20 respondents or 47.6*%* thought the outcomes match "Slightly", 19 respondents or 45.2*%* thought the outcomes match "Moderately", 3 respondents or 7.1*%* thought the outcomes match "Highly".

In question **17**, *"Do you think the Curriculum needs improvement?",* 33 respondents or 78.6*%* said "Yes", 9 respondents or 21.4*%* said "No".

Questionnaire 2:

In question **1***, "How informed are you about the history of curriculum development in Kosovo?",* 14 respondents or 53.8% were "Moderately" informed, 10 respondents or 38.5% were "Slightly" informed and 2 respondents or 7.7% were "Highly" informed.

In question **2**, *"Have you completed the training organized by the Ministry of Education for the implementation of the new Curriculum?",* 20 respondents or 76.9% said "Yes", 6 respondents or 23.1% said "No".

In question **3**, *"How aware are you of the changes that the new Curriculum has brought to the education system?",* 16 respondents or 61.5% were "Moderately" aware, 5 respondents or 19.2% were "Highly" aware, 3 respondents or 11.5% were "Slightly" aware, 2 respondents or 7.7% were "Not aware at all".

In question **4**, "*How important do you think English language teaching is at the level of primary and lower secondary education?",* 18 respondents or 69.2% said "Highly" important, 6 respondents or 23.1% said "Moderately" important, 2 respondents or 7.7% said "Slightly" important.

In question **5**, *"How aware are you of the inclusion of English in the new Curriculum?",* 15 respondents or 57.7% were "Moderately" aware, 8 respondents or 30.8% were "Highly" aware, 2 respondents or 7.7% were "Not aware at all", 1 respondent or 3.8% was "Slightly" aware.

In question **6**, *"How much difficulty did you encounter during the implementation of the new Curriculum?",* 12 respondents or 46.2% had "Slight" difficulty, 6 respondents or 23.1% had "No difficulty at all", 5 respondents or 19.2 % had "High" difficulty, while 3 respondents or 11.5% had "Moderate" difficulty.

In question **7**, *"How informed are you about the objectives of teaching English according to the new Curriculum?",* 18 respondents or 69.2% were "Moderately" informed, 4 respondents or 15.4% were "Slightly" informed, 3 respondents or 11.5% were "Highly" informed, 1 respondent or 3.8% was "Not informed at all".

In question **8,** *"Do you think that the teaching of English in Kosovo has progressed since the beginning of the implementation of the new Curriculum?",* 12 respondents or 46.2% said "No", 8 respondents or 30.8% were "Uncertain", 6 respondents or 23.1% said "Yes".

In question **9**, *"How informed are you about the content of the competence of communication and expression which covers the teaching of English language?",* 20 respondents or 76.9% were "Moderately" informed, 4 respondents or 15.4% were "Highly" informed, 1 respondent or 3.8% was "Slightly" informed and 1 respondent or 3.8% was "Not informed at all".

In question **10**, "*How informed are you about the content of the curriculum area of languages and communication which covers the subject of English language?",* 15 respondents or 57.7% were "Moderately" informed, 8 respondents or 30.8% were "Highly" informed, 2 respondents or 7.7% were "Slightly" informed, 1 respondent or 3.8% was "Not informed at all".

In question **11**, *"How much do you think students are informed about English language teaching according to the new Curriculum?",* 13 respondents or 50% thought students are "Slightly" informed, 9 respondents or 34.6% thought students are "Moderately" informed, 3 respondents or 11.5% thought students are "Highly" informed, 1 respondent or 3.8% thought students are "Not informed at all". The results indicate that most teachers believe students are slightly informed about the process of ELT as given by in the new curriculum. Since there were slight changes in the new curriculum related to ELT, there was no campaign for informing students.

In question **12**, *"Do you think competency-based learning is more effective than subject-based learning in terms of developing English language skills?",* 12 respondents or 46.2% said "No", 8 respondents or 30.8% said "Yes", 6 respondents or 23.1% were "Uncertain".

In question **13,** *"How do the results achieved by the students in learning English match the expected outcomes according to the competencies provided by the Curriculum?",* 14 respondents or 53.8% thought the results match "Slightly", 9 respondents or 34.6% thought the results match "Moderately", 2 respondents or 7.7% thought the results match "Not at all" while 1 respondent or 3.8% thought the results match "Highly".

In question **14**, *"How do the results achieved by the students in learning English match the expected outcomes for the curriculum areas provided by the Curriculum?",* 12 respondents or 46.2% thought the results match "Moderately", 11 respondents or 42.3% thought the results match "Slightly", 2 respondents or 7.7% thought the results match "Not at all" while 1 respondent or 3.8% thought the results match "Highly".

In question **15**, *"How effective do you think the new Curriculum was in creating a new educational approach to teaching English?",* 12 respondents or 46.2% thought the Curriculum is "Slightly" effective, 10 respondents or 38.5% thought the Curriculum is "Moderately" effective while 4 respondents or 15.4% thought the Curriculum is "Not effective at all".

In question **16**, *"Do you think the Curriculum needs improvement in relation to the teaching of English?",* 16 respondents or 61.5% said "Yes" while 10 respondents or 38.5% said "No".

5. Discussion

This chapter of this master's thesis includes the discussion of the findings from the research and a discussion on the interrelation of the findings with the hypotheses of this study. More precisely, in this chapter it will be discussed whether the findings from the research support or reject the hypotheses raised.

5.1. Discussion of the findings

Question 1: The results indicate that a small percentage of teachers are highly informed about the history of curriculum development in Kosovo. Most teachers state that they are moderately informed. This indicates that teachers in Kosovo are unable to clearly distinct between different periods in the history of curriculums in Kosovo. The lack of information about the history of curriculums results in the lack of an attitude about the development of the education system in Kosovo.

Question 2: The results indicate that the largest number of teachers have completed the organized training for the implementation of the curriculum while those who have not done so are novice teachers employed after 2016. It should be noted that novice teachers are not subject to training.

Question 3: The results indicate that a small percentage are highly aware of the changes that the new curriculum has brought in 2016. Again, most teachers have stated that they are moderately aware. This results in discrepancies between the curriculum and its implementers.

Question 4: The results indicate that the highest percentage of teachers had slight difficulties during the implementation of the new curriculum while a small percentage had high difficulties in implementing the new curriculum. The results show a positive factor among teachers because their flexibility is highlighted.

Question 5: The results of this question indicate that among teachers only a small percentage are highly informed about the goals of the new curriculum. While, the largest percentage are moderately informed. Failure to provide complete information about the purposes of the new curriculum results in non-compliance with the curriculum requirements for the teacher.

Question 6: The results obtained from this question indicate that most teachers are aware of the current state of education in Kosovo and that the results expected from the Curriculum are not in harmony with the current state. This is due to a poor school infrastructure that would enable the fulfillment of the goals of the new curriculum. A percentage of teachers who think that the

expected outcomes from the curriculum match the current state of education turns out to be from teachers of schools located in urban areas.

Question 7: The results indicate that the smaller number of teachers believe that the education system has progressed with the new curriculum. Most teachers believe that such a thing has not happened.

Question 8: The results obtained from this question indicate that most teachers are slightly informed about the assigned role of school according to the new curriculum. Only 4.8% of teachers who have been part of this research state that they are highly informed about the role of school in the new curriculum.

Question 9: The results obtained from this question indicate that most teachers are moderately informed about their role assigned by the new curriculum. Only 9.5% of teachers who have been part of this research state that they are highly informed about the role of the teacher in the new curriculum.

Question 10: The results obtained indicate that most teachers are moderately informed about the role of the student assigned by the new curriculum. Only 7.1% of teachers who have been part of this research state that they are highly informed about the role of the student in the new curriculum.

Question 11: The results obtained indicate that most teachers think students are slightly informed about the new curriculum. Only 4.8% of teachers who have been part of this research think that students are highly informed the new curriculum.

Question 12: The results indicate that most teachers are uncertain whether competency-based learning is more effective than subject-based learning. The transition from subject-based learning to competency-based learning was a radical change in the development of curriculums in Kosovo. The results indicate that most teachers are not well informed about the expected results according to the competencies and those that were according to the subject-based teaching. Also, a percentage of 35.7% believe that competency-based learning is not more effective than

subject-based learning. This shows that a significant percentage of teachers have more confidence in the old curriculums than in the new curriculum.

Question 13: The results obtained do indicate that the highest percentage of teachers believe that the results achieved by the students do slightly match with the learning outcomes of the learning competencies which are to be achieved at the end of each curriculum stage. It is to be mentioned that there was no respondent who believed that the results achieved by students do highly match those expected by the curriculum.

Question 14: The results obtained indicate that teachers who state that the expected outcome from curriculum competencies match their expected outcomes as teacher fall into a small percentage. The highest percentage believe that the expected outcomes do slightly match. Even here, it is seen that a significant percentage of teachers do still have their expected outcomes in harmony with the curriculum they have used to work until the publication of the new curriculum.

Question 15: The results indicate that most of teachers believe that the results achieved from the students do slightly or moderately match with the learning outcomes described in each curriculum area in the new curriculum.

Question 16: The results obtained indicate that the expected outcomes described in the curriculum areas do slightly or moderately match the expected outcomes of teachers in Kosovo.

Question 17: The results indicate that the majority of teachers believe that the curriculum needs improvement and their suggestions on what has to change will be given in a table below.

Review each aspect of the curriculum.
Teaching to be done according to objectives.
Balancing the teaching periods.
Changes in learning competencies and criteria.
Review the curriculum form and to relate subjects with each other.
To adapt the curriculum with the current state in schools.
Review learning expectations.

Have less administrative work.

To design the curriculum according to the state and needs in the country, not according to the curriculums of the neighboring countries.

Organize trainings around curriculum areas.

Be based on interaction and not on individual expectations.

Not to determine the expectations and competencies of learning.

Review textbooks.

To work on the implementation of the curriculum and the communication approach.

Training should be done professionally.

Decompose the curriculum concretely so that it is easier to implement.

Limit classes to no more than 20 students.

Have workshops for every subject.

Table 8 - Teachers' suggestions on Curriculum improvement

Questionnaire 2

Question 1: The results indicate that a small percentage of teachers are highly informed about the history of curriculum development in Kosovo. Most teachers state that they are moderately informed. As for the first questionnaire, the results from this question indicate that teachers in Kosovo are unable to clearly distinct between different periods in the history of curriculums in Kosovo. The lack of information about the history of curriculums results in the lack of an attitude about the development of the education system in Kosovo.

Question 2: The results indicate that the largest number of teachers have completed the organized training for the implementation of the curriculum while those who have not done so are novice teachers employed after 2016. It was noted that novice teachers are not subject to training.

Question 3: The results indicate that a considerable percenteage of teachers are highly aware of the changes that the new curriculum has brought in 2016. Most teachers have stated that they are moderately aware of these changes.

Question 4: Results indicate that the majority of English teachers believe that teaching English in primary and lower secondary schools is of high importance. This indicates that EL teachers are completely aware of the importance of acquiring a second language.

Question 5: Results obtained from this question indicate that the majority of EL teachers are moderately or highly informed about the inclusion of English in the new curriculum. This indicates that EL teachers have closely paid attention to the process of implementing the new curriculum in ELT.

Question 6: Results do indicate that the majority of EL teachers have had slight or no difficulties at implementing the new curriculum. This may have been affected by the fact that little or no changes have been made in the curriculum related to the process of English language teaching.

Question 7: The results obtained indicate that the majority of EL teachers are moderately or slightly informed about the objectives of teaching English as given by the new curriculum. This is because of the fact that there is no particular part in the curriculum that deals with describing the objectives to be met by teaching English in primary and lower secondary schools.

Question 8: The results indicate that the majority of EL teachers do not believe that ELT has progressed since the publication of the new curriculum. This, for the fact mentioned above that little or no changes have been made in the curriculum related to the process of ELT.

Question 9: Results obtained indicate that the majority of EL teachers are moderately or highly informed about the content of learning competencies which cover the process of ELT.

Question 10: Results obtained indicate that the majority of EL teachers are moderately or highly informed about the content of the curriculum area of languages and communication which cover the process of ELT.

Question 11: The results indicate that most teachers believe students are slightly informed about the process of ELT as given by in the new curriculum. Since there were slight changes in the new curriculum related to ELT, there was no campaign for informing students.

Question 12: The results indicate that most teachers do not believe that competency-based learning is more effective than subject-based learning. The poor inclusion of English in the Kosovo curriculums is the reason why EL teacher believe that a subject-based curriculum would lead to higher results achieved by students learning English as a second language.

Question 13: Results obtained indicate that the majority of EL teachers believe that the results achieved by students in learning EL do slightly match with the expected outcomes according to the learning competencies where EL is included.

Question 14: Results obtained indicate that most teachers believe that the results achieved by the students do moderately match with the expected outcomes given in the curriculum area of languages and communication where EL is included.

Question 15: The results indicate that the majority of EL teachers believe that the new curriculum was slightly or moderately effective in creating a new educational approach to ELT. Again, this is because the new curriculum does not present any changes regarding the process of ELT.

Question 16: The results obtained indicate that the majority of teachers believe that the curriculum needs improvement in relation to ELT. The suggestion given by teachers who were respondents of this research will be given in the table below.

Review and coordinate books with the curriculum.
Increase the number of English lessons.
Design English language books that are suitable for students.
Remove the burden of administrative work, preparation of daily lesson plans.
Bring back the system with 3 lesson hours per week.
The expected results cannot be achieved with 2 lesson hours per week
Topics and expected outcomes for the subject are not related to textbooks.
To design books that can be applied continuously and not to work with the method of changing books, e.g. from the book Today in Live Beat.
Review expectations.
Adapt the expected results to the current state of education.

To increase the infrastructural capacities for the implementation of the curriculum.

Table 9 - Teachers' suggestions on Curriculum improvement

5.2. Summary of the research problem

The issue of curriculums in Kosovo appears even nowadays as an issue that needs to be discussed at a wider social level. From the first years after the war until the development of the last curriculum in Kosovo, there has been a lack of awareness among teachers about the importance of implementing the curriculum. In this case, indisputably, the burden cannot be transferred to the teachers as the main burden should fall to the state institutions that should have taken concrete steps in campaigns that would raise the awareness on the importance of the curriculum. Since the publication of the last curriculum, many issues have been raised about its effectiveness and the administrative burden put on teachers. From many discussions with primary and lower secondary school teachers, a common denominator of their problems is the structure and content of the curriculum. With this in mind and from the elaboration that has been done to the curriculums in the chapter of literature review, the need for this research has arisen. Therefore, the problem addressed in this study was to identify teachers' attitude towards the curriculum and to identify their attitude towards the content of the curriculum. At this point, this study sought to cover an empty gap in research on this topic. Various researchers have approached this topic but never with special emphasis on discussing its aims and effectiveness in developing English language skills.

5.3. Discussion of hypothesis

Six (6) hypotheses have been raised from this study. In this section of this chapter the findings of each hypothesis will be reviewed and discussed.

Hypothesis 0 – It is hypothesized that the revised Kosovo core curriculum for primary and lower secondary education has changed teachers' attitude towards the process of teaching.

The null hypothesis argued that the revised version of the Curriculum for Primary and Lower Secondary Education has influenced teachers to change their attitude toward teaching. From the quantitative and qualitative data collected, it can be said that this hypothesis is fully supported.

The radical change in the way of learning from the subject-based curriculum to the competency-based curriculum is the main factor that has influenced the attitude of the teachers towards the teaching process assigned by the revised curriculum. Another influential factor is the training organized by the Ministry of Education, which was based on the preparation of teachers for the implementation of the revised curriculum. This training has caused teachers to change their approach to the expected outcomes to be achieved by the student and the way students are assessed.

Hypothesis 1 – It is hypothesized that English Language teachers of primary and lowers secondary schools in Kosovo have a positive attitude toward the revised curriculum.

This hypothesis assumed that English language teachers in primary and lower secondary schools have a positive attitude towards the revised curriculum. From the quantitative and qualitative data collected it can be said that this hypothesis is rejected. English language teachers are fully aware about the importance of learning English language in primary and lower secondary schools. They are also informed about the objectives set out in the revised curriculum. The concern lies in the fact that teachers are not satisfied with the fund of teaching hours per week, with textbooks, with the expectations of the curriculum that do not match the textbooks. The concerns of English language teachers have given the data that the highest percentage of teachers who have participated in this study believe that English language teaching has not progressed since the publication of the revised version of the curriculum. Another reason that influences the attitude of English language teachers towards the revised curriculum is competency-based learning. A high percentage of English language teachers are convinced that the subject-based curriculum would be much more effective in developing English language skills.

Hypothesis 2 – It is hypothesized that the attitude of English Language teachers toward the revised curriculum differs based on their teaching experience.

This hypothesis assumed that the attitude of English language teachers towards the revised curriculum varies based on their experience. From the quantitative and qualitative data collected, it can be concluded that this hypothesis is fully supported. At this point, the data collected are divided into teachers who have up to seven (7) years of work experience and those with over

eight (8) years of work experience. From the collected data we come to the conclusion that English language teachers who have up to seven (7) years of work experience have a different attitude from teachers with over eight (8) years of work experience. Teachers up to seven (7) years of work experience are less informed about the history of curriculum development, believe that learning English has progressed since the publication of the revised version of the curriculum and do not believe that the curriculum should change. relationship with English language teaching. On the other hand, English language teachers with more than eight (8) years of work experience are more informed about the history, have encountered more difficulties in the process of implementing the curriculum and believe that the new curriculum was not at all effective in creating of a new approach to the process of English language teaching.

Hypothesis 3 – It is hypothesized that, an assessment of curriculum aims will help on identifying aspects of a curriculum that are working, those that need to change and to assess the effectiveness of changes that have already been made.

This hypothesis argued that a curriculum assessment would help on identifying aspects of the curriculum that are working, those that need to change and to assess the effectiveness of changes that have already been made. From the data collected, it is concluded that this hypothesis as such is fully supported. From the elaboration of the curriculum made in the chapter of literature review, the aims of the curriculum have been highlighted. From the discussion about the goals of the curriculum in this research, assessments of the teachers about the effectiveness of changes that have been made in the revised curriculum have been identified, the aspects that are functioning and those that need to be changed have been identified. From the aspects that are working, it has been identified that despite the difficulties that teachers may have encountered, the revised curriculum is being implemented in each school by each and every teacher. Also, it has been identified that teachers are aware of curriculum content according to learning competencies and curriculum areas. From the results obtained and given in the previous chapter, it is seen that a significant part of primary and lower secondary school teachers do not highly evaluate the effectiveness of changes made in the revised curriculum. Meanwhile, for the

aspects that need to be changed, tables were given with the suggestions received from the teachers.

Hypothesis 4 – It is hypothesized that an assessment of curriculum effectiveness in developing English language skills will help on identifying aspects of the curriculums that are affecting the process of teaching English as a foreign language in Kosovo's educational system.

This hypothesis argued that an assessment of curriculum effectiveness in developing English language skills will help on identifying aspects of the curriculums that are affecting the process of teaching English as a foreign language in Kosovo's educational system. From the data collected, it is concluded that this hypothesis is fully supported. The literature review chapter elaborates the aspects of the curriculum that include the process of English language teaching. From the elaboration of these aspects, information has been pointed out that shows that the inclusion of English in the curriculum is minimal. From this minimal involvement it can be concluded that from a theoretical point of view, the development of English language skills remains a difficult challenge. This is due to the fact that the curriculum does not present a separate section that would specifically support the process of learning English as the first foreign language in Kosovo. Whereas, from the results collected by English language teachers that constitute the practical part of curriculum implementation, it can be concluded that some aspects have been identified that would help the English language teaching process. These aspects were given in the previous chapter in the form of a table which includes suggestions from English language teachers for the changes that should be made in the curriculum.

Hypothesis 5 – The use of curriculum at primary and lower secondary level presents a new challenge for teachers.

This hypothesis assumed that curriculum use at the primary and lower secondary level poses a new challenge for teachers. From the quantitative and qualitative data collected, it can be concluded that the hypothesis is supported. From the changes that have been made in curriculum, the transition from subject-based teaching to competency-based teaching, the change from two (2) teaching periods to three (3) teaching periods, the inclusion of subjects based on their interrelation in curriculum areas and learning competencies, having curriculum

areas expectations and learning competencies expectations that do not match with each other, all these do create a set of aspects that have made the use of the curriculum a challenge for teachers.

5.4. Limitations of the study

This research had the following limitations:

- Research was limited to collecting quantitative data online since it was conducted at the time of COVID-19 pandemic. With the closure of schools nationwide, contact with teachers was only possible online.
- Research was limited to primary and lower secondary education curriculum as this master's thesis was focused on this level of schooling.
- The research was limited to the teachers' self-reports as in times of the pandemic it was impossible to check the veracity of the ratio between their statements and the real situation in the school.
- The research was limited by the lack of previous research on this topic.
- The research was limited to the reluctance of teachers to clearly and realistically respond to the questionnaires. This leads to not having clear information about the real situation in schools.
- The research was limited because of the lack of information on school staff. Such a thing would have helped in having a larger number of data and more perceptions in the approach of teachers towards different aspects of the curriculum.

6. Conclusions

This chapter presents the conclusion of this study, the conclusions of the research and the recommendations for future research. The main purpose of this chapter is to present a general conclusion for the study and for the qualitative and quantitative data collected during the research. The conclusions will be followed by recommendations for future research.

6.1. General conclusions of the study

As stated in the introduction chapter of this master's thesis, the main purpose of this study is the assessment of aims and effectiveness of the curriculum in particular about the development of English language skills. Also, the purpose of this topic was to discuss the importance of the curriculum and analyze it in order to identify different aspects that are functioning or even different aspects that need to be improved. Based on this, initially in this master's thesis it was necessary to define the field of curriculum studies, to define the terms curriculum analysis, curriculum assessment. From the review of the literature and the comparison of the literature available, the above mentioned were defined. After elaborating on each term, the focus of the master's thesis shifted on reviewing the literature on curriculums in Kosovo. Before doing so, it was necessary to discuss the history of curriculum development in Kosovo. In the literature review chapter, three (3) curriculum frameworks developed in Kosovo from the end of the war were elaborated. For each of these three (3) curriculum frameworks it was specifically discussed on its structure, content, aims, and the inclusion of aspects related to the development of English language skills. At the end of the discussion on curriculum frameworks, the core curriculums for primary and lower secondary education were analyzed and elaborated. The different types of curriculums and the structure of the core curriculum were also discussed. After this section of the literature review chapter, a special section was devoted to teaching English during COVID-19 pandemics. In this section, the way of organizing distance learning in Kosovo was specifically discussed, the difficulties during this period were discussed, the flexibility of the teachers, the efforts of the respective institutions for the greater involvement of the students. From the definition section of the curriculum as a field of study it can be concluded that the field of study is relatively new and that its pace has been after 2010. From the definition of terms, it can be concluded that the curriculum is a document accompanied by official study programs, published by ministries or departments of education, local authorities or education boards. From the definition of the term curriculum analysis it can be concluded that through curriculum analysis, the analysis of the constituent parts of the curriculum is done and how the parts of the curriculum function as a whole. From the definition of the term curriculum assessment it can be concluded that the curriculum assessment process helps in gathering information in order to improve the

curriculum, highlighting the aspects that need improvement and to demonstrate the effectiveness of the curriculum. Then, with the discussions about the framework of the first curriculum in Kosovo, the characteristics of this curriculum framework were highlighted. It was discussed that this curriculum was developed by foreign experts who at that time had the role of administrator in Kosovo and that this curriculum framework was a subject-based curriculum. Also, it was discussed that from the period of the first curriculum framework to the publication of the curriculum framework for pre-university education in Kosovo, many laws were drafted in order to improve the quality of education in Kosovo. From the section where the curriculum framework for pre-university education in Kosovo in 2011 is discussed, it can be concluded that with the publication of the curriculum framework, some radical changes have begun in the education system in Kosovo. The biggest change was the transition from subject-based curriculum to learning competency-based curriculum. It was discussed in this section that at the time of publication of this curriculum framework it was decided that its implementation should be done only in pilot schools in order to identify various factors that may hinder the full implementation of the curriculum. From the discussion section about the revised curriculum framework, the curriculum structure, its function, the content of the learning competencies, the content of the curriculum areas, as well as the analysis of the aspects that are directly or indirectly related to the development of skills were elaborated. of English. In the discussion section on the core curriculums for primary and lower secondary education, the specific points of the learning competencies and the specific points of the curriculum areas that cover the teaching of English as the first foreign language in Kosovo were discussed and analyzed. Such a thing was done for each stage of the curriculum. From the analysis of the core curriculums it can be concluded that during the review of the literature the gaps where the greater inclusion of concrete objectives about the teaching of English is needed have been identified. At the end of this section, the teaching of English in Kosovo during the COVID-19 pandemic was discussed. From this section it can be concluded that the Ministry of Education failed to organize distance learning for English classes and that the credit for not interrupting the teaching process belongs to English language teachers who have used every alternative way to be in contact with students. Such a thing occurred through various platforms and social networks. At the end of the discussion about the

lesson during the COVID-19 pandemic, the first part of the master's thesis came to an end, thus continuing with the research, the conclusions of which will be discussed in the following section.

6.2. Conclusions of the research

Upon finishing the section of general conclusions of the study on the available literature, a separate section will be devoted to the conclusions from the research conducted. From the conclusions in the previous section, it was stated that during the review of the available literature, gaps were encountered that require improvement in relation to the process of English language teaching. It was precisely concluded that a curriculum with clear and concrete objectives was needed which would help to fully implement the curriculum. The purpose of this research was also to identify the attitudes of teachers towards the structure of the curriculum and its content as well as the assessment of teachers towards the goals and effectiveness of the curriculum for primary and lower secondary education. From the data collected during the research, it can be concluded that the main finding is that most teachers believe that competency-based curriculum isn't more effective than subject-based curriculum. Another finding was that most teachers believe that the new curriculum needs improvement and also believe that since the publication of the revised version of the curriculum there has been no progress in the teaching process in general and the development of English language skills in particular. From the research done, the data collected and the teachers' suggestions about the curriculum, it can be concluded that in order to have a more effective curriculum, some aspects need to be reviewed. Aspects in which teachers who participated in this research believe that the curriculum should be reviewed are the structure of the curriculum, the review of its expectations, adapting curriculum content to the current state of education in Kosovo, to review textbooks whose content does not match with the expected outcomes from the learning competencies or those from curriculum areas. From these suggestions of the teachers it can be concluded that the research was successful in identifying some of the main problems of the curriculum according to the teachers of the primary and lower secondary schools. Then some aspects related in particular to the development of English language skills that the teachers suggested in this research are the design of new editions of English language books that are in line to be used in different curriculum stages without the need of working with different books

in different stages, to increase the number of English language lesson hours which is currently 2 hours per week. More lesson hours per week means more opportunities for developing English language skills, meeting the objectives of English language teachers, better implementation of the curriculum, meeting the expectations of the curriculum. From the above findings it can be concluded that the research helped in identifying various aspects that would help in reviewing the curriculum and consequently in raising the quality of education and increasing the effectiveness of the curriculum.

6.3.   Suggestions for further research

This research study was conducted by collecting qualitative and quantitative data that helped identify different aspects of the curriculum for primary and lower secondary education and also to identify different aspects of the curriculum in relation to the development of English language skills.

As a recommendation for future research in this area it would be to include students' attitudes on what they suggest should be changed in the curriculum in order to have higher effectiveness. This would help to make changes in line with the suggestions of experts and teachers that are considered effective by all parties.

Another recommendation would be to extend the topic to the international level by conducting a research among the curriculums of neighboring countries. Conduction of a research on aspects of the curricula of neighboring countries about English language teaching would result in the identification of various aspects and influencing factors that would be used in Kosovo as well.

A final recommendation would be to conduct a proper study together with education experts who have participated in the development of Kosovo curriculum for primary and lower secondary education. Such research would clarify all the influential factors during the flow of curriculum development and thus would highlight the reasons for the poor inclusion of English language in curriculum framework and core curriculums.

References

Aguokogbuo, Cyril N. (2000). Concept and Scope of Curriculum studies. Nigeria: Mike Social Press.

Aliu, L. (n.d.). Analysis of Kosovo's education system. Retrieved from http://library.fes.de/pdf-files/bueros/kosovo/15185-20190220.pdf

Applied education system. (2020). What's the Difference Between Online Learning and Distance Learning?. Retrieved from https://www.aeseducation.com/blog/online-learning-vs-distance-learning

Bušelić, M. (2012). Distance Learning – concepts and contributions. Retrieved from https://hrcak.srce.hr/file/124393

Eraut, M., Et al. (1975). The Analysis of Curriculum Materials. University of Sussex Education Area Occasional Paper 2.

EU office in Kosovo. (2018). Quality Education for a brighter future. Prishtina. Retrieved from https://europehouse-kosovo.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/EDUCATION_publication_eng8-1.pdf

European Commission Liaison Office to Kosovo. (n.d). EU assistance to Kosovo. Prishtina. Retrieved from http://eeas.europa.eu/archives/delegations/kosovo/documents/press_corner/education_for_the_future_en.pdf

Ferizi Shala, R. (2014). Planning and implementing in Pre-Primary classes according to Kosovo Curriculum Framework – Case Study. In Conference Proceedings. 4th Edition. Florence, Italy.

Georgescu, D. (2002). On Curriculum Development in Kosovo. Retrieved from https://www.academia.edu/2759408/On_Curriculum_Development_in_Kosovo

Jansen, D. J. Reddy, V. (n.d.). Curriculum Analysis. A reference manual. Retrieved from http://www.pitt.edu/~ginie/ieq/pdf/curranal.pdf

Kasumi, H. (2016). The implementation of Kosovo Curricula regarding the English Language Teaching. Retrieved from www.researchgate.net/publication/313478289

KEEN. (2018). Management of Pre-University Education in Kosovo. Retrieved from https://keen-ks.net/site/assets/files/1456/raporti_per_menaxhimin_e_arsimit_parauniversitar_-_eng-1.pdf

Klein, M. F. (2010). Pivotal Events and People in My Career. In E. Malewski (Ed.). Curriculum Studies Handbook: The Next Moment. New York: Routledge.

Kosovo Education and Employment Network (KEEN). Education Strategic Plans. Retrieved from https://www.keen-ks.net/en/publications/education-strategic-plans/

Kridel, C. (2010). Encyclopedia of Curriculum Studies. University of South Carolina.

Maliqi, M., Kamberi, F. (2016). Reformat e Arsimit në nivelin fillor dhe të mesëm të ulët [Education reforms at primary and lower secondary level]. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/316515872

Merriam-Webster. (n.d.). Curriculum. In Merriam-Webster.com dictionary. Retrieved from https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/curriculum

MEST. (2014,2015,2016). Administrative Instruction (AI) 30/2013, AI 23/2014, AI 13/2015. Retrieved from https://masht.rks-gov.net/en/udhezimet-administrative

MEST. (2016). The Revised Curriculum Framework, Minister remarks.

MESTI. (2020). Announcement. Retrieved from https://masht.rks-gov.net/article/njoftim-35

MESTI. (2020). Announcement. Retrieved from https://masht.rks-gov.net/article/njoftim-35

MESTI. (2020). E-Learning, weekly schedule for grades 1-9. Retrieved from https://masht.rks-gov.net/en/article/emesimi-orari-javor-i-transmetimit-ne-rtk-4-per-klasat-1-9

MESTI. (2020). Information on weekly activities. Retrieved from https://masht.rks-gov.net/en/article/informacione-rreth-aktiviteteve-te-mashti-t-gjate-javes-23-27-mars-2020

MESTI. (2020). MESTI in function of the battle against COVID-19. Retrieved from https://masht.rks-gov.net/en/article/mashti-ne-funksion-te-luftes-kunder-covid-19

Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST). (2001). The New Kosovo Curriculum Framework. Prishtina. UN Department of Education.

Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST). (2011). Curriculum Framework for Pre-University Education in the Republic of Kosovo. Prishtina.

Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. (2011). Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011-2016. Prishtina.

Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. (2012). Kosovo`s Core Curriculum for pre-primary grade and primary education. Retrieved from https://masht.rks-gov.net/uploads/2015/10/core-curriculum-for-pre-primary-grade-and-primary-education-in-kosovo.pdf

Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation (MESTI). (2020). Minister's remarks on starting with distance learning. Retrieved from https://masht.rks-gov.net/en/article/mesazhi-i-ministres-hykmete-bajrami-per-fillimin-e-mesimit-ne-distance-2

Page, R. (2009). Foreword. In E. C. Short & L. J. Waks (Eds.). Leaders in Curriculum Studies: Intellectual Self-Portraits.

Pinar, W. (1978): The Reconceptualization of Curriculum Studies. Journal of Curriculum Studies.

Pinar, W. (1979). What is the Reconceptualization?. Journal of Curriculum Theorizing.

Pinar, W. F. (2007). Intellectual Advancement through Disciplinarily; Verticality and Horizontality in Curriculum Studies. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

Pinar, W. F. (2008). Curriculum Theory since 1950, Crisis, Reconceptualization, Internationalization. In M. Connelly, H. Fang & J. Phillion, J. (Eds.). The Sage Handbook of Curriculum and Instruction. Los Angeles: Sage.

Pinar, W. Reynolds, W. Slattery, P. Taubman, P. (1995). Understanding Curriculum: an introduction to the study of historical and contemporary curriculum discourses. New York.

Reznick, K. (2010). How to be a more effective communicator. Retrieved from http://www.creativetraining.com/train/docs/effective-communicator.pdf

Sidek, M.H. (2010). EFL Curriculum Analysis: A case study. University of Malaysia. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/282206501_EFL_Curriculum_Analysis_A_Case_Study

Su, S. (2012). The Various Concepts of Curriculum and the Factors Involved in Curricula-making (Vol. 3). Journal of Language Teaching and Research. doi:10.4304/jltr.3.1.153-158

Telegrafi. (2020). Shqetësuese, dhjetë mijë nxënës braktisin shkollat e Kosovës. [Concern, ten thousand students drop out of school in Kosovo.]. Retrieved from https://telegrafi.com/shqetesuese-dhjete-mije-nxenes-braktisin-shkollat-e-kosoves/

Tyler, R. W., Gagné, R. M., & Scriven, M. (1967). Perspectives of curriculum evaluation. Chicago: Rand McNally.

UNESCO. (2020). COVID-19 Educational Disruption and Response. Retrieved from https://en.unesco.org/covid19/educationresponse

Vitikka, E. Krokfors, L. Hurmerinta, E. (2012). The Finnish National Core Curriculum: Structure and Development. Retrieved from https://curriculumredesign.org/wp-content/uploads/The-Finnish-National-Core-Curriculum_Vitikka-et-al.-2011.pdf

Wolf, P. Hill, A. Evers, F. (2006). Handbook for Curriculum Assessment. Retrieved from https://ctlt.ubc.ca/files/2010/08/HbonCurriculumAssmt.pdf

Yeung, S., Lam, J., Leung, A., & Lo, Y. (2012). Curriculum Change and Innovation. Aberdeen, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press. Retrieved from www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt1xwfn8

Young, M. (2010). Curriculum Theory and the Problem of Knowledge: a Personal Journey and an Unfinished Project. In E. Malewski (Ed.). Curriculum Studies Handbook: The Next Moment. New York: Routledge.

Appendix

Appendix 1

Questionnaire

Dear Teacher,

Thank you for taking the time to answer the questions of this questionnaire.

The purpose of the questionnaire is to collect data for research purposes about the master's thesis entitled *"Kosovo Curriculum for Primary and Lower Secondary Education; Assessment of its Aims and Effectiveness in the developing English language skills".*

Your answers will serve for research on this topic and the information provided will remain anonymous.

School name:	
Level:	Primary Lower Secondary

Gender:	Male Female

Years of experience as teacher				
Up to 3	4-7	8-11	12-15	Over 15

1. How informed are you about the history of curriculum development in Kosovo?			
Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

2. Have you completed the training organized by the Ministry of Education for the implementation of the new Curriculum?	
Yes	No

3. **How aware are you of the changes that the new Curriculum has brought to the education system?**

Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

4. **How much difficulty did you encounter during the implementation of the new Curriculum?**

No difficulty at all	Slight	Moderate	High

5. **How informed are you about the goals of the new Curriculum?**

Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

6. **Do you think that the expected outcomes from the new Curriculum are in harmony with the current state of education in Kosovo?**

Yes	NO	Uncertain

7. **Do you think that the education system in Kosovo has progressed since the beginning of the implementation of the new Curriculum?**

Yes	NO	Uncertain

8. **How informed are you about the role of school according to the new Curriculum?**

Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

9. **How informed are you about the role of teacher according to the new Curriculum?**

Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

10. How informed are you about the role of the student according to the new Curriculum?

Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

11. How much do you think students are informed about the new Curriculum?

Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

12. Do you think that competency-based learning is more effective than subject-based learning?

Yes	No

13. How do the results achieved by the students match the learning outcomes according to the competencies provided by the Curriculum?

Not at all	Slightly	Considerably	Extremely

14. How do the expected outcomes from the development of competencies match your expected outcomes as a teacher?

Not at all	Slightly	Considerably	Extremely

15. How do the results achieved by the students match the learning outcomes for the curriculum areas provided by the Curriculum?

Not at all	Slightly	Considerably	Extremely

16. How do the expected outcomes from the curriculum areas match your expected outcomes as a teacher?

Not at all	Slightly	Considerably	Extremely

17. Do you think the Curriculum needs improvement?	
Yes	No
If Yes, what do you suggest:	

Appendix 2

Questionnaire

Dear Teacher,

Thank you for taking the time to answer the questions of this questionnaire.

The purpose of the questionnaire is to collect data for research purposes about the master's thesis entitled *"Kosovo Curriculum for Primary and Lower Secondary Education; Assessment of its Aims and Effectiveness in the developing English language skills".*

Your answers will serve for research on this topic and the information provided will remain anonymous.

School name:	
Level:	Primary Lower Secondary

Gender:	Male Female

Years of experience as teacher				
Up to 3	4-7	8-11	12-15	Over 15

1. How informed are you about the history of curriculum development in Kosovo?			
Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

2. Have you completed the training organized by the Ministry of Education for the implementation of the new Curriculum?	
Yes	No

3. How aware are you of the changes that the new Curriculum has brought to the education system?			
Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

4. How important do you think English language teaching is at the level of primary and lower secondary education?			
Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

5. How aware are you of the inclusion of English in the new Curriculum?			
Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

6. How much difficulty did you encounter during the implementation of the new Curriculum? 7.			
No difficulty at all	Slight	Moderate	High

7. How informed are you about the objectives of teaching English according to the new Curriculum?			
Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

8. Do you think that the teaching of English in Kosovo has progressed since the beginning of the implementation of the new Curriculum?		
Yes	No	Uncertain

9. How informed are you about the content of the competence of communication and expression which covers the teaching of English language?			
Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

10. How informed are you about the content of the curriculum area of languages and communication which covers the subject of English language?			
Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

11. How much do you think students are informed about English language teaching according to the new Curriculum?			
Not at all	Slightly	Moderately	Highly

12. Do you think competency-based learning is more effective than subject-based learning in terms of developing English language skills?		
Yes	No	Uncertain

13. How do the results achieved by the students in learning English match the expected outcomes according to the competencies provided by the Curriculum?			
Not at all	Slightly	Considerably	Extremely

14. How do the results achieved by the students in learning English match the expected outcomes for the curriculum areas provided by the Curriculum?			
Not at all	Slightly	Considerably	Extremely

15. How effective do you think the new Curriculum was in creating a new educational approach to teaching English?			
Not at all	Slightly	Considerably	Extremely

16. Do you think the Curriculum needs improvement in relation to the teaching of English?	
Yes	No
If Yes, what do you suggest:	