

UNIVERSITETI I EVROPËS JUGLINDORE УНИВЕРЗИТЕТ НА ЈУГОИСТОЧНА ЕВРОПА SOUTH EAST EUROPEAN UNIVERSITY

POST GRADUATE STUDIES – SECOND CYCLE

THESIS TITLE:

Determining the impact of B2B Supply Chain Management in Kosovo marketplace

Candidate:

Besar Spahija

Mentor:

Asst. Prof. Dr. Adrian Besimi

July, 2018

Table of Contents

1.	Intro	oduct	ion	10
	1.1.	Rese	earch field	10
	1.2.	Aim	s of the research	10
1.3. Hypothe			otheses	11
	1.4.	Imp	ortance of thesis	12
	1.5.	Stru	cture of thesis	12
2.	Liter	rature	e review	15
	2.1.	Intro	oduction	15
	2.2.	Defi	nition of main terms	16
	2.3.	E-Bu	isiness components	18
	2.4.	Supp	oly Chain Management, its processes, and challenges	20
	2.4.	1.	Supply Chain Management	20
	2.4.2	2.	Challenges of Supply Chain Management	23
	2.4.3	3.	The effects of e-Business on Supply Chain Management	25
	2.5.	E-Co	ommerce	28
	2.5.	1.	Differences between traditional Commerce and e-Commerce	29
2.5 2.5		2.	E-Commerce types	30
		3.	B2B marketplaces	31
	2.6.	Imp	act of B2B e-Commerce into trading community	38
	2.7.	B2B	e-Commerce industry in Kosovo marketplace	39
	2.7.	1.	Payment system in Kosovo marketplace	42
	2.7.	2.	Conclusion	43
3.	Met	hodo	logy	45
	3.1.	Rese	earch approach	45
	3.2.	Rese	earch methods	45
3.2. 3.3.		1.	Survey	46
		Rese	earch question	47
	3.4.	Met	hods for data collection	48
3.4.		1.	Questionnaire	48
	3.4.2	2.	Interviews	49
	3.5.	Met	hods for data analysis	49
4.	Rese	earch	findings and data analysis	51
	4.1.	Intro	oduction	51
	4.2.	Brie	f description of case study	51

	4.3.	Brief description of the questionnaire and interviews	52
	4.4.	Presentation of research finding	53
	4.4.3	1. Quantitative results from questionnaires	53
	4.4.2	2. Qualitative results from interviews	67
	4.5.	Data analysis and discussion	73
5.	Con	clusion and recommendations	78
	5.1.	Conclusion	78
	5.2.	Recommendations	81
6.	Refe	rences	82
7.	Арр	endices	91

List of Figures and Tables

Figure 2-1, shows timeline of websites indicating innovation in business model or marketing	
communications (source: Digital Business and e-Commerce management, 2015 pp.5)	15
Figure 2-2: Evolving the e-Enterprise. (Earl, 2000)	17
Figure 2-3: Components of e-Business (Terri and William, 2003)	19
Figure 2-4, shows functions of logistics, production, and SCM in a value chain (Dmitry Ivanov and	
Boris Sokolov, 2010)	21
Figure 2-5: shows enterprises adopting technologies for digital business, by size class, EU27, 2015	
(Source: Eurostat 2015)	39
Figure 2-6: Annual transaction value of electronic payment instruments (Source: CBK, 2017)	43
Figure 4-1: Enterprises according to their economic activity	54
Figure 4-2: Use of computers by enterprises	54
Figure 4-3:Use of smartphones/tablets by enterprises	55
Figure 4-4: Operating system of smartphones and tablets	55
Figure 4-5: Website of businesses	56
Figure 4-6: Website services offered by buyer enterprises	56
Figure 4-7: Did your enterprise interacted with public institutions during 2017 through internet!	57
Figure 4-8: Interaction with public institutions though internet	57
Figure 4-9: Sharing SCM information with suppliers	58
Figure 4-10: Sharing information of SCM, order of products to supplier	59
Figure 4-11: Readiness about making orders through integrated online platform	59
Figure 4-12: Hesitation of enterprises about making orders through web platforms	60
Figure 4-13: Transport organized by suppliers	60
Figure 4-14: Invoices received by buyer businesses during 2017	61
Figure 4-15: Invoices types received by buyer enterprises during 2017	61
Figure 4-16: Readiness about receiving invoices in electronic from suppliers	62
Figure 4-17: Hesitation of buyer enterprises regarding receiving electronic invoices from supplier	62
Figure 4-18: Payment made by buyer enterprises during 2017	63
Figure 4-19: Readiness about making payments through online platforms	64
Figure 4-20: Hesitation of enterprises about making online payment through website	64
Figure 4-21: Enterprises current way of processing with orders and invoices	65
Figure 4-22: Impression of enterprises regarding the advantages of B2B SCM as a platform	65
Figure 4-23: Challenges on implementation of B2B SCM in Kosovo market	66
Figure 4-24: Recommendation regarding the promotion of SCM integration among Kosovo local	
enterprises	66
Figure 4-25: The future of implementation of electronic B2B SCM in Kosovo marketplace	67
Figure 4-26: Supplier internal processes workflow through application platform	70

Table 2-1: The effects of e-business on SCM (Source: Operations Management 6th edition, Nigel	Slack,
2010)	26
Table 2-2: Benefits of e-Commerce (Source: Efraim Urban et al., 2018)	29
Table 2-3: The e-Commerce matrix with sample economic activities (Source: Murillo, 2001)	31
Table 2-4: uses of internet among enterprises in Kosovo (source: Kosovo IT Strategy, 2016)	40
Table 4-1: Presentation of research findings	52
Table 4-2: Interview procedure	53
Table 4-3: General information about enterprises	68

Declaration of original work

I certify that I am the original author of this thesis:

"DETERMINING THE IMPACT OF B2B SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT IN KOSOVO MARKETPLACE", and I hereby declare that this master thesis is my own original work, and I have not copied from other's works or from any other sources except due reference to literature, where I have faithfully acknowledged all sources used and have cited them in the reference section.

The research was done under the guidance of Mentor Prof. Dr. Adrian Besimi, and the thesis is submitted in accordance of the requirements of South East European University.

Besar Spahija

July, 2018

Declaration of proofreading

I Ukshin Ahmetaj a juridical English Language Translator and Interpreter with license number <u>Agj.nr I 78/2003</u> by affecting my signature, confirm and demonstrate the truth that the proofreading is made for master's Thesis, for the topic "**Determining the impact of B2B Supply Chain Management in Kosovo marketplace**" prepared by the candidate for master's degree: Mr Besar Spahija.

Sincerely,

Ukshin Ahmetaj

Juridical Translator and Interpreter Albanian-English and vice versa.

Ukshin S. Ahme

Acknowledgment

Studying at the South East European University, have been a great occasion for me, provided me with a considerable amount of knowledge and proficiency, which will be of great benefit on successfully continuing of my professional life.

The academic knowledge, and experience that I have achieved by attending these postgraduate studies will be of great benefit not only to me as an individual, but also to my country. Kosovo is a young and new country going through times of all-encompassing change, and it needs young and proficient professionals as crucial resources for swift development and integration.

This research study is my final work of my master studies at the South East European University. Therefore, I would like to take this opportunity to express my appreciation to all professors and assistants who taught, advised, and assisted me during all lectures.

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisor, Prof. Adrian Besimi for his confidence, guidance, and feedback provided on improving the quality of this dissertation.

I would also like to thank all the companies who participated in my research study, whose input completed this study.

Finally, I would to thank all my friends and colleagues for their support, especially my friend Berat for his positive readiness to answer me with his support and advice during the whole thesis period.

Above all, I would like to express my great appreciation to all my family, my parents, my wife and my son for their continuous support, patience, love and for encourage they all gave me during and before master studies.

Abstrakt

Përdorimi i internetit ka ndryshuar çdo gjë, mënyrën e të jetuarit, mënyrën sesi ne bashkëveprojmë, si dhe mënyrën e të bërit biznes.

Interneti poashtu ka ndryshuar mënyrën e punës dhe operimit të bizneseve. Në të njëjtën kohë, procesi i globalizimit ka kontribuar që bizneset e vogla, të mesme, dhe të mëdha të kenë mundësi të bëjnë biznes në të gjithë botën, si dhe që të ridimensionojnë strategjitë e tyre. Në ditët e sotit, të bërit biznes në mënyrë elektronike është bërë një komponent e domosdoshme për zhvillim të mëtutjeshëm të biznesit, gjithashtu dhe një katalizator për zhvillim ekonomik të vendit.

Kosova, një vend i ri me një popullsi të re dhe ekonomi të vogël, që bazohet kryesisht në tregti dhe shërbime, mund të përfitoj nga kapacitetet e pakufizuara që ofron interneti për të lidhur njerëzit dhe ndërmarrjet brenda dhe jashtë vendit.

Ky studim do të fokusohet në ndërmarrjet brenda tregut të Kosovës dhe do të shqyrtojë mundësinë e transformimit të menaxhimit të zinxhirit furnizues nga mënyra tradicionale e punës, në atë digjitale të integruar.

Në mënyrë që ndërmarrjet kosovare të implementojnë dhe të shfrytëzojnë kapacitetet dhe benefitet e menaxhimit të integruar të zinxhirit furnizues për biznese si platform e integruar, ato nevojitet që të ndryshojnë mënyrën e operimit të biznesit të tyre dhe të lëvizin në drejtimit të digjitalizimit. Poashtu këto ndërmarrje nevojitet që të kenë mbështetjen e jashtme në mënyrë që të adaptojnë më lehtë teknologjitë e reja duke i transformuar proceset e tyre.

Fusha e gastronomisë është përzgjedhur si rast studimi, për të kryer këtë hulumtim.

Duke pasur parasysh këtë, ky studim do të përcaktojë ndikimin e menaxhimit të zinxhirit furnizues si sistem i integruar në mes të bizneseve në tregun e gastronomisë, duke vlerësuar zhvillimin dhe potencialin e sistemit të teknologjise informative dhe të komunikacionit në Kosovë (TIK) për të ndihmuar këtë fushë, gatishmërinë e këtyre ndërmarrjeve që vijnë nga kjo fushë për të adaptuar mundësitë që vijnë nga të bërit biznes në mënyrë të digjitalizuar (e-Business), si dhe pengesat dhe vështirësit kryesore që mund ti ballafaqoj implementim dhe zbatimi i tij.

Abstract

The Internet changed everything, the way we live, the way we interact as well as the way we do business. It also changed the way businesses work and operate. At the same time, the process of globalization, apart from the Internet, on one hand made it possible for small, medium, and large enterprises to do business worldwide and on the other hand made multinationals re-think their strategies.

Nowadays, e-Business has increasingly become a necessary component of business strategy in the emerging economy as well as a catalyst for the economic development.

Kosovo, a young country with a young and small economy, based mainly on trade and services, can benefit from the limitless capacities that the Internet offers to connect people and enterprises worldwide. This study will focus on Kosovo enterprises and explore the feasibility of transformation of Supply Chain Management from the traditional way of working that already exists to the integrated B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform.

In order for Kosovar enterprises to implement and use the advantages of B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform, they will need to have change the system they operate and move towards e-Business. Kosovar enterprises will also need to have external support in order to adopt the new technology to turn their business into e-Business.

The gastronomy field is chosen as a case study in order to conduct the research related to transformation of B2B Supply Chain Management.

Having this in mind, this study will determine the impact of B2B Supply Chain Management in Kosovo gastronomy marketplace, by assessing the latest developments and current potential within Kosovar Information Communication Technology (ICT) to help this field, the willingness of these enterprises coming from gastronomy field to adapt to the opportunities coming from e-Business, including also the main barriers and challenges that the implementation of e-Business could face.

Абстракт

Употребувањето на Интернетот го променил начинот на живење, начинот на кој комуницираме и начинот на кој го водиме бизнесот. Интернетот исто така го промени начинот на кој бизнесите работат и функсионират. Во исто време, процесот на глобализација им овозможи на малите, средните и големите бизнеси да прават бизнис низ целиот свет, и да ги преструктуираат нивните стратегии. Деновиве, водење електронски бизнес стана неопходна компонента за понатамошен развој на бизнесот, исто така и неопходна компонента за економски развој.

Косово, нова држава со млада популација и мала економија која се базира на трговија и услуги, може да придобиије од неограницените капацитети кои ги овозможува интернетот кој ги поврзуваат луѓето и претпријатијата во и надвор од земјата.

Оваа студија ќе се фокусира на бизнесите во Косово и ќе ја испита можноста за трансформирање на менаџирање на синџирот на снабдување од традиционалната форма во дигитална начин на работење.

Со цел косовските претпријатија да ги имплементираат и искористат интегрираните можности за управување со синџирот на снабдување и придобивки како интегрирана платформа, тие треба да го променат начинот на кој го работат нивниот бизнис и да се движат кон дигитализација. Исто така, овие претпријатија треба да имаат надворешна поддршка со цел подобро да ги прилагодат своите нови технологии преку трансформирање на нивните процеси.

За да се прави ова истражување областа на гастрономијата е избрана како случај на студија.

Со оглед на ова, оваа студија ќе го одреди влијанието на управувањето со синџирот на снабдување како интегриран систем на гастрономскиот пазар преку оценување развојот и потенцијалот на системот за информатички и комуникациски технологии во Косово (ИКТ) за да им помогне на оваа област, подготвеноста на овие претпријатија кои доаѓаат од оваа област да ги приспособат можностите кои произлегуваат од интегрираниот дигитален бизнис (e-Business), и главните пречки и тешкотии кои можат да се соочат со имплементација и употреба на дигиталниот бизнес.

1. Introduction

1.1. Research field

The evolution of internet and information technology has impacted on changing people's personal and professional life (Botha et al, 2008). Nowadays, the use of internet offers tremendous opportunities towards various types of organizations to achieve their goals and objectives in more efficient and productive way.

As the biggest global entrepreneurs, like Jack Ma (Alibaba.com founder), are calling this technology transformation, a "globalization". This globalization is offering huge business advantages towards every big organization with minimum expenses, taking into account that internet services are cheap nowadays.

As Jack emphasized in his speech at Davos World Economic Forum (2018), the globalization cannot be stopped, because no one can stop trade. If trade stops, the world stops. So, globalization must become simple, must continue becoming modernized, and where everyone shall have the same opportunities.

However, there is still an essential need by a lot of small and medium worldwide enterprises, to explore these great opportunities and to adapt their business processes into this technology transformation.

This transformation which includes the automation of processes of doing business between enterprises, is made possible by the electronic marketplace. E-Marketplace model involves the platforms where buyers and sellers can meet from anywhere on the Web to transact goods and services using the internet.

Therefore, the study will focus to conduct a research in Kosovo local marketplace in gastronomy sector, in order to investigate and determine whether it is feasible for Kosovar enterprises to implement B2B Supply Chain Management through such internet marketplace platforms.

1.2. Aims of the research

Aim:

The aim of this research is to look at possible drivers and barriers to the implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform by Kosovar gastronomy enterprises. Investigation of these drivers will provide a solid ground to determine whether it is feasible

for local enterprises to implement B2B Supply Chain Management through any application platform. This research will also look to what degree the components of B2B Supply Chain Management have currently been implemented by Kosovar enterprises, and the support possibilities from ICT sector for these enterprises for the implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management through such platforms.

Objectives:

-To find out the degree of capacities that Kosovar local enterprises currently have in order to implement B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform;

-To investigate the possible drivers and barriers on implementing B2B Supply Chain Management among Kosovar enterprises in gastronomy area.

-To find out the capacities that the ICT industry in Kosovo possesses in order to support these local enterprises on implementing B2B Supply Chain Management through application platform.

1.3. Hypotheses

This research will rather try to answer the following research questions and therefore try to test the following hypothesis:

- What are the main barriers and possible drivers for adoption of B2B Supply Chain Management among Kosovar enterprises in the area of gastronomy?
- 2. To what degree the components of B2B Supply Chain Management have currently been implemented by Kosovar enterprises and the possibilities of ICT support for these enterprises?

For the purpose of conducting the research and verifying the findings, the following hypotheses will be raised, supported by additional hypotheses:

 H1. The main barriers for the adoption B2B Supply Chain Management among Kosovo local enterprises in the area of gastronomy are related to transformation from traditional way of working towards technology digitalization, including cost of implementation like planning, procuring, HW and SW development and maintenance, leak of company internal data during transactions and informal or grey trade.

- **H1a.** The possible drivers for adoption of B2B Supply Chain Management among local enterprises in the area of gastronomy are: operational cost reduction and increase of efficiency in order placement, including save on time.
- H2. There has been a low degree of implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management components among Kosovo local enterprises.
 - H2a. Therefore, a local electronic marketplace creator for B2B Supply Chain Management as platforms, are great solution for interaction between buyer and supplier enterprises with minimal investment and technology knowledge.

1.4. Importance of thesis

Based on my personal experience as the owner and operator of lounge bars for many years, I have seen the difficulties between buyers and suppliers' operations, while ordering and receiving the commodities. Also, having a professional background in ICT sector in Kosovo, I am aware of the benefits that a B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform can bring to the enterprises, and Kosovo economy in general.

Taking in consideration all these inputs and facts, I want to conduct this research and determine amongst other things, the barriers and drivers on implementing B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform among Kosovo local enterprises in the field of gastronomy.

When completed, this research will provide a great input to these enterprises involved in gastronomy sector, but also a great starting point for the rest of industries to see whether it is feasible to implement a B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform.

Ultimately, this study will also be beneficial for the Kosovo economy because of the benefits of Supply Chain Management.

1.5. Structure of thesis

This master thesis is structured based on the guidelines and rules of the South East European University which provides recommendations on the contents and the order of thesis.

It is divided into five chapters. Chapter 1 includes an introduction where the aim and objectives of the study are briefly explained. Chapter 2 provides a review of the literature used. This chapter includes a definition of main terms, followed by a literature review of e-Business components, especially Supply Chain Management as one of the main e-Business component including e-Commerce types such as B2B, where the SCM find its integration.

Further, the literature review based on academic articles, research papers and books, describe the impact of B2B Supply Chain Management into trading community, by focusing on development of this industry in Kosovo marketplace. Chapter 3 provides an explanation and justification of the formulation of the research approach, research methods, including methods for data collection and data analysis in order to assess the objective of the research. While, chapter 4 presents and discusses briefly data obtained from qualitative and quantitative research methods and reflects on the objectives of this research.

Finally, chapter 5 concludes the thesis by answering the research questions and test the hypothesis, as well provides relevant recommendations.



2. Literature review

2.1. Introduction

The past fifty years have witnessed an enormous growth in world economy. This enormous growth is a result of a combination of many factors, such as innovation and entrepreneurial business. As Ramzan (2004) argued, a major role and a driver of this growth was the rapid development of Information Communications Technology (ICT). The development of ICT has become the foundation of all sectors of economy where businesses are the ones to profit the most.

Organizations have now been applying technologies based on the internet, world wide web and wireless communications to transform their businesses for over 20 years since the creation of the first website - <u>http://info.cern.ch</u> - by Sir Tim Berners – Lee in 1991.

The development of these digital technologies has offered many opportunities for innovative businesses to transform their services (Dave Chaffey, 2015). Enterprises today aim at changing the way of doing business moving forwards on digital business.

Year founded	Company/site	Category of innovation and business model	
1994	Amazon	Retailer	
1995 (March)	Yahoo! (yahoo.com)	Directory and portal	
1995 (Sept)	eBay	Online auction	
1995 (Dec)	AltaVista (altavista.com)	Search engine	
1996	Hotmail (hotmail.com)	Web-based email Viral marketing (using email signatures to promote service) Purchased by Microsoft in 1997	
1996	GoTo.com (goto.com) Overture (2001)	Pay-per-click search marketing Purchased by Yahool in 2003	
1996	Google (google.com)	Search engine	
1999	Blogger (blogger.com)	Blog publishing platform Purchased by Google in 2003	
1999	Alibaba (alibaba.com)	B2B marketplace with \$1.7 billion IPO on Hong Kong stock exchange in 2007 (see case in Chapter 7)	
1999	MySpace (myspace.com) Formerly eUniverse	Social network Purchased by News Corp. in 2005	
2001	Wikipedia (wikipedia.com)	Open encyclopaedia	
2002	Lastim	A UK-based Internet radio and music community website, founded in 2002	
2003	Skype (skype.com)	Peer-to-peer Internet telephony VoIP – Voice over Internet Protocol Purchased by eBay in 2005	
2003	Second Life (secondlife.com)	Immersive virtual world	
2004	Facebook (facebook.com)	Social network applications and groups	
2005	YouTube (youtube.com)	Video sharing and rating	
2009	Foursquare (foursquare.com)	A location-based social media website designed for mobile access.	
2011	Pinterest	Social network offering image sharing	
2014	Google Glass	An example of a wearable computing device	
??	The future	??	

Figure 2-1, shows timeline of websites indicating innovation in business model or marketing communications (source: Digital Business and e-Commerce management, 2015 pp.5)

The digital business ensures enhancement the competitiveness of organizations by deploying innovative digital technologies throughout an organization and beyond, through links to partners and customers and promotion through digital media. As it is further explained by Dave Chaffey (2015), this digital transformation helps also to automate existing processes by applying technology which ensures to add value to the business and its customers. To successfully manage a digital business, a wide of knowledge of different business processes and activities from across the value chain is needed, such as marketing and sales, through new product development, manufacturing, and inbound and outbound logistics (Dave Chaffey, 2015). In order to embrace these new processes and technology, organizations are required to manage the change from what have traditionally been support activities such as human resources management.

From this definition, it is apparent that digital business involves looking at how electronic communications can be used to enhance all aspects of an organization's supply chain management (Dave Chaffey, 2015).

As ICT develops, new terms are emerging in order to describe the processes and technologies of this development. Therefore, firstly it is needed to define the main terms used in ICT and then to review the existing articles, theories, and research on e-Commerce.

2.2. Definition of main terms

- e-Commerce and e-Business

E-commerce and e-Business have increasingly become a necessary component of business strategy in the emerging economy as well as a catalyst for the economic development. Even though digital business and e-Commerce mainly are the same, both terms are applied in

variety of ways.

In e-Commerce, as described by Anjaly Gypta (2014), information and communications technology are used in inter-business or inter-organizational transactions, means transactions between and among organizations, and transactions between organizations and individuals.

On other hand e-Business, includes any process that a business organization conduct over a computer-mediated network. It is about how businesses apply digital technology and media to improve the competitiveness of their organization through optimizing internal processes with online and traditional channels to market and supply (Anjaly Gypta, 2014).

While terms, e-Commerce and e-Business according to below references are described even on earlier years.

Kalkota and Whinston (1997), define e-Commerce as the buying and selling of information, products and services via computer networks, where the computer networks primary being the Internet. In addition, Davis (2003) declares that e-Commerce constitutes the exchange of products and services between businesses, groups and individuals. While Gunsekaran and Ngai (2005) stated that e-Commerce has significantly transformed the way in which companies do business and that they can use it to gain business benefits, opportunities, and competitive advantage.

While Earl (2000) has investigated the transformation of an enterprise into an e-enterprise, stating that in order for an enterprise to become an e-enterprise it has to evolve through six stages of progression. Starting with external communication through the homepage, internal communication through intranet, to go to stage three of buying or selling online as defined above as e-Commerce and then adding key capabilities to become e-Business while the fifth stage goes through information literacy and continuous learning to conclude with the transformation and changes using ICT.



Figure 2-2: Evolving the e-Enterprise. (Earl, 2000)

E-Business according to OECD (2008) is the process of business automatization (both within and outside the company) over networks supported by computers. While a broader definition of e-Business is provided by (Craig, 2000; Graaf & Muurling, 2003) who argue that the term e-Business covers all business processes which also include e-Commerce.

According to Lancioni et al., (2000), the use of the internet and e-Business potentially leads to cost reduction and service improvement in several operating fields including transportation, inventories, purchasing customer service, order processing and supplier operations.

This is further elaborated by Bartels (2000) stating that e-Business includes additional operations that are handled within the business itself, such as: production, development, corporate infrastructure, and product management. However, in order for organizations to implement e-Commerce and e-Business they are required to completely change the business structure, including management processes, culture and the way they manage their employees (Laudon and Traver, 2003; Chaffy, 2004).

Scholars also argue that e-Business may lead in achieving sensible advantage by adding value to organizations (Amit & Zott, 2001), while Rodgers et al. (2002) goes even further to argue that companies attempting to be competitive can barely manage without e-Business.

Although, terms of e-Commerce and e-Business tend to be used interchangeably, from the above definitions, one could conclude that e-Commerce is a subset of e-Business, because commerce is a core business process.

2.3. E-Business components

There are eight e-Business components: 1) Business intelligence; 2) Customer relationship management; 3) Supply chain management; 4) Enterprise resource planning; 5) e-Commerce; 6) Online activities between businesses; 7) Collaboration; and, 8) Electronic transfer within companies (Turban et al., 2009). These components are illustrated in figure 2.2 and explained below.



Figure 2-3: Components of e-Business (Terri and William, 2003)

- Business Intelligence (BI)

According to Robert (2003) "Information is one of the most important assets of an organization" (p.51). Having said that, businesses need to have the right information at the right time and available for the right people in order to transform the information into decisions, and decisions to actions and possibly gain competitive advantage (Green, 2007). The information that is relevant to businesses to make the right decision may come from anywhere (Suchanek, 2010).

In order to have the right information at the right time, businesses have to collect, store, access and analyse information about its market or competition, and they do this through Business Intelligence (BI), (IBM, 2002). While the role of business intelligence is also to extract the information deemed essential to the business by presenting or manipulating the data into information, useful for managerial decision (Kumar et al., 2013).

Business intelligence among other benefits can help companies enhance relationships with customers and suppliers, manage risk better, create worthwhile offerings and improve profitability of products and services.

- Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP)

ERP is a package business software system that allows business to automate and integrate the majority of its business processes and share the common data and practices across the entire enterprise (Seddon, Shanks & Willcocks, 2003). By integrating the majority of business processes, ERP system collects the data for analysis and transforms them into useful information to support the decision making of businesses (Nah, 2002). According to Annamalai (2011) the main benefits of ERP to business are *operational* (automation), *managerial* (better use of data, manage production, manpower, inventory and physical resources as well as monitoring and control of financial performance), *strategic* (system's ability to support growth), *IT* (reduction of maintenance cost) and *organizational* (higher employee satisfaction) processes.

- Customer Relationship Management (CRM)

Keeping customers satisfied is the overall goal of businesses globally. In order to achieve this, organizations need to identify, understand, anticipate and satisfy customer needs, while CRM is about managing customer knowledge to better understand and serve them and their needs (Bose & Sugamaran, 2003). Generally, it provides the structure of how the relationships with

customers will be developed and maintained (Douglas M. Lambert, 2001). The satisfied customers are an important asset to organization who are likely to be a source of word-of-mouth referrals and are more resistant to competitor's offers (Fournier, 1998). CRM is a service approach that focuses on identifying trends and patterns of customers by collecting data from every possible interaction with the customer (Ciszewski, 2001). It also focusses on building long-term and sustainable customer relations that add value to the company (Efraim et al., 2008).

Additionally, another important component of e-Business is the Supply Chain Management. A deeper description of the concept of the Supply Chain Management – one of the main objectives of this research, together with other supply chain processes will be elaborated below.

2.4. Supply Chain Management, its processes, and challenges

2.4.1. Supply Chain Management

The term Supply Chain Management (SCM), first appearing in 1982 (Oliver and Weber, 1982), was used to describe the connection of logistic operations with other functions. This term was used later as well by Houlihan (1988), to describe the connections between logistics and internal functions and external organizations (Ellram and Cooper, 2014).

While the development of SCM was driven in the 1990s by three main trends: customer orientation, markets globalization and establishing an information society. These trends caused changes in enterprise competitive strategies and required new adequate value chain management concepts (Dmitry Ivanov et. al, 2018).

Supply Chain consists of all activities associated with the flow and transformation of goods from raw materials to end customers. According to Ganeshan and Harrison (1995), a supply chain is a network of facilities and distribution options that performs the function of procurement of materials, transformation of these materials into intermediate and finished products, and the distribution of these finished products to customers.

In order to maintain the existing and attract new customers businesses, among other things, have to reduce the operational costs. Supply Chain Management deals with inter-company business processes that involve improving the efficiency (and reducing cost) of interactions with suppliers, customers, partners, and distributors. The goal of Supply Chain Management is to create a fast, efficient, and low-cost network of business relationships, or supply chain, to get a company's products from concept to market (Militaru, 2008).

Supply chain structure as argued by Damiani et al. (2010) consists of suppliers, producers, distributors, retailers, and customers and they are all interconnected by material, financial, information and decisional flows while the flow and sharing information as argued by Lee et al. (2000) significantly benefits the overall performance of the supply network, and the business itself. Later, Yang (2012) argues that the SCM in e-Business directly links the customers to the network that has influence in satisfying the customer's needs and also contributes to managing relationships with customers.

So, Supply Chain Management seeks to enhance competitive performance by closely integrating the internal-functions within an enterprise, and effectively linking them with the operations of suppliers, customers, and other supply chain members to be successful (Otchere et al., 2013). Therefore, according to all these facts, it is evident that implementation of Supply Chain Management in e-Business directly reduce the operational and purchasing costs and improve the overall operating performance.

The picture below shows that SCM is one of the key components of any organization and is responsible for balancing demand and supply along the entire value-adding chain.



Figure 2-4, Functions of logistics, production, and Supply Chain Management in a value chain (Dmitry Ivanov and Boris Sokolov, 2010)

It is important to mention that successful Supply Chain Management can be realized only if members of a supply chain work together on the basis of collaborative mutual beneficial relationships. This process requires a change from managing individual functions to integrating activities into key Supply Chain Management processes (Dave Chaffey, 2015).

Finally, Supply Chain Management involves the coordination of all supply activities of an organization from its supplier and delivery of products to its customers (Anjaly Gypta, 2014). It shows that it has a positive impact on business performance and it provides benefits to the business such as information sharing, cost effectiveness, sustainable competitive advantage, customer satisfaction, business process modelling, financial performance, and others (AlSagheer et.al., 2011).

According to Douglas M. Lambert (2001) paper, the key supply chain processes identified by members of The Global Supply Chain Forum except CRM and SCM already described above, are:

- Customer service management;
- Demand management;
- Order fulfillment;
- Manufacturing flow management;
- Supplier relationship management;
- Product development and commercialization; and
- Returns management.

- Customer Service Management (CSM)

Customer service management consists on supplier's goodwill to the customer. Customer service provides the customer with real-time information on promised shipping dates and product availability through interfaces with the supplier's functions such as manufacturing and logistic (Douglas M. Lambert, 2001).

- Demand Management (DM)

Demand management is the supply chain management process that balances the customers' requirements with the capabilities of the supply chain. With the right process in place, management can match supply with demand proactively and execute the plan with minimal disruptions. The process is not limited to forecasting. It includes synchronizing supply and

demand, increasing flexibility, and reducing variability. A good demand management system uses point-of-sale and "key" customer data to reduce uncertainty and provide efficient flows throughout the supply chain (Douglas M. Lambert, 2001).

- Order Fulfilment (OF)

Order fulfillment process - except filling orders - involves all other activities in order to define customer requirement and to design a network and a process that permits a supplier to meet customer requests while minimizing the total delivered cost as well as filling customer orders (Douglas M. Lambert, 2001).

- Supplier relationship management (SRM)

Supplier relationship management is the vice versa process of CRM, it explains how a customer company interacts with its supplier. Just as a company needs to develop relationships with its customers, it also needs to foster relationships with its suppliers. As in the case of customer relationship management, a company will forge close relationships with a small subset of its suppliers and manage arm-length relationships with others. Finally, the desired outcome is a win-win relationship where both parties benefit. (Douglas M. Lambert, 2001).

2.4.2. Challenges of Supply Chain Management

There are a couple of important challenges on Supply Chain Management existing at the companies that should be considered and managed:

- Globalization

Companies are facing big challenges how to reduce their supply chain cost, in order to satisfy customers price expectations. From this point of view, David Berrios (2014), has emphasized in his article that companies have undertaken some action which consists on:

- ✓ Reduction in paperwork through electronic invoices and delivering notes;
- ✓ Reduced of unnecessary inventory through better understanding of demand;
- ✓ Reduced time for information and component supply across the supply chain, and
- Companies have as well opted to relocate manufacturing at low cost countries around the world in an effort to reduce direct and indirect costs and to minimize taxes.

It should be taken into account that customers not only want lower prices, but they also want their products on time. To be able to avoid failing the delivery of products on time or lack of items on shelf in retailer, supplier companies should become responsible for item availability, for instance to control it through vendor managed inventory.

- Customer preferences

There is all the time present a pressure from customers to companies, after a product is released, to come up with the next big thing.

Innovation is important since it allows companies to stay competitive in the market, but it's also a challenge. To enhance a product, companies must redesign their supply network and meet market demand in a way that's transparent for customers (David Berrios, 2014).

- Supply chain network design

One aspect that has been considered in (integrated) supply chain planning concerns postponement decisions, refers to the possibility of not filling customer demands on time. As a result, backorders are generated that incur penalty costs. This issue was explicitly integrated with strategic decisions (Wilhelm et al., 2005). A support productive point here could be sharing of demand by customers with suppliers as part of efficient consumer response (ECR). Clearly, more research is needed on this aspect, whose relevance has been raised by Supply Chain Management.

Information sharing

Information sharing is another challenge in a supply chain which faces several hurdles. The first challenge is that of aligning incentives of different partners. It would be naive of a partner to think that information sharing, and cooperation will automatically increase his or her profit. In fact, each partner is wary of the possibility of other partners abusing information and reaping all the benefits from information sharing (Bala, 2014).

Another concern associated with information sharing, is the confidentiality of information shared. Suppose, for example, that a supplier supplies a critical part to two manufacturers who compete in the final product market. Either manufacturer would not share information (like sales data) with the supplier unless it is guaranteed that the information is not leaked to the other manufacturer. But the situation becomes tricky if the supplier and one of the two manufacturers are the same company. (Bala, 2014)

Note also that information sharing in certain settings can be a subject of antitrust regulations. Suppose that two retailers regularly share with the supplier their demand projection for the next ten weeks. The projection by one retailer may implicitly signal the plan of a sales/promotion campaign in some future week. When this information is relayed to the other

retailer through the supplier, it may be potentially used as price fixing instrument between the two retailers.

Finally, we should note that information sharing is only an enabler for better coordination and planning of the supply chain (Bala, 2014). Hence, companies must develop capabilities to utilize the shared information in an effective way.

- Market growth

Another important factor is the pursuit of new customers. There is a significant cost of a developing a product, from research and development to product introduction. Therefore, companies aim to expand their distribution to emerging markets in order to grow revenues and increase market share. Except own home market, companies today are trying to expand as well in foreign markets. The introduction to new market faced difficulties due to trading policies, fees, and government policies.

Customers expectation nowadays are more demanding than ever. In order to respond with global networks, product innovation and market expansion, companies now are focused on supply chain managers to optimize their value chains in order to stay competitive.

2.4.3. The effects of e-Business on Supply Chain Management

E-Business has tremendously transformed the Supply Chain Management practice because through e-Business the information is provided better and faster to all stages in supply chain. The term e-Business is commonly used to describe the planning and execution of front-end and back-end operations in a supply chain using the internet (Aliza Knox, 2005). Without appropriate information, supply chain managers cannot make the decisions that coordinate activities and flows through the chain.

Recently, companies have moved to web-based business-to-business (B2B) platforms promoting efficiency and speed. The need to implement e-Business technologies has grown significantly in business in general, and in strategic and operational supply management in particular.

Companies are increasingly recognizing the need to implement e-Business technologies, and as Wiengarten et al. (2011) state, companies are continuously investing and implementing e-Business applications to streamline their business processes through integrating and coordinating their supply chain processes. Johnson et al., (2007) state that there has been a crucial managerial interest in seeking such opportunities in the supply chain in order to create competitive advantage.

Caniato et al. (2009) have stated that internet-based tools are spreading across enterprises in different industries and contexts, reorganizing Supply Chain Management strategies and practices.

Even though it is highlighted by Croom (2005), De Boer et al., (2002), and Kritchanchai (2012), the role of varying e-Business tools in the improvement process of supply chains, nevertheless the key evidence concerning the global changes caused by e-Business is still lacking.

Table below summarizes some of the effects of e-Business on three important aspects of supply chain management – business and market information sharing, product and service flow, and the cash flow that comes as a result of product and service flow (Nigel Slack et al., 2010).

	Market/sales information flow	Product/service flow	Cash flow
Supply chain related activities	Understanding customers' needs; Designing appropriate products or services; Demand forecasting;	Purchasing; Inventory management; Waiting times; Distribution;	Supplier payments; Customer invoicing; Customer receipts;
Beneficial effects of e-Business practices	Better customer relationship management; Monitoring real-time demand; On-line customization; Ability to coordinate output with demand;	Lower purchasing administration costs; Better purchasing deals; Reduced bullwhip effect; Reduced inventory; More efficient distribution;	Faster movement of cash; Automated cash movement; Integration of financial Information, sales and operations activities:

 Table 2-1: The effects of e-business on Supply Chain Management (Source: Operations Management

 6th edition, Nigel Slack, 2010)

A survey research conducted by Anni-Kaisa K. et al., (2013), about the key role of e-Business in Supply Chain Management among enterprises indicated two main targets: savings in costs and time, and process development and business change. The same targets were also matched previously by other researchers described above, as well the same is identified by Giunipero and Sawchuck, (2000), Subramaniam and Shaw, (2004), who stated that saving in costs and time are main targets of e-Business utilization in supply management. The bargaining power of enterprises is also another target that is strengthened by the use of e-Business in supply management (Anni-Kaisa K. et al., 2013). Hence, the bargaining position between buyers and suppliers are strategically significant and have a significant impact on buyer-supplier relationships.

According to Porter (2001), the supplier is powerful, for example, when a few companies dominate the market and the product is unique, while in the other side, the buyer is powerful when purchases are of large volume, and the products are standard.

The implementation of e-Business affects not only the bargaining position and power but also the competitive positions of companies. As Porter (2001) articulated as well, the internet reduces differences among competitors, increase the geographic market and decrease variable costs. Furthermore, e-Business technologies reduce barriers to entry due to the elimination of the need for physical assets.

The literature review has shown that bargaining positions between buyers and suppliers have a strategic role in supply management. As e-Business has expanded the market, buyers are able to carry out transactions globally and the number of available suppliers and products has increased remarkably, which is one of the reasons why the market power of buyers has increased. This customer growth in e-Business marketplace influence directly to the benefits of suppliers also. However, it is reported in several researches (Porter, 2001), that e-Business has changed bargaining power in favor of the buyer more than the supplier.

The implementation of e-Business also affects companies' competitive positions. The research indicates that the change in competitive position has been to the benefit of substitutes rather than new entrants. e-Business makes it much easier for buyers to access information concerning substitute suppliers and products, and hence the substitutes are more easily found and utilized.

It could be concluded that e-Business has significantly influenced supply management and supply processes in companies. It has also affected their bargaining and competitive positions in chains, networks, and industries.

According to Johnson et al. (2007), the potential benefits of e-Business technologies include lower prices from suppliers, improved speed and flexibility, lower transaction costs, higher customer-service levels, and reduced investment in supply-chain inventories.

2.5. E-Commerce

As abovementioned, e-Commerce can be conducted in an electronic market (e-marketplace), an online location where buyers and sellers conduct commercial transactions such as selling goods, services, or information (Efraim Turban et al., 2018).

As it is described by Efraim Turban et al., (2018) in his book that the electronic markets are connected to sellers and buyers through the Internet or to its counterpart within organizations, an *intranet*. An intranet is an organization internal network that uses Internet tools, such as Web browsers and Internet protocols. Another computer environment is an *extranet*, a network that uses Internet technology to link intranets of several organizations in a secure manner.

It is clearly evident that e-Commerce is huge and constantly growing as marketplace. According to European B2C E-commerce Report (2015), during 2015 the turnover of the European e-commerce increased by 14.3% to 423.8 billion Euros. There were 331 million e-shoppers and an estimated amount of more than 715,000 online businesses. This tremendous success is the result of many benefits that e-Commerce is providing towards global community. As stated by Efraim Turban et al., (2018), these benefits described in table below are organized in three categories: benefits to *organizations, individual customers,* and *society*:

Benefits	Description	
Benefits to Organizations		
Global reach	Quickly locating customers and business	
	partners at reasonable cost worldwide.	
Cost reduction	Lower cost of information processing, storage,	
	and distribution.	
Facilitate problem-solving	Solve complex problems that have remained	
	unsolved.	
Supply chain improvements	Reduce delays, inventories, and cost.	
Business always open	Open 24/7/365; no overtime or other costs.	
Lower inventories	Using customization inventories can be	
	minimized.	
Lower cost of distributing digitizable product	Delivery online can be 90% cheaper; save	
	paperwork.	
Provide competitive advantage	Lower prices, better service, improve brand	
	image.	
Benefits to consumers		
Availability	Huge selection to choose from (vendor,	
	products, information styles).	
Ubiquity	Can shop any time from any place.	
Find bargains	Use comparison engine; pay less.	
Real-time delivery	Download digital products quickly.	

No sales tax	Sometimes; changing.	
Enable telecommuting	Can work or study at home or any place.	
Social interaction and engagement	In social networks, get reviews,	
	recommendations.	
Find unique items	Using online auctions, collectible items can be	
	found.	
Benefits to society		
Enable telecommuting	Facilitate work at home; less traffic, pollution.	
More and better public services	Provided by e-government (e.g., e-health).	
Close the digital divide	Allow people in rural areas and developing	
	countries to use more services and purchase	
	what they really like.	
Home shipping	Less travel, air pollution.	

Table 2-2: Benefits of e-Commerce (Source: Efraim Urban et al., 2018)

These benefits may result on obvious changes in the way business is conducted. Such changes may positively impact corporate operations resulting in a competitive advantage for the enterprises using e-Commerce (Efraim Turban et al., 2018).

2.5.1. Differences between traditional Commerce and e-Commerce

As articulated by Surbhi S. (2016), gone are the days since the commercial activities like the exchange of goods and services for money, between parties, takes place only in the traditional mode, i.e. the customer has to go to the store, look at the variety of products, choose the required stuff and the purchasing of them. With the advent of e-Commerce, people can buy goods, pay bills, or transfer money in just one click.

Even though many people still prefer doing business through traditional commerce, due to their hesitation that the e-Commerce is not safe, this is just a myth.

It is evident that both modes have their advantages and disadvantages, as well there are many differences between traditional commerce and e-Commerce, therefore the following points are important to be considered so far as this difference is concerned (Surbhi S. 2016):

- Part of business, that focuses on the exchange of products and services, and includes all those activities which encourage exchange, could be considered as traditional commerce, while e-Commerce means carrying out commercial transactions or exchange of information, in electronic way through internet.
- In traditional commerce, the transactions are processed manually whereas, in the case of e-Commerce, the processes of transactions are automated.

- In traditional commerce, the payments of exchange of goods and services, can be proceeded only during working hours. On the other hand, in e-Commerce, the buying and selling of goods can occur at any time 24/7/365.
- One of the major challenges of e-Commerce is that the customers cannot physically inspect the goods before purchase, however, if customers do not like the goods after delivery they can return it within the stipulated time. Conversely, in traditional commerce physical inspection of goods is possible.
- Traditional commerce is concerned with the supply side. In contrast, the resource focus of e-Commerce is the demand side.
- Payment for transactions can be done by paying cash or via transfers, while, payment in e-Commerce transactions can be done through integrated online payment gateway.

2.5.2. E-Commerce types

As it is already concluded that e-Commerce is a subset of e-Business, according to the literature, there are four main identifies types of e-Commerce: B2B, B2C, C2B and C2C. There are three more types of e-Commerce that are identified as important, especially for the developed Information Societies and they are G2B, G2C, M-Commerce.

B2B – **Business-to-business** - where businesses focus is on selling to other businesses or organizations (Laudon and Carol 2014). While (Aljifri et al., 2003) considered it to be the largest form of e-trade in terms of volume, (Forbes, 2014) foresees the B2B e-Commerce market to be worth \$6.7 trillion by 2020.

B2C – **Business-to-customers** – it is the earliest form of e-Commerce that refers to the transaction of retail sales between businesses and individuals (Pavlou & Fygenson, 2006).

C2B – **Customers-to-businesses** –refers to private individuals who use the internet to sell products or services to organizations (Efraim, 2008).

C2C – Customer-to-customer – refers to individuals who sell products (or services) to other individuals. (Efraim, 2003).

There are also two other models involving governmental services to both businesses and individuals and vice-versa (Murillo, 2001) that include **G2B** – Government – to – business and **G2C** – Government – to – citizens, which include online services such as collection of different fees and taxes.

M-Commerce – Mobile Commerce - When e-Commerce is done in a wireless environment, such as using cell phones to access the Internet, this is referred to as m-commerce (Tarasewich et al., 2001).

A matrix which provides a quick view of e-Commerce models with sample economic activities is shown below:

	Business	Consumer	Government
Business	B2B	B2C	B2G
	Supply chain; Wholesalers	Retailers (Goods or services)	Contract bidding; Privatization
Consumer	C2B	C2C	C2G
	Public bidding	Public flea markets	Public gov. auctions
	marketplace; Auctioneers		
Government	G2B	G2C	G2G
	Tax and fees collection	Tax and fees collections	Budget allocation

Table 2-3: The e-Commerce matrix with sample economic activities (Source: Murillo, 2001)

2.5.3. B2B marketplaces

B2B as abovementioned, is simply defined as e-Commerce between enterprises, that deals with relationships between and among businesses.

Today, B2B marketplaces are mainly classified in three models, depending on who controls the marketplace: the buyer, the supplier or the intermediary.

- First, the supplier-oriented marketplace, where few sellers deal with many buyers,
- Second, the **buyer-oriented marketplace**, in which few buyers dominate the relationship with many sellers, and
- Third, the **intermediary-oriented marketplace**, where an independent party coordinates the relationship between sellers and buyers.

There exists also other B2B models which are virtual corporation, networking between the headquarters and subsidiaries and online services to business.

Since the gastronomy field in Kosovo is chosen as the case study of this research, it will define as well, if any of these three types would be the most appropriate marketplace model to be implemented in Kosovo local gastronomy B2B Supply Chain Management.

Supplier-oriented marketplace provide a wide spectrum of products and services to a group of customers and also support them in their own business. As argued by Birger G. (2002), successful examples of this business model are companies like DELL, CISCO and thousands of other companies.

While this method, according to Birger G. (2002), has also its obstacles when it comes to buyers' point of view. Because buyers would have to search for products and compare

suppliers, and this would be very costly and time consuming for big buyers. As a result, such big buyers prefer to create their own marketplace, which is defined as buyer-oriented marketplace.

By supporting transactions and procurement processes, these marketplaces offer great potentials in cost savings. For this model, more dominant buyer is the industrial sector.

Intermediary-oriented marketplace as business model is established by intermediary company who as a marketplace creator attracts both buyers and suppliers to engage into transaction activities over the online platform.

Birger G. (2002), stated that there are two types of intermediary-oriented marketplaces: horizontal and vertical marketplaces.

Vertical marketplaces are concentrate in a specific sector whereas horizontal marketplaces offer services for different types sectors.

The profits of intermediary company come through provisions for successful transactions and for negotiation of services (e.g a logistical Company to deliver the products). The company can also charge fees for membership and for presenting information, offers or requests. Another profit can be generated by advertising (Birger G., 2002).

- Advantages of B2B e-Commerce

Since Business-to-business (B2B) marketplaces bring businesses together to enable online wholesale purchases, distributions, imports, exports and other commercial transactions, there are several benefits for the buyers and sellers when using B2B e-Commerce marketplaces, and some of the are articulated below:

• Cost reduction on purchasing:

According to the Swedish Trade Council (Sammy El Ghazaly, 2005), companies that have adapted B2B e-Commerce solutions have reported cost savings on waste and supplier's margins up to 15% and retrieving price transparency on the market.

Lower transaction cost:

According to the Vsourz, B2B marketplaces include standardization and automation of the agreement, paying/receiving and ordering processes which help on reducing transaction costs.

Marketplaces allow business to analyze their transactions data, enabling sellers to better match their products and services, which affect to fit customers' needs.

The advantages of B2B marketplaces for buyers are mainly focused on the increase of efficiency and the reduction on costs. By decreasing manual processes, cycle times between order and fulfilment, buyers can easily increase the efficiency of their procurement.

• Increase efficiency:

Automated procurement processes and workflows allow companies to increase the efficiency of their supply chain.

• Monitor Enterprise spending:

B2B marketplace solutions enable business to gather information about their buying models, allowing the improvement of resources and the reduction of corporate spending. Through this the suppliers find a way to better provide the needs of their customers (El Ghazaly, 2005).

- Barriers of B2B e-Commerce

While there are advantages to B2B, there are also some identified barriers that business have been faced with and which shall be tackled in order to be successful when implementing an e-Commerce platform solution at the Company, some of these challenges are articulated below:

o Strategic change

A change in a firm's business system can be an evolutionary (operational) or a revolutionary (strategic) process. A balance of the both is desirable and necessary. Resistance to changes can among others depend on psychological and cultural reasons. Psychological reasons are when many people resist to changes due to them becoming fixed to organizational routines and them establishing certain habits. Cultural resistance is when a firm carries on a number of out of date assumptions about the market, typically when they surrounded by others with the same inconsistent certainty. In these two cases, it can be necessary to make a revolutionary change in the firm (El Ghazaly, 2005).

There are many success stories where companies have used e-Commerce and been able to find new markets, reduce costs, etc. Yet SMEs are not convinced that their business would benefit from using e-Commerce. Common barriers for such resistance are due to lack of motivation on changing traditional business strategies, methods and technologies. SMEs are mainly concerned with surviving and spend little time on developing new strategies. They are not familiar with the opportunities available through e-Commerce.

The e-Europe (European Information society) view is that SMEs are more flexible in their internal organization than larger companies and can more efficiently adapt to the change of

market conditions. Furthermore e-Europe states that particularly SMEs have good benefits in e-Commerce because they normally find it difficult to trade beyond their country (Sammy El Ghazaly, 2005).

Costs and Financing of Implementing e-Commerce

Costs of implementing e-Commerce can be a serious barrier for SMEs. Costs include planning, procuring hardware and software, maintenance, and telecommunications charges.

When deciding whether it is a good idea to purchase such solutions, firms should make a return-on-investment analysis. The analysis should consider the value and importance of trade partners that already are members of the e-marketplace and the long-term benefits of joining the e-marketplace. Long-term benefits can for example be reducing product cycle times, lowering inventory levels and increasing trade volumes (Sammy El Ghazaly, 2005).

Yet, an obstacle for such an analysis is that it can be difficult to understand commercial benefits of the e-marketplace and therefore hard to calculate the return-on-investment. SMEs often have limited resources and need to see a significant return before deciding on using e-Commerce.

There are numerous e-Commerce solutions that involved low implementation costs in hardware and software and therefore they should be considered when return-on-investment analysis is conducted.

Integration into marketplace

Each business has its own specificities of doing business and therefore it is often hard to integrate those specifies into the e-marketplace. Although this may be difficult, in most cases it can be achieved by simplifying internal processes to reduce internal costs and be able to be integrated into e-marketplace for a greater gain and reaching the bigger market.

• Security and regulations

Security aspects such as impact of hacker attacks, thefts of business information and funds as well as dishonest transactions and conflicts makes companies skeptical on using emarketplaces.

In order to reduce security threats, it is recommended to check if the e-marketplace verifies the memberships, publishes members past successful engagements or recent testimonials and includes a security certification. In order for the security not to be an issue, there are certain tools that SMEs can use in order to be sure of their transaction.

Technology

New technologies often emerge and companies that choose to build a certain e-Commerce platform, will lose out if new standards are adopted. SMEs usually do not have the resources to implement such a platform but must often follow the technology and business standards set by their major clients. They can hence limit themselves to a certain technology not used by their other clients. Although, the solution to this may be that they use the same platform as their major clients and just update them in order to meet their clients demands.

• Supplier issues

Some type of e-marketplaces benefit buyers more than suppliers and price transparency is not always acceptable for suppliers. Other suppliers are not convinced on sharing inventory and capacity information in believe that it will cost them sales. Further B2B e-marketplaces reduce the direct relationships that sellers had with their customers. Many suppliers have therefore avoided such types of e-marketplaces (The McKinsey, 2001).

As a conclusion, by considering the potential benefits and barriers to being in B2B emarketplace, the businesses need to find that right match of e-marketplace for their business purposes in order to gain as much as possible from e-marketplace. This is not an easy task for businesses but in doing so, they will be able to reduce the mentioned barriers and enhance company earnings.

- Payment System

Improvements of payment processes during the last 10 years, have increase the efficiency in B2B Supply Chain Management. During this period of time, as a result the business-tobusiness payment system has seen a corresponding increase in efficiency, through the availability of automated payment programs from different organizations such as Visa. Therefore, in e-Commerce industry, there are three mainly payment processing options:

- Internet merchant account,
- Third party payment processing feature, and
- Manual (offline) payment processing.

The internet merchant account is an account issued by a financial institution that enables businesses to make payments transactions through e-banking by integrating a payment gateway, with any credit cards (Visa and Mastercard).
Third party payment services offer an alternative to obtaining an Internet Merchant Account. The advantage of this alternative is that it is possible to start selling online more quickly and easily. There are registrations, transaction, and monthly fees attached. There may also be a longer holdback period before the balance of a sale is turned over to the merchant.

According to Wikipedia (www.wikipedia.org), PayPal (www.paypal.com) is the most popular third-party online service provider. According to www.canadaone.com small businesses use third-party credit card processing companies such as PayPal (www.paypal.com), CCNow, (www.ccnow.com) PsiGate (www.Psigate.com), Beanstream (www.beanstream.com) and InternetSecure (www.internetsecure.com).

Both PayPal and merchant accounts charge transaction fees, including a percentage of the sale plus a flat fee per transaction. Charges based on the number of transactions may be appropriate for micro businesses or where the number of transactions is limited.

The manual payment processing method consists on processing credit cards manually rather than rely on online payment processing options. With this option, credit card information can be obtained through a secure server and the transaction can be processed manually. This option is feasible when there is a limited number of online orders. An example of manual payment process is SAP application which provides manual payment towards supplier or vendor company.

It is important to mention as well that in several cases, B2B enterprises that operates within same market, performs payments through **online banking transfer**, where the money is sent from one bank account to another. It is usually fast, free and safer method.

Another electronic payment method which is commonly used for kind of periodic payment, especially towards state Institutions, like energy bill, taxes bill etc, can be made through **automatic bank-to-supplier payment**, where the customer log in to its bank's web site, enter the vendor information and authorize the bank to electronically transfer money from its account to vendor account on same day of each month (Jennifer Hord, 2005).

As B2C platforms are often credit card only out-of-the-box, the B2B needs to provide the option for purchase orders, order approval options and budgeting workflows, payment on credit, and even the ability to check available credit. Many B2B customer relationships have special pricing arrangements, whether across-the-board or volume-based discounts. B2B platforms are built to handle these customer-specific pricing scenarios, no matter how complex or how many unique pricing constructs exist across your customer-base. Pricing

36

adjustments may change based on changing bill-to and ship-to information, and often need to be presented to the user as quickly and accurately as possible.

As Alison Crawford (2013) stated in her article, that in global supply chain market, the B2B payments does not actually transfer money immediately, but instead supports effective distribution of funds for both supplier and vendor.

- E-Procurement

E-procurement is the generic term used to describe the use of electronic methods in every stage of the purchasing process from identification of requirement through to payment, and potentially to contract management (Slack et al., 2013).

The internet has given way for supplying of enterprises from smallest enterprises to largest corporations to establish global presence. The supplying enterprise has the opportunity to reach geographically dispersed markets that would be cost prohibitive to consider (Samara Mubeen et al., 2014). E-procuring have the opportunity to select the best suppliers, who can supply the sub product at less delivery time and the throughput. Hence the companies have achieved to realize the significant cost savings by supporting procurement electronically.

These operations that have emerged in business-to-business commerce offer services to both buyers and suppliers.

Suppliers are seeing e-procurement as a means to make buying from them easier for their customers and more profitable for themselves. For example, IBM (Slack et al., 2013), the technology provider, sees e-procurement as an opportunity for more effective business-to-business integration. In particular it says, e-procurement offers the following advantages:

- Convenient and efficient electronic ordering,
- Shorter requisition and fulfilment cycle,
- Centralized spending controls, and
- Standardized global IT catalogue.

This means, it's easier to buy from them, it's faster to buy from them and it's easier to keep track of what you are buying from them.

However, it's important to mention that, even though many businesses have gained advantages by using e-procurement, it does not mean that everything should be purchased electronically. When businesses purchase very large amounts of strategically important products or services, they will negotiate multimillion-euro deals, which involve months of discussion, arranging for deliveries up to a year ahead. In such environments, e-procurement adds little value.

As a conclusion, the e-procurement is mainly applied by government organizations, as well as big enterprises with the main goal, avoid monopoly and encourage productivity and competition in order to get, the right quality and the right price (Baily et al., 1994).

2.6. Impact of B2B e-Commerce into trading community

Since that the B2B e-Commerce marketplaces involve many buyers and sellers, it means bringing together a large number of buyers and sellers into one trading community.

It is argued that B2B e-Commerce offers potential advantages for developing countries because it reduces transaction costs in general, and e-commerce transaction costs are less sensitive to distance than in traditional marketing channels. Further, e-commerce should provide particular benefits when existing marketing channels work poorly, like for example the traditional. This implies that B2B e-Commerce should benefit developing country producers as a result of creating open and efficient marketing channels.

It is assumed that B2B e-Commerce is mainly organized around e-marketplaces in which decisions to buy or sell can be made online, and this result to the statement such as: the next vendor is only a mouse-click away (John Humphrey, 2002). The European Commission reviewed adopting digital business services across Europe (Eurostat, 2015).

It can be seen that although most companies now have internet access, while other digital business services such as offering a website or using ERP or CRM are not used so widely, particularly in small business.



Figure 2-5: shows enterprises adopting technologies for digital business, by size class, EU27, 2015 (Source: Eurostat 2015)

By focusing on trading relationships and transactions costs, it explores whether the potential for Internet-based B2B e-commerce to create an open model of exchange will in fact be realized and considers the reasons why closed models of B2B e-commerce might arise. This has implications not only for the access of producers in developing and transitional economies to global markets, but also for government policies for promoting the implementation of B2B e-commerce.

2.7. B2B e-Commerce industry in Kosovo marketplace

The case of Kosovo in the B2B e-Commerce industry is unique and quite complicated.

After several years of declaration of independence, Kosovo still is not a member of the United Nations (UN), and still does not have its own Internet top-level domain. Because of that, most of domestic e-Commerce businesses use US -registered domains.

While the legislation covering telecommunication and technology in Kosovo is decent, but there is still a need of several secondary acts to complete the alignment with the EU 2009 regulatory framework (Cullen, 2014).

According to a study conducted by Kosovo IT Strategy (2016) report, the internet penetration in Kosovo based in households is 84.8%.

The Enterprise Support Agency in Kosovo made a survey with 700 Kosovar businesses Enterprises.

As shown on table below, the business enterprises using the Internet do clearly show an early stage of e-Business implementation – where a vast majority (83.43%) use Internet for email

Use of Internet	All bus	inesses	Produ	ction	Trade		Service	S
E-mail	247	35.30%	78	31.00%	95	30.80%	74	52.90%
Webpage	144	20.60%	49	4.75%	53	17.20%	42	30.00%
e-Commerce	19	2.70%	7	2.80%	8	2.60%	4	0.22%
Research and	158	22.60%	65	25.80%	47	15.30%	46	32.90%
marketing								

communication, 12.07% use Internet for website, followed by 4.22% that except email and website do use Internet for e-Commerce as well.

Table 2-4: uses of internet among enterprises in Kosovo (source: Kosovo IT Strategy, 2016).

E-Commerce is regulated by the 2012 laws on Information Society Services and Consumer Protection (Kosovo e-Commerce, 2017). Kosovo follows EU standards for e-Commerce and consumer protection. According to study conducted by the United States of America (USA) Embassy in Kosovo in 2017 regarding the e-Commerce presence in Kosovo market, the average consumer in Kosovo does not make purchases via e-Commerce, but online sales have increased since 2016. Existing market data is limited, but the Kosovo Agency for Statistics planned to begin gathering detailed data on ICT usage and e-Commerce rates in 2017 (Kosovo e-Commerce, 2017).

The domestic e-Commerce market is growing. There are a handful of new websites offering consumer goods, including:

- <u>https://gjirafa50.com/</u>
- <u>http://fafi-ks.com/</u>
- http://smardonline.com/

The current domestic e-Commerce platforms, mainly offers these features and services, presented below:

- **Product catalogue**: list all available products that are visible for the stakeholders/clients, including available quantities, product description and price.
- **User Registration:** enables clients to have an account that identifies them as a unique user that keeps track of current, previous order, invoices, shipment tracking, etc.
- **Shopping list:** enables clients to track items that they want to order. It is generally used to show what items the buyer has selected for purchase.

- Check out: the checkout system allows customers to select and order products by clicking "add items to cart" button, as well it can include payment feature, which is not implemented by our domestic platforms. After order completed, through the check out system, the supplier has the possibility to issue the invoices towards customer.
- Shipping deliveries: this feature consists on the workflow of delivery process of ordered products from the supplier to customer address. After the supplier will get the order and the payment from the customer, it will proceed with the delivery of shipment. The customer will be able to get the data, when the delivery will be exactly arrived at its own destination.
- Payment processing which enables online payment option, is not yet fully implemented by these domestic platforms, even though there is no limitation from the local banking industry to provide this feature. For this matter, further explanation will be given in the payment chapter below.

Kosovo digital market, nowadays the **cross-border e-Commerce**, is becoming very popular, and it has faced a dramatically increase during 2016. According to Kosovo Customs data (Kosovo e-Commerce, 2017), online purchases increased from 12,000 in 2015 to more than 200,000 in 2016.

Although in the same time it should be mentioned that Enterprises in Kosovo are facing difficulties on doing business through e-Commerce, because of political Country which inhibit its business development.

Because of the lack of UN status membership of Kosovo, a lot of global B2B e-Commerce web platforms do not have Kosovo in their web platform country list.

This causes a lot of barriers from business cooperation perspective between Kosovo local Companies and foreign Companies.

To help on this issue, the Government of Kosovo through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs has start the initiative called Digital Kosovo, to improve Kosovo's inclusion in the global Internet infrastructure, as well as using online communication channels to improve perceptions of Kosovo in support of the country's economic, cultural and political developments. This is being delivered with the support of the Norwegian Embassy in Kosovo, Ipko foundation, and the British Council in Kosovo. The mission of the Digital Kosovo platform was to help Kosovo integration into this digital worldwide landscape. This initiative helps overcome the virtual barriers which currently exist by encouraging a range of Internet properties from shopping websites to travel to add Kosovo to their sites. They approached many institutions requesting they include Kosovo or fix Kosovo's presence on their websites.

Using Digital Kosovo advances Kosovo's digital presence across major websites around the world, so that citizens of Kosovo can take advantage of all the Internet has to offer in the same way as all global citizens. And the benefits of this initiative, results with the increase of the online recognition of Kosovo from a lot of global online companies.

Activities like App Camp Kosovo or Wiki Academy Kosovo have made a significant difference to Kosovo's online reputation, as the experience gained by participants in these activities has results in more quality digital content for Kosovo.

Well-known e-Commerce websites, including Amazon, Alibaba, ASOS, Wizzair and more other websites, recently added Kosovo to the list of countries they ship to, simplifying purchases, and increasing the number of online transactions. As per Kosovo Statistics Agency data, the majority of online purchases in Kosovo are made with EU and U.S. retailers (Kosovo e-Commerce, 2017).

2.7.1. Payment system in Kosovo marketplace

In Kosovo market, the current situation related to e-Commerce payment system, mainly still remains on traditional payment way, by cash-on-delivery, which is the most usable payment method, or online banking transfer method as well.

Even though, some local e-Commerce platforms like Gjirafa50.com and Ipko.com, have already implemented the **internet merchant account** payment method in cooperation with Raiffeisen bank, respectively, Procredit bank, by integrating a payment gateway, which enables such online payments transactions.

While, third-party methods such as PayPal generally still do not offer services in Kosovo local market, although some users find work-arounds leveraging banks in neighboring countries (Kosovo e-Commerce, 2017)!

However, in order to be able to choose which payment method is the most appropriate solution for business-to-business e-Commerce platforms, it's very important to analyze also the banking industry of that specific market.

The Kosovo local banking and financial sector are regulated and controlled by the Central Bank of Kosovo (CBK). There are 10 banks currently operating in Kosovo. Most of them are foreign owned but generally funded by deposits and do not depend on financing from their parent bank. The banking industry in Kosovo has had a rapid growth and in recent years, and the banks have improved the services offered, including e-services. Since February 2014, Kosovo has become a member of SWIFT and IBAN that was seen as a great achievement and makes the transfers standard, secure and less costly (Balija & Kosumi, 2014). Now, all the licensed banks offer e-banking services, ATMs, POS and on-line transactions. ProCredit bank was the first and still remains the only bank to provide the service of e-Commerce as of June 2013. Though this service, businesses and traders have the opportunity to selling their products and services via the internet (ProCredit Bank, 2015).

There has also been an increasing trend of individuals and businesses using the e-services provided by banks in Kosovo. The data from CBK (2017) shows that value of e-payments have been rapidly growing year by year, while there was a slight increase in ATM withdrawals and POS Payments, as illustrated in figure below.



Figure 2-6: Annual transaction value of electronic payment instruments (Source: CBK, 2017)

2.7.2. Conclusion

In transition developing countries like Kosovo, the benefits that a B2B Supply Chain Management can bring to the companies through web platforms like e-Commerce or any other platform, especially for gastronomy sector, are enormous and play an important role as a generator of economic growth.

The gastronomy industry is considered to employ the largest number of young people. According to UBO consulting (UBO, 2015), about 36.1% of youth are employed in the gastronomy sector. Since it is a sector with such a high employment in the overall economy of Kosovo, improvement of this sector can have a great impact in the economic growth in Kosovo and the wellbeing of its citizens.

Therefore, academics argue that the development and implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management for the companies, enables them to expand their distribution to emerging local market in order to grow revenues and increase market share.

Customers expectation nowadays are more demanding than ever. And in order to respond with global networks, product innovation and market expansion, companies now are focused on supply chain management to optimize their value chains in order to stay competitive and the same shall be done by Kosovar enterprises to be competitive.

Finally, this market expansion for local companies, certainly plays a key role in country economic development, and it is very important to participate on supporting and improving their development in any possible way.

3. Methodology

The methodology chapter will conduct the research based on the chosen case study, the gastronomy field. This chapter will provide the explanation and justification of the research methodology used in this research in order to answer the research questions.

3.1. Research approach

According to Castellan (2010) there are two main research methods approaches to implement the primary research; the Qualitative and the Quantitative research methods. Bu using the qualitative approach, it allows to approach the society interactively and directly in order to gather their personal perceptions, opinions and views (Castellan, 2010). The quantitative approach is predominantly used as a synonym for any data collections technique (such as questionnaire) that generates or use the numerical data (Saunders et al., 2009).

Qualitative research mainly implements the usage of personal interview and case studies as an instrument for data collection purposes as stated by Yin (2003) while the quantitative research focuses on gathering quantifiable results in the form of numbers and facts (Fassinger and Morrow, 2013).

Both methods have their limitations where the qualitative research method main weakness is the time needed to collect the amounts of data then to classify and select them, while the quantitative method, due to indirect interaction, is unable to collect additional data beyond those already collected (Castellan, 2010).

3.2. Research methods

In order to define the objectives of this research for gastronomy sector, the study used the mixed-method approach. The mixed-method is an approach that combines qualitative and quantitative data collection techniques and uses them at the same time (parallelly) or one after the other (sequentially) and does not combine them (Tashakkori and Teddlie, 2003). Furthermore, since the mixed-method approach makes it possible to use more than one method, the research can formulate a broader and more complete range of research questions. Mixed method can also provide a more complete and stronger conclusion convergence and validation of findings (Cronholm and Hjalmarsson, 2011).

Since that the research is focused on B2B gastronomy sector, in that case the quantitative research method will survey enterprises which correspond to buyer enterprises, and qualitative research will survey enterprises which consist on supplier companies.

Qualitative research method first has consulted the literature review in order to explore the current global B2B marketplaces, the impact of these B2B marketplaces into trading community and how it can improve the overall business processes between enterprises.

Secondly this research method will conduct direct interview with the main supplier enterprises, by using a broad questioner form towards companies' representatives, with aim to analyze and identify the gaps and difficulties of their current business processes which consist on traditional way of working, in order to define the proper solution platform which will transform, facilitate and improve these business processes between suppliers and customers enterprises.

Quantitative research method will survey as much buyer's enterprises, in order to see what they think about implementing this new technology, and their willingness on transformation of their existing business processes into e-Business, as well to inform them about the opportunities coming from e-Business.

The survey will mainly be addressed to companies' managers, to better identify the barriers and challenges faced on implementing B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform among enterprises, as well what are the requirements that such platforms should be able to provide from the buyer perspective.

Finally, as one can see the use of the mixed-method approach for the purpose of this research study is more appropriate because, different methods will be used for different parties from different perspective in the study.

3.2.1. Survey

The most used and the most popular research strategy among business researches remains the survey. According to Jackson (2011) survey can be explained as the questioning of individuals on a topic and then describing their responses which is the one of the case with this research study. According to Collis and Hussey (2003), a survey research strategy includes questionnaires, structured interview, and structured observation.

46

3.3. Research question

Through survey, this research will rather try to answer the following research questions and therefore try to test the following hypothesis:

- What are the main barriers and possible drivers for adoption of B2B Supply Chain Management among local Kosovar enterprises in the area of gastronomy?
- 2. To what degree the components of B2B Supply Chain Management have currently been implemented by Kosovar enterprises and the possibilities of ICT support for these enterprises? Additional point added here is, to define which of the three mentioned above models, the buyer-oriented, the supplier-oriented or the intermediary-oriented marketplace, would be the most appropriate model to manage and control the Kosovo gastronomy B2B supply chain marketplace platform.

For the purpose of conducting the research and verifying the findings, the following hypotheses will be raised, supported by additional hypotheses:

- H1. The main barriers for adoption B2B Supply Chain Management among Kosovo local enterprises in the area of gastronomy are related to transformation from traditional way of working towards technology digitalization, including cost of implementation like planning, procuring, HW and SW development and maintenance, leak of company internal data during transactions and informal or grey trade.
 - H1a. The possible drivers for adoption of B2B Supply Chain Management among local enterprises in the area of gastronomy are: operational cost reduction and increase of efficiency in order placement.
- H2. There has been a low degree of implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management components among Kosovo local enterprises.
 - H2a. Therefore, a local e-marketplace creator for B2B Supply Chain Management as platforms, are great solution for interaction between buyer and supplier enterprises with minimal investment and technology knowledge.

3.4. Methods for data collection

Saunders et al. (2009) suggest that data can be collected in different ways, in different settings, and from different sources. Within this context, Yin (1994) identified six primary sources for data collection for case study research, and these include: documentation, archival records, interviews, direct observation, participant observation, and physical artefacts. While, the use of each of these might require different skills.

Based on the research questions, and from the various strategies, this research sought to adopt a mixed method research, the quantitative method through *survey research strategy* (Saunders et al., 2009) which use the questionnaire form that allow the collection of large amounts of data in a relatively short period of time, and the qualitative method which provides data collection through interviews.

Both these approaches will be elaborated below.

3.4.1. Questionnaire

A questionnaire is a mean of extracting the feelings, beliefs, experiences, perceptions, or attitudes of a sample of individuals by attaining research information from respondents (Key, 1997). As a data collecting instrument, it is concise and pre-planned with a set of questions designed as such to yield specific information from the respondent, in reaching the need to find the required information about a relevant topic.

Questionnaires should be appropriately designed for respondents, and any guidelines for answering questions must be clarified. Questionnaires must be designed to relate to objectives in the research. The questionnaire must serve the research purpose; it must cover the issues, and the data must be able to be collected and analyzed (Rowley, 2003).

While, for the purpose of this study, a computer administered questionnaire is used, where the questionnaire is distributed by email and in some cases in hard copy to participants.

The questionnaire includes questions on computer usage, use of internet, sharing information electronically between the enterprises and Institutions like tax administration, e-invoices, e-orders, e-payments, sharing information electronically on Supply Chain Management, and background information about companies. Further, by the use of this questionnaire, the research aims to identify the main barriers for adoption of B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform among Kosovo local enterprises in the area of gastronomy which are identify as buyer companies through their transformation from traditional way of working towards

technology digitalization, and to analyze to what degree the components of B2B Supply Chain Management have currently been implemented by Kosovo local enterprises.

3.4.2. Interviews

An interview is a technique that is used in qualitative studies which extracts knowledge, facts and data about a particular issue that is being studied, using a variety of questions (Mojtahed et al., 2014).

From the very beginning the term interview has been defined as "a purposeful conversation in which one person asks prepared questions (interviewer) and another person answers them (respondent)" (Frey and Oishi, 1995, p.1). Also, the main task in interviewing is to understand the meaning and views of the respondents (Kvale, 1996). Interviews can be of two types i.e. closed-ended interviews and open-ended interviews. Open ended interviews allow interviewers to probe deep in to the responses of the participants to gain more insights in to the topics (Wimmer and Dominick, 1997). On the other hand, closed ended or structured interviews do not provide the flexibility of giving open and in-depth responses due to the fixed questions order.

Since the research aims to find out the main barriers and possible drivers for adoption of B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform among local Kosovar enterprises, as well to understand to what degree the components of B2B Supply Chain Management have currently been implemented by Kosovar enterprises, this implies that the research looks for in depth and open responses through open-ended interviews with more description to gain the insights of participants which in this perspective are the suppliers companies. Hence, in-depth interviews are selected as one of the appropriate tools in this study.

3.5. Methods for data analysis

Data analysis has been defined as the process of analyzing the collected data and provide the facts and findings or testing the hypothesis to validate the data (Levine, 1997).

Since the research is based on mix methods of data collection through qualitative and quantitative methods, the data analysis will be conducted as follows:

a) With regards to the quantitative data, once the targeted number of questionnaires was reached, the data will be collected and analysed, while based on the analysis the interpretation will be made as well. As argued by Pallan (2010), descriptive statistics

allow the researched to describe the characteristics of the sample through numerical and graphical procedure. After conducting the basic analysis, the research will get the results which will be analysed, compared and interpreted in order to answer the research questions.

- b) While for the qualitative data analysis, the collected data by the interviews will be defined through some different steps in order to derive the findings and answer the research questions:
 - 1) The first step in qualitative data analysis is collating and understanding the data. In this step, the researcher listens to the interview recordings and writes down the main conversation points in a word document. Before continuing with the actual analysis, the research will evaluate and reiterate the key questions to be answered in this study. What are the main barriers for adoption B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform among Kosovo local enterprises in the area of gastronomy, and to analyze and identify the gaps and difficulties of their current business processes which consist on traditional way of working, in order to define the proper solution platform which will transform, facilitate and improve these business processes between suppliers and customers companies! This is to make sure the research conducts the analysis in the appropriate way in order to answer the key areas of research.
 - 2) Data reduction and categorization is the part of qualitative data analysis which sorts, focuses and organizes data in such a way that conclusions can be made and verified (Miles and Huberman, 1994). This process includes summarizing and simplifying the data that will be collected from interviews and selectively focusing on some parts of data (Saunders, et al. 2009). This method will be used to transform the data from interview transcripts and compress long statements into briefer statements in order to summarize the meaning of large amount of text into fewer words.
 - 3) And the final step, is interpretation and discussion. In this stage, the research will interprets the findings of the research in a very specified manner. And after that, finally, the perceptions from the different companies' representative perspectives will be compared and discussed.

By the illustration of these two research methods for data analysis, the chapter gives a brief understanding of how the research plans to conduct the research and provide the findings.

4. Research findings and data analysis

4.1. Introduction

This chapter documents and analyses data collected from survey questionaries' and interviews, both from perspectives of buyers respectively suppliers.

The research findings will be elaborated and compared, based on those findings collected through interviews which have been addressed to supplier representatives, and from questionaries' answers received by buyers' companies, represented by managers and owners.

4.2. Brief description of case study

In order to define the aim of the research, which is mainly focused to look at possible drivers and barriers to the implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management through application platforms by Kosovar enterprises, the gastronomy industry is chosen as case study to conduct this research.

The gastronomy field as a B2B market industry, brings together both business stakeholders, suppliers and buyers in order to enable supply chain services and perform sales activities. Up until now, many different suppliers of gastronomy products have provided supply chain services for customer enterprises such as restaurants, lounge bars etc..., in a traditional way of working over communications channels such as e-mails, telephones, messaging, etc. In addition to this, the process has faced many challenges such as wrong orders: clients were not able to distinguish products and their unique features, problems with the quantities that generally introduced lots of frustrations for both parties in the transaction. Another problem is the range of products one supplier possessed, not all the products were available, so buyers were forced to have many suppliers, which in terms of operation represent potential problems for every order.

Taking in consideration all these facts, the study has conducted a research with both suppliers and buyers' companies, through interviews and surveyed them, in order to define which would be the most appropriate model to implement in Kosovo local gastronomy B2B supply chain marketplace.

51

4.3. Brief description of the questionnaire and interviews

The questionnaire used for this research was divided into seven modules, as illustrated in table

below.

Section:	Module:	Description
Section 1	Module X	General information about the
		Company
Section 2	Module A	Use of computers and smart
		phones
Section 3	Module B	Use of website
Section 4	Module C	Interaction with public
		institutions through websites
Section 5	Module D	Sharing electronically
		information on B2B SCM,
		including orders
Section 6	Module E	Electronic invoicing
Section 7	Module F	Electronic payment

In order to make it easier for the surveyed enterprises to answer the question applicable to them and skip the ones not applicable. This division was also done in the same order as the objectives of the research to make it easier for the research to be analyze the data gathered and answer the research questions.

While, the procedure for conducting interviews is developed from the steps outlined by Saunders et al (2009), who suggest that researchers that are collecting data using interviews should pay attention to data quality issues and preparation for the interview.

There is prepared interview design to be followed by researcher, in order to have more reliable responses from all participants.

Interview procedure					
Interview design and preparation	Interview approach	The researcher conducted face-to-face interviews, in order to reveal and understand 'what', 'how' and 'why' questions.			
	Voice recording	The researcher informed the participants that he will use a voice recorder to record their own voice during the interviews.			
	Debriefing	The researcher provided participants with additional information about the topic of this research in order to gather accurate and			
Ethic consideration		genuine responses from them.			

The interview procedure followed by the researcher is described in table below:

	Confidentiality	The researcher assured participants that information they provide will not be disclosed to others other than within the context of the research.
Implementation of interviews	Interview questions	There are in total five open-ended questions addressed to suppliers' companies: 1. What is your main Company activity, do you provide products and services just for HORECA industry, or also for other industries? How many employees do you have, and do you have your own warehouse? 2. C an explain how are organized logistic operations including receiving orders from customers? 3. In which way order invoices are delivered from your side to customer (print invoice, electronic invoice through mail or), and how the customer make payment of invoices? 4. Do you have any web platform or any kind of application platform which provides supply chain services, if yes, what type of services are offered? 5. If you don't have, would you prefer to develop and have your own platform, or to cooperate with any intermediary platform which would manage all these services for you, if you hesitate why?
	Interview outcome	Five main suppliers' companies in Kosovo market have accepted to be interviewed.

Table 4-2: Interview procedure

4.4. Presentation of research finding

4.4.1. Quantitative results from questionnaires

- Module X- General information about the Company

The questionnaire was sent to 100 small, medium and large gastronomy enterprises like cafe

bars, restaurants, lounge bars, hotels etc..., out of which 56 answered the questionnaire.

Therefore, the results of 56 enterprises will be presented in this chapter.



Figure 4-1: Enterprises according to their economic activity

The figure 4.1 indicates the main activity of gastronomy enterprises, where 39.3% of surveyed enterprises are cafe bars businesses that offers only beverages, the second largest activity are Lounge bars businesses about 30.4%, which offers both beverages and food products, followed by restaurants with 25% and the last identified businesses are hotels with 5.4%. Additionally, in this module have been delivered to enterprises questions regarding the current way of working and interaction between buyers and suppliers, but these inputs will be elaborate in the end of this chapter.

- Module A- Use of computers and smartphones

Based on the objective of this study, a filter question was used in the beginning of the survey to find out whether the surveyed enterprises use computer and smartphones or not. Figure show that 100% of all surveyed enterprises stated that they all use computers.



Figure 4-2: Use of computers by enterprises

Almost the same question was made for smartphones and tablets, and 96.4% of employees from buyers' companies have smartphones, while just 3.6% of them don't have.



4-3:Use of smartphones/tablets by enterprises

Researcher adds a filter question here, in order to identify what kind of operating system employees used. The results show, that 56.6% of them use IOS, while 41.5% use Android.



Figure 4-4: Operating system of smartphones and tablets

- Module B- Use of website

Module B contains questionnaires about the websites, whether buyer enterprises have a website and the findings indicate that 48.2% of the surveyed enterprises have a website, while 51.8% of gastronomy enterprises do not have a website.



Figure 4-5: Website of businesses

Additional question is added for all those 48.2% of enterprises who declared that they have a website, about content of their website in order to get picture that what kind of services, they offer through their website.



Description of goods or services, price lists and product specifications!

Description of goods or services, price lists and product specifications!, Links or references to the enterprise's social media profiles!

Other services!

Description of goods or services, price lists and product specifications!, Links or references to the enterprise's social media profiles!, Possibility
for online ordering or reservation!

Figure 4-6: Website services offered by buyer enterprises

From the results of the survey, indicate that the majority of website contents are general content, that provides basic information such as description of portfolio including goods and services, price lists, product specifications and links or references to their company social media profiles. While, few of them, 18.5% stated that except basic information, their website has the possibility for online orders or seats reservation, and just 14.8% of the responses show that websites offer additional other services except these mentioned above. While none of them have integrated the feature for online payment.

- Module C- Interaction with public institutions through websites

Module C has surveyed enterprises about their interaction with public institutions during 2017 through internet, in order to get information if this communication have occurred or not. The responses show that 39.3% of enterprises have interacted with institutions, while the majority of them, about 60.7% did not perform it.





This interaction of enterprises with public institution happens for different purposes, where 50,0% did it to obtain different information, while 45,5% to pay taxes or other institutional fees, and 4,5% have submitted file complain on institutions.



Figure 4-8: Interaction with public institutions though internet

- Module D - Sharing information on B2B Supply Chain Management Module D of the questionnaire deals with the level of sharing of Supply Chain Management information between enterprises. This means sharing information on B2B, respectively for buyer enterprises exchanging all types of information with suppliers, and the results show that 98% of the surveyed enterprises share information with its suppliers regarding Supply Chain Management.



Figure 4-9: Sharing Supply Chain Management information with suppliers

Information in Supply Chain Management could be exchange through different ways, therefore the research has divided questions, based on components of Supply Chain Management and addressed them to buyer enterprises, in order to identify in which way these data are exchange with suppliers' enterprises.

The first question as a part of components of Supply Chain Management, was related to orders.

Figure below show that majority of surveyed enterprises, 70.9%, order products through direct meeting with supplier representatives, and about 14.5% use phone communication to order products, while recently another tool is taking place to enterprises as a new form of communication, through those smartphone applications like, Viber, WhatsApp etc, about 12.7% declared to use this way, while to mention also that sending orders through email, happens in a very rare cases.



Figure 4-10: Sharing information of Supply Chain Management, order of products to supplier

Another question has been delivered to buyer enterprises regarding orders, whether they might prefer making orders of products through any integrated platform, and the responses indicate that 66.1% would like to work through such platform, while 25% express their hesitation.





Some enterprises expressed their hesitation because of different factors, where, 66.7% of enterprises are concerned to make orders to suppliers through online platforms because of security of their personal data, and 21.4% of buyers have lack of confidence regarding the system funcionality, and the same percentage of them doubt on other factors, while 14.3% declared that are not familiar to operate with such web platforms and have lack of experience on ICT!



Figure 4-12: Hesitation of enterprises about making orders through web platforms

Surveyed enterprises were also asked if the transport is covered by suppliers or not, and responses shows that for 94.6% of buyers, declared that transport is organized by its suppliers.





- Module E – Electronic invoices

The second component of B2B Supply Chain Management consist on invoices, therefore the module E of the questionnaire deals with the level of use of invoices, among the surveyed enterprises.

Initially, the buyer enterprises were asked to state whether they have received any electronic or paper printed invoices from supplier during 2017, and the results show that all buyer enterprises have received invoices from supplier in any form, during 2017.



Figure 4-14: Invoices received by buyer businesses during 2017

Another question has been addressed to buyer enterprises to see in percentage, in what form they have received invoices from suppliers during 2017, where 93% of surveyed businesses stated that have received invoices only in paper printed form, and just 7% received them through emails, while it is seen that none of these buyer enterprises have interact through any supplier platform to be able generate electronic invoices.



Figure 4-15: Invoices types received by buyer enterprises during 2017

Buyer enterprises have been additionally asked if they would like to receive invoices from supplier in any electronic form in future and based on results one can see that 41.4% hesitate to transform this process of getting invoices, while 58.6% express their readiness to accept it.



Figure 4-16: Readiness about receiving invoices in electronic from suppliers

From these businesses that expressed their hesitation, 41.7% of them are conern regarding the security of personal data, and 16.7% of businesses have lack of confidence regarding the system funcionality, also same number have declared that are not familiar to operate through such web platforms, and they have lack of experience on ICT, while 25% hesitate because of other factors.





- Module F – Electronic payment

This module contains questionnaires about another important component which improve the

B2B Supply Chain Management, and it is payment system.

Payment system as a mandatory key factor in business sector overall, could be performed by enterprises in different ways, therefore the research tries to find in which way the buyer enterprises have made payment towards supplier enterprises in the field of gastronomy. The, buyer enterprises have been asked on which way they have performed payments towards suppliers during 2017, and results show that 78,6% of buyer businesses made payments on cash, while 21,4% of them have performed online payment through e-banking transfers.





Further the businesses were asked regarding their readiness to transform the payment way towards supplier, through any online platforms, and the results are not satisfactory, where the majority of companies, 52.4%, do not like to have this possibility, while 26.2% of them hesitate about it and just 21.4% declared that they would prefer to transform their payment system on digital way.



Figure 4-19: Readiness about making payments through online platforms

Hesitation comes because of different reasons, such as: concerns of businesses regarding security of personal data, lack of confidence on system functionality, while some businesses accept that are not familiar to operate with such platforms.



Figure 4-20: Hesitation of enterprises about making online payment through website

As it is above mentioned in the first module, buyer enterprises have been additionally answered on some general questions regarding their current business activities and their perspective expectation to be incorporated in any Supply Chain Management application platform.

Except question about main economic activity, enterprises have described in a nutshell the current way of making orders, receiving invoices and payments. And based on feedbacks, in

the figure below, it is clearly figured that the majority of enterprises performs these activities, through old traditional ways.



Figure 4-21: Enterprises current way of processing with orders and invoices

Buyer enterprises have expressed their impression about the advantages that the integration of electronic B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform provides in comparison with traditional manually way. And the results show that majority of them agreed about the advantages that this integrated system would have.



Figure 4-22: Impression of enterprises regarding the advantages of B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform

The enterprises have highlighted also the key challenges on implementation of the Supply Chain Management platform in Kosovo local market. Finding of the research indicate that 48.2% of the surveyed enterprises are concern about the security of personal data, and 19.6% have lack of trust on system functionality, while 10.7% consider as a reason, the low level of consumer awareness, and 21.4% doubt on other factors.



Figure 4-23: Challenges on implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management in Kosovo market

Enterprises have given their recommendation how to increase the integration of such electronic Supply Chain Management platform in B2B local market, and according to them, promoting through the internet would have significant impact as well raising of consumer awareness.



Figure 4-24: Recommendation regarding the promotion of Supply Chain Management integration among Kosovo local enterprises

The last question that has been addresses to all these surveyed buyer enterprises, is related to the future of implementation of electronic B2B Supply Chain Management platform in Kosovo marketplace in the area of gastronomy. The results show that, buyer enterprises expressed their hesitations at considerable level regarding the challenges on this transformation, while there is present a higher number of enterprises who are optimist on successful perspective of this digital transformation of B2B Supply Chain Management.



Figure 4-25: The future of implementation of electronic B2B Supply Chain Management in Kosovo marketplace

4.4.2. Qualitative results from interviews

As it is described in the research method chapter above, in order to define the proper solution for transformation and integration of electronic B2B Supply Chain Management platform between suppliers and buyers' enterprises, the qualitative research method is one of the chosen method to conduct this research.

As it is abovementioned in qualitative research method, data can be collected in different ways, and from different sources. In this study, it is decided to use interviews as a source of qualitative data collection. Therefore, there are interviewed five main local suppliers' enterprises in the field of gastronomy, based on their market share and products portfolio.

These companies cover with supply of commodities almost 90% of local catering marketplace. The interview design was build based on five open-ended questions that were addressed to all suppliers' enterprises representatives. The responses will be interpreted through key elements related to each and every answer provided, which will enable the research to make comparison between the elements of the answers from each interview in order to identify the variation of way of working that each supplier performs towards their buyer customer enterprises.

Below will be interpreted the data extracted by responses on each question.

- General information about the enterprise

First question tries to gather information regarding main enterprise activity, portfolio information, and market type. The findings of the responses provided are presented in the table below.

Company entity	Market industry	Products	Employees	Warehouse
1) LLC Company A	HORECA	Beverages	7 employees	Own warehouse
2) LLC Company B	HORECA	Beverages	8 employees	Own warehouse
3) LLC Company C	HORECA and	Beverages	100 employees	Own warehouse
	other industries			
4) LLC Company D	HORECA and	Beverages and	110 employees	Own warehouse
	other industries	food		
5) LLC Company E	HORECA and	Beverages and	40 employees	Own warehouse
	other industries	food		

Table 4-3: General information about enterprises

From the collected data, it is stated that all of suppliers' enterprises are registered as Limited Liability Companies, and all of them offer products for Hotels, Restaurants and Cafe bars businesses while some of them spread their market share also to other industries like supermarket stores etc.... From the products portfolio data, it is stated that all of them offers beverages, while few of them have food products in their portfolio as well.

The majority of the suppliers are big enterprises, which have a big number of employees from administrative and logistic departments, including: sales agents, supervisors, distributors etc... It is confirmed that all suppliers have their own warehouse stock.

- Orders and logistic operations organized by supplier enterprises

This is quite a wide question, where the suppliers' enterprises are asked to describe their current process of receiving orders, until delivery of shipment to customer site.

All five respondents provided answers on this question, and according to their responses, there is almost a same way they interact with customer businesses in terms of receiving orders, while there is a difference in the way they organize internal logistic operations.

In that sense, regarding internal logistic operations, 40% of the respondents (company A and B) organize this process in the traditional way of working, which consist of:

- Supplier distributor, visit on daily basis the customer premises, to check if the customer has something to order,
- After the customer deliver the order to distributor in paper form, the distributor inform by phone or directly the administration sector for customer order request,
- The supplier administration, register the order for each customer, and prepare the invoices,
- Based on invoices for each customer, the distributor ships the merchandise from warehouse and deliver it together with invoice to customers addresses.

While the 60% of the respondents (companies C, D and E) organize their internal logistic operations as follows:

- Supplier sales agent, visit on daily basis the customer premises, to check the customer stock and if something has to order,
- orders are received by suppliers in the same as abovementioned, through direct communication way, while,
- after the respective customer order is received, by these supplier enterprises, then their internal logistic process is done in different way.
- Suppliers companies, have already transform their internal way of working on digital way, by developing and integrating their own application platform which enables to carry out all internal operations inside the organization. This application is installed at mobile phones or tablets, of each supplier representatives including sales agent, supervisors, administration, and transporters.
- After the supplier sales agent, received the order from customer, he/she register it in their platform installed in tablet or mobile. After the order is registered based on customer name, it is immediately sent to supervisor for checking and approval.
- The supervisor, check the submitted order, and if everything is ok, he/she approve it.
- After order approval by supervisor, the order confirmation is sent for invoicing.
- After invoice is created, it is forwarded to logistic department for printing and dispatch the shipment from Warehouse,
- The transporter, take the shipment and together with invoice deliver it to customer site.

- After the shipment is delivered to customer, the transporter can change the status of order in application platform to "DELIVERED", which notification is automatically sent to sales agent and supervisor.
- With this process, the order is considered to be successfully delivered.



Figure 4-26: Supplier internal processes workflow through application platform

Here one can see, that the interaction between supplier and customer is occurring on the same way by all cases, while suppliers' internal processes, are organized on different ways. Almost, the majority of big supplier enterprises have already transform their internal processes and automate them through implementation of such application platforms.

- Invoicing and payment system provided by supplier enterprises

In third open-ended question, supplier enterprises have described the way they deliver invoices to customers, as well the payment methods performed by buyer customers.

From all responses, suppliers' enterprises declared that they have delivered all invoices to buyers in printed form, while none of supplier have delivered invoices in any electronic form. In some rare cases, customer requires to send them pro-invoices through emails, and this happens just for evidence purposes.

While, related to invoices, according to three big suppliers' enterprises, if the invoice has higher values, the customer has the possibility to negotiate the product price. In these cases,

usually customers ask for discount percentage of total invoice value, which goes from 3% -5%. In that case, the supplier sales agent forwards that specific request to his/her supervisor. An important element here, is that the discount request can be submitted through application platform as well.

In that case, the supervisor can approve or decline this request.

When it comes to payment methods, based on information given by interviewed supplier enterprises, they have highlighted two ways of payments that customer businesses perform based on invoices value:

- payment in cash for all invoices with value up to 500 euro, and
- payment through bank transfers for all invoices with value higher than 500 euro, while the suppliers declares that these payments on majority cases are proceeded through e-banking transfers.

Another important issue here, is payments agreement. For payments with higher value, in some cases the buyer customer has the possibility to pay it later, depends on agreement, in most of cases on weekly basis.

As abovementioned, when payments are accepted by the transporter on cash, after the shipment is delivered at customer place, the transporter than have to confirm the payment by sending notification to supervisor through application platform.

Through this explanation it can be concluded that supplier enterprises did not developed and integrated in their platforms any feature, which would provide to customers possibility for making payments on electronic way. As abovementioned, suppliers have automated complete their internal processes related to logistic and administration, while interaction part with buyer enterprises such as order receipt, invoices receipt and payment system, remains on manually way.

- Integration of B2B Supply Chain Management through application platforms, and suppliers' readiness to implement it

As described above, suppliers have clearly presented the components of their Supply Chain Management. As one can see, the interviewed suppliers currently implement two different ways of Supply Chain Management, as follows:

- the interaction with customers on the traditional way, and
- internal logistic processes that are mainly automated using the platforms that supplier have in place.
A follow up question was asked during the interviews based on the answers provided. That follow up question was regarding the visibility of suppliers in the internet. The responses provided were that 70% of interviewed enterprises have a website, but their websites provide only basic information about the enterprise, including presentation of product portfolio, while these websites do not provide any possibility and features for online services like: e-orders, einvoices and e-payments.

In the responses received by the interviewed suppliers, they have also provided the explanation on why some components of their Supply Chain Management is kept in the traditional way and why have they only been focused in improving and transforming their internal processes to the digital ones.

Therefore, based on the responses provided, the main barriers identified by the suppliers on their hesitation to implement a complete integrated platform of Supply Chain Management are:

- **Informal economy**: suppliers perceive that the main barrier of have an integrated approach is that many of their buyers do not file their taxes properly, namely they do not want to leave any electronic traces in their trade activities. Therefore, they prefer to make their orders in person, receive their invoices in a hard copy and pay in cash.
- Security of data: suppliers have stated that their customers have expressed concerns regarding the security of their trading business data. This mainly relates to two factors, the competition and the access of tax authorities in their business data.
- Direct marketing: Suppliers have declared that they pay a special attention to the direct marketing with their customers. According to them, in this was they keep a close relationship with their customers. If they do not perform such kind of direct cooperation, they fear that it can result on deviation and distancing from the direct customer relationship that exist. Therefore, the suppliers consider that by implementing such platforms they will not visit their customers often enough and this will create a competitive advantage for their competitors. According to them, by installing such a digital way of communication they will lose valuable information that they receive from customers when they visit them to get their orders, send them invoices or receive payments. Such information consists on stock of their customers, when and what is being consumed the most and what are their competitors selling and their marketing strategies.

Based on these analysis, the suppliers choose to keep this way of working for time being, even though they are aware about the benefits from the implementation of whole components of Supply Chain Management platform that would offer like save on cost, save on time.

4.5. Data analysis and discussion

This sub-chapter will analyse and discuss the findings from quantitative and qualitative research, cross-reference them with the literature review as well as three objectives of the study which were: to find out the degree of capacities that Kosovar local gastronomy enterprises currently have in order to implement B2B Supply Chain Management; to investigate the possible drivers and barriers on implementing B2B Supply Chain Management as a platform among Kosovar enterprises in gastronomy area; and to find out the capacities that the ICT industry in Kosovo possesses in order to support these local enterprises on implementing such B2B Supply Chain Management platform.

The data analysed in the study represent surveys from 56 buyer enterprises and interviews of 5 supplier enterprises.

Since **this is an informative, rather than a decision-making study**, although the sample, size and type of enterprises represent the majority of enterprises in HORECA and therefore this sample can be considered too small to generalize the outcomes of the research.

The data from the first module regarding the fundamental elements of Supply Chain Management suggests that all the interviews enterprises have computers, as a fundamental element of a Supply Chain Management. Both buyers and suppliers are even more advanced technologically since 97% also have and use smartphones for their business purposes.

In this respect, all suppliers who have and use the internal integrated platform, have ICT specialist employed and they see them as being crucial in order to keep their system in function.

All suppliers and buyers have access and use the internet which is also a cornerstone for Supply Chain Management. They also use the internet to integrate all the information across the entire enterprise. This is especially valuable to suppliers since it helps them to monitor and forecast demand more accurately and allocate assets more productively, while improving

customer service with a more responsive and consistent user experience as stated by (Aliza Knox, 2005).

Further, the results of this study are in line with the Kosovo Strategy for IT (2016), that states that internet penetration in Kosovo based in households is 84.8%, and internet penetration based on users is 76.6%, while the research findings show that internet and computer penetration amongst enterprises is 100%, which suggest that is not a barrier in the implementation of Supply Chain Management.

This high penetration of internet and computer usage is big indicator regarding the ability and readiness of Kosovar enterprises to implement Supply Chain Management as a platform.

Additionally, gathered data in this study also indicate that it is important for enterprises to be visible in the internet, while the results are not satisfactory.

There is a slight difference regarding the possession of websites between buyers and suppliers. Out of all surveyed buyers, 48% of them stated to have a website, while amongst the interviewed suppliers, 60% of them stated to have a website.

The literature review indicates that internet presence is crucial for enterprises, while this research reveals that despite the low percentage of possession of websites, the enterprises subject to this study did not invest much in the content of their websites either. The content of the majority of buyer and supplier websites is the description of portfolio of their goods and services, price lists, product specifications and links or references to their company social media profiles. From questionnaire regarding content of buyer websites, it is stated that only 18.5% of the buyer enterprises in addition to the basic information, their website has the possibility for online orders or seats reservation. While from responses provided by supplier enterprises regarding the content of their website, has been found that except basic information regarding the products portfolio, none of them have integrated in website any additional feature of e-Commerce, such as e-orders, e-invoices or payment system. Even though some of supplier enterprises have declared to have a possibility for online order feature through some of their application platforms. Therefore, this can be considered one of barriers of implementing or improving Supply Chain Management.

Additionally, the interaction of buyer enterprises with public authorities through websites, is not at satisfactory level. The responses show that 39.3% of businesses have interacted with institutions through internet, while the majority of them, about 60.7% did not perform it.

The interaction with public institutions, happens for different purposes, where 40.9% use the internet to obtain different information from public authorities, while 36.4% use the Government-to-Business (G2B) e-Commerce module to pay taxes and other institutional fees online. Anyhow this could be an indicator that Kosovar enterprises are willing and ready to perform their business functions effectively, efficiently and with as less cost as possible (Murillo, 2001).

As it is argued by Damiani et al. (2010), that Supply Chain Management consist on interaction between suppliers and buyers, and which interaction is built through material, and decisional flows and information sharing, therefore it is necessary to analyze and cross-reference the findings from the research regarding the key components of Supply Chain Management which provides this exchange of information and material flows.

Based on the results of the research, 98% of buyers manually share information with its suppliers regarding Supply Chain Management, mainly regarding their stock.

While the research seeks to find out whether all components of Supply Chain Management including information sharing, negotiation, quotation, ordering, shipping, and invoicing, have been exchanged by enterprises, and the way they occur. The responses clearly indicate that this interaction between enterprises in gastronomy field in Kosovo local market occurs mainly in the traditional way.

Hence, the results show that the majority of surveyed enterprises, 70.9%, order products through direct meeting with supplier's representatives, or through phone calls or using free internet apps like Viber or WhatsApp to communicate with the suppliers, while only few of them have ordered products through e-mails. Regardless of the fact abovementioned, that some suppliers have integrated in their business platforms, feature of ordering online, none of them have offered it to buyers' enterprises in order to facilitate their trade and use all the features and benefits that these platforms provide.

Ordering products manually and not automating the processes created difficulties among enterprises to keep the trace of their data, namely order history and use of those data for planning their sales and stock and marketing purposes, as argued by Al Sagheer et al. (2011), who stated that this indicator has direct impact in business performance by causing low efficiency on their supply chain.

Invoicing process by suppliers is another important component of B2B Supply Chain Management. The survey results, indicates that the majority of buyer enterprises about 93% received and continue receiving invoices from supplier enterprises, in a hard copy, while just 7% have experienced receiving invoices on electronic form by email.

Additionally, the results of the research have provided another factor regarding the readiness of buyers to transform the way of receiving their invoices. It is evident that these enterprises hesitate to change this procedure, for different reasons, like their concern about the security of personal data, lack of confidence about the functionality of the system, and a big percentage of them stated their hesitation because of other factors such as informality.

Another crucial component of B2B marketplace that improves efficiency in Supply Chain Management, is the payment system. Despite the argumentation of different scholars on their research that during the last 10 years, improvements of payment system, have globally increase the efficiency in B2B Supply Chain Management, this has not been much implemented in the Kosovo local marketplace due to high level of manual payments which exists. Payment processes has not seen a corresponding increase in efficiency, despite the availability of automated payment gateway provided from different local Banks such as Raiffeisen bank and Procredit Bank.

Based on the results and data provided by either buyers or suppliers, none of the suppliers have an integrated payment system into their Supply Chain Management platforms, even though they are aware of the benefits it provides and the financial benefits that they lose by not having such a system. This can be seen as a curious anomaly as argued by (Aliza Knox, 2005) since, through automating payment one can benefit not only the payment process but the Supply Chain as a whole.

In this regard, buyers' enterprises were asked whether they would prefer to transform the payment system towards suppliers, through online payment method, and the results are not satisfactory, where the majority of enterprises, 52.4%, do not like to use this possibility, while 26.2% of them hesitate to transform the payment system due to security reasons and lack of

confidence on system functionality, and only 21.4% of buyer enterprises declared that would prefer to have this possibility.

Through all these findings from the research, it can be concluded that the main barriers for the adopting of B2B Supply Chain Management among Kosovo local enterprises in the area of gastronomy as a platform, as it is also shown above in the fig 4.12, fig 4.17 and fig 4.20, are related to the hesitation by the majority of buyer enterprises for making orders, receiving invoices and making payments on digital way through such integrated platforms. This hesitation consists on factors such as customers concerns regarding the security of their trading business data, and informal economy. Both of these factors have to do with the competition and the access of tax authorities in buyer enterprises business data.

The results verified also that the possible drivers for adopting of B2B Supply Chain Management among these enterprises which are operational cost reduction and increase of efficiency in order placement, including save on time, are in line with responses received from the questionnaires, shown above in the fig 4.10, fig 4.15 and fig 4.18, where is stated that majority of orders continue placing through a direct meeting between suppliers and buyers, as well as the whole invoices continue receiving on paper form. An integrated platform that will enable all these transaction between enterprises will provide save on cost and save on time for both parties.

The majority of interviewed supplier enterprises who represent 90% of the HORECA local industry, as it is described above in the fig 4.26, stated that their internal processes such as order registering, prices negotiation request, order approval, invoicing system, and shipping process, are automated through the implementation of such platforms in their organizations.

Through this, it can be seen that suppliers already have implemented in high degree the majority of components of Supply Chain Management operations in their internal organization through application platforms while they have not incorporated here the interaction with buyer and to get benefits from the features that this interaction would provide.

Regardless of the benefits, the suppliers choose to continue operating in the manual way with buyers. As previously mentioned, suppliers see the direct marketing and in person interaction with the buyers as an important and critical tool to retain their clients.

5. Conclusion and recommendations

5.1. Conclusion

As it is described from the first chapter, the aims of this study were to look at possible drivers and barriers to the implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management by Kosovar enterprises, and to verify to what degree the components of B2B Supply Chain Management have currently been implemented by Kosovar enterprises?

The second chapter provides a review of the literature used, based on academic articles, research papers and books, in order to describe the impact of B2B Supply Chain Management into trading community, by focusing on development of this industry in Kosovo marketplace.

Chapter 3 provides an explanation of the research approach, research methods, and methods for data collection and data analysis in order to assess the objective of the research.

While the chapter 4 presents the research findings and data analysis obtained from qualitative and quantitative research methods, in order to achieve the aims and objectives of research, answer the research questions and test the hypothesis.

As a conclusion the findings clearly indicate that some of the enterprises subject of this research have already improved the components of B2B Supply Chain Management across their organizations.

As in many other trades, the gastronomy sector also consists of suppliers and buyers, therefore the objective of the research has been to find out the capacities of both these enterprises in order to implement B2B Supply Chain Management which would facilitate the interaction between them, and to investigate the drivers and barriers on implementing the B2B Supply Chain Management among these enterprises through application platforms. The ICT industry in Kosovo also plays a crucial role in the implementation of such electronic B2B Supply Chain Management platforms.

The internet and computer penetration as fundamental elements of B2B Supply Chain Management are at the highest level.

This indicates an early stage of B2B Supply Chain Management implementation and there was an increased trend in internet and computer penetration throughout the last decade. Therefore, this is big indicator regarding the ability and readiness of Kosovar enterprises to implement Supply Chain Management as a platform.

Further, the enterprises are also using the internet for their visibility where the results are not satisfactory. From the perspective of buyers, they see their presence as moderate by the fact that they have a website, while the majority of suppliers declared to have a website as well. Furthermore, the findings of this study indicate that the contents of websites for buyers and suppliers are disappointing taking into account the possibilities of e-Commerce. Hence, the main features offered by buyers and suppliers in their websites are the description of portfolio of their goods and services, price lists, product specifications and links or references to their company social media profiles.

The results of the research indicate that enterprises involved in gastronomy sector have implemented some of the components of e-business but none of them are involved in e-Commerce. Therefore, they are not utilizing all the benefits that e-Commerce provides, as explained in the literature review.

Regardless of the fact that there are ICT capacities to implement an e-Commerce webplatform, as well as local banks provide the electronic payments possibility, there is not a single e-Commerce platform present in the gastronomy sector. Also, the results of the research indicate that there is no will to implement such platform because of the reasons mentioned above in this research.

Literature review indicate that the development of an B2B SCM e-Commerce platforms can be implemented through the following three models:

- supplier-oriented marketplace,
- buyer-oriented marketplace, or
- intermediary-oriented marketplace

Out of these three models, the Kosovo gastronomy sector is based on supplier-oriented marketplace model, as the most appropriate model being implemented in B2B Supply Chain Management, even though not through e-Commerce.

According to responses by questionnaire and interviews, it is verified that supplier enterprises have developed application platforms where are implemented the majority of components of Supply Chain Management, related to their internal organization processes. These automated processes consist on: customer order registering, prices negotiation request, order approval, invoicing system, and shipping delivery process. This automation has not incorporated the interaction with the buyers, while the suppliers prefer to maintain the traditional way of interaction with buyers.

From the research, it is clearly evident a hesitation presence from both buyers and suppliers' enterprises in order to implement this interaction between them through such application platforms, which interaction consist on three main elements: feature to submit order request from buyer, feature to get electronic invoices from buyer and potentially the possibility for e-payments.

As clearly indicated in the data analysis section, the factors that influence such as hesitation are the following:

- Informal economy,
- Security of data, and
- Direct marketing.

The results of the quantitative and qualitative data prove that the first hypothesis remains and is in line with the research results which determine that the **main drivers for adoption of B2B Supply Chain Management among local enterprises in the area of gastronomy are: increase of efficiency in order placement and operational cost reduction, including save on time**, while the second hypothesis resulted as not being valid since the results indicate that there **has been a high degree of implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management components among Kosovo local enterprises,** while the hypothesis was that there is a low degree of implementation of B2B SCM components. The research concluded that there is a satisfactory degree of implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management components among local enterprises, while the challenges remains on interaction part between buyers and suppliers, which still remains on manually communication way.

However, since this is an informative, rather than a decision-making study, in order to define the exact solution for both parties, which would result on fully implementation of B2B Supply

Chain Management as a platform, there needs to be a further comprehensive analysis between various actors.

5.2. Recommendations

There are two fundamental broad issues which must be tackled and therefore should be the recommendations of this research:

<u>First</u>, there should be a comprehensive approach towards buyers and suppliers in order to inform them about the benefits that an B2B e-Commerce platform would provide to them, as well to inform them about the security measurements that are in place in such a platform.

<u>Second</u>, suppliers must be aware of the importance of having such B2B e-Commerce platform implemented, benefits gained, and competitive advantage created in the Kosovo market as well as in expanding their geographical presence.

6. References

- Aljifri, H., Pons, A., and Collins, D. (2003) Global e-Commerce: a Framework for Understanding and Overcoming the Trust Barrier. *Information Management & Computer Security*, Vol. 11, No. 3, pp. 130-138.
- Al Sagheer et.al., (2011) International Business & Economics Research Journal: Impact of Supply Chain Integration on Business Performance and its Challenges. Vol. 4, No. 12.
- Alison Crawford (2013), How B2B Payments Enable Faster Supply Chains and Invoicing. [Online] available from: <u>https://www.americanexpress.com/us/content/foreign-exchange/articles/b2b-</u> payments-enable-supply-chain-management/
- Aliza Knox. (2005) How Can E-Payment Improve the Supply Chain Process. [Online] available from: <u>https://www.gtnews.com/articles/how-can-e-payment-improve-the-supply-chain-process/</u>.
- Amit R. and Zott C. (2001) Value creation in e-business. *Strategic Management Journal*, 22, 493-520. [Online] available from: http://learn.fi.edu/franklin/glossary.html [Accessed 14 February 2015].
- Annamalai, C. and Ramayah, T. (2011) Enterprise resource planning (ERP) benefits survey of Indian manufacturing firms. *Business Process Management Journal*, Vol. 17 Issue 3 pp. 495 – 509.
- Anjaly Gypta. (2014) e-Commerce: Role of e-Commerce in today's business. Vol. 4, issue 1, 2014.
- Andersen, H. & Jacobsen, P. & Mittal, V. (2000) Implementing CRM; 20 Steps to success. *Customer Relationship Management*, 254-280.
- Anni-Kaisa Kahkonen, Katrina Lintukangas and Veli Matti Virolainen (2013) The effects of e-Business on Supply Management. *Operations and Supply Chain Management*, Vol 6, No. 2, pp. 75-84.
- Baleanu, V., Irimie, S., Ionica, A. (2009) Supply Chain Management, A New Frontier of Managerial Thought and Practice. Annals of the University of Petrosani, Economics. Vol. 9, No. 1, p. 43–52.

- Balija, P. & Kosumi, K. (2014) Periodic overview of financial sector in Kosovo, Pristina: Kosovo Banking Association (KBA).
- Bartels, A. (2000) The Difference Between E-Business and E-Commerce.
- Birger Groblinghoff. (2002) B2B e-Commerce, The future of business transactions & relationships.
- Botha, J.Bothma, C. & Geldenhuys, P. (2008) Managing e-Commerce in Business, Juta Online.
- Bose, R. & Sugumaran, V. (2003) Application of Knowledge Management Technology in Customer Relationship Management. *Knowledge and Process Management*, Vol. 10, No.1, pp. 3-15.
- Caniato, F., Cagliano, R., Kalchschmidt, M., Golini, R. and Spina, G. (2009). Evolutionary patterns in e-business strategy. *International Journal of Operations & Production Management*, 29 (9), pp.921-945.
- Castellan, C.M. (2010) Quantitative and Qualitative Research: A View for Clarity. International Journal of Education 2(2), pp 1-14.
- Central Bank of the Republic of Kosovo (2017) Annual Report 2016, Pristina: Central Bank of the Republic of Kosovo.
- Chaffey, D. (2004) E-business and E-Commerce Management, 2nd Edition, Pearson Education Limited, England.
- Chibelushi, C. (2008) Learning the hard way? Issues in the adoption of new technology in small technology-oriented firms, *Education + Training*, Vol 50, Issue 8/9.
- Collis, J. & Hussey, R. (2009) Business Research: A practical guide for undergraduate and postgraduate students, 3rd ed. Palgrave Macmillan, New York.
- Craig, R. (2000) E-business and data. ENT Fort Washington, 5 (3), 2-32.
- Croom S. (2005). The impact of e-business on supply chain management: An empirical study of key developments. *International Journal of Operations & Production Management*, 25 (1), pp.55-73.
- Cronholm, S., Hjalmarsson, A. (2011). Experiences from Sequential Use of Mixed Methods. *Electronic Journal of Business Research Methods*, 9 (2) p.87-95, Business Source Complete, EBSCOhost, viewed 18 March 2015.

- Cullen International (2014) Monitoring regulatory and market development for electronic communications and information society services in Enlargement Countries. Report 4 – Country Comparative Report.
- Damiani, E., Frati, F. and Tchokpon, R. (2010) The Role of Information Sharing in Supply Chain Management. *International Journal of Innovation and Technology Management*, 8(3), pp. 455 – 467.
- Dave Chaffey (2015) Digital Business and e-Commerce management, sixth edition, pp.xv.
- David Berrios (2014) Challenges in Supply Chain Management. [Online] available article from: <u>https://bus.wisc.edu/mba/current-students/mba-</u> <u>specializations/supply-chain-management/blog/2014/03/06/challenges-in-supply-</u> <u>chain-management</u>.
- Davis, T., (2003) E-Commerce measurements and analysis. *Statistical Journal of the United Nations*, pp. 260-320.
- De Boer L., Harink J. and Heijboer G. (2002). A conceptual model for assessing the impact of electronic procurement. *European Journal of Purchasing & Supply Management*, 8 (1), pp.25-33.
- Douglas M. Lambert, and Dale S. Rogers. (2001) The Supply Chain Management Processes: *The International Journal of Logistics Management*, Vol. 12, No. 2, pp. 13-36.
- Dmitry Ivanov, Alexander Tsipoulanidis and Jorn Schonberger. (2018) Global Supply Chain and Operations Management: *A decision-oriented introduction to the creation of value*. pp.12
- Dmitry Ivanov and Boris Sokolov. (2010) Adaptive Supply Chain Management: *Evolution of Supply Chain Management*.
- Earl, M.J. (2000) Evolving the E Business: Business Strategy Review. Vol. 11, Issue 2, pp 33-38.
- Ecommerce Foundation: European B2C E-commerce Report 2015 (Light Version).
 Report, Ecommerce Foundation (2015).
- E-Economy Conference. (2001) The Impact of the E-Economy on European Enterprises: *Economic Analysis and Policy Implications*, Brussels.

- Efraim T. (2003) Introduction to information technology, New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Efraim, T. (2008) Electronic Commerce 2008: A Managerial Perspective. Harlow: Prentice Hall.
- Efraim Turban, Jon Outland, David King, Jae Kyu Lee, Ting-Peng Liang and Deborrah
 C. Turban (2018), Electronic Commerce 2018, A Managerial and Social Networks Perspective. Ninth Edition. pp 7-31.
- Ellram, L. M., & Cooper, M. C. (2014). Supply chain management: It's all about the journey, not the destination. *Journal of Supply Chain Management*, 50(1), 8–20.
- Fassinger, R. and Morrow, S.L. (2013) Toward Best Practices in Quantitative.
- Fournier, S. (1998) Consumers and Their Brands. *Journal of Consumer Research*, Vol. 2, No. 2, pp. 351-354.
- Frey, J.H. and Oishi, S.M. (1995) "How to conduct interviews by telephone and in person". California, Sage Publications.
- Ganeshan, R., & Harrison, T. P. (1995). An introduction to supply chain management. Technical Report; Department of Management Science and Information Systems, The Pennsylvania State University.
- Giunipero L. and Sawchuck C. (2000), *E-purchasing plus: changing the way corporations buy*, JGC Enterprises, Goshen, New York.
- Graaf, X. & Muurling R.H. (2003) Underpinning the e-Business Framework Defining e-Business Concepts and Classifying e-Business Indicators. e-Transformation: 16th Bled e-Commerce Conference. Bled, Slovenia, June 9-11.
- Green, A. (2007) Business information--a natural path to business intelligence: *knowing what to capture, VINE,* vol. 37, pp. 18-23.
- Gunsekaran, A. and Ngai, E. W. T. (2005), e-Commerce in Hong Kong: an empirical perspective and analysis. Internet Research, Vol. 15 Issue 2 pp. 141 159.
- Houlihan, J. B. (1985). International supply chain management. *International Journal of Physical Distribution and Materials Management*, 15, 22–39.
- IBM. (2002), *DB2. UDB's High Function Business Intelligence in e-business*, 1st edn., California: IBM.

- Jack Ma (2018), Davos World Economic Forum interview, [Online] available report from: https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2018/01/jack-ma-davos-top-quotes/
- Jennifer Hord (2005), How Electronic Payment Works, [Online] available report from: <u>https://money.howstuffworks.com/personal-finance/online-banking/electronic-payment1.htm</u>
- J.-B. Sheu (2003), Locating manufacturing and distribution centers: An integrated supply-chain based spatial interaction approach, Transportation Research Part E: Logistics and transportation Review 39 pp.381–397.
- J.F. Shapiro (2004), Challenges of Strategic Supply Chain Planning and Modeling.
 Computers & Chemical Engineering 28, pp. 855–861.
- John Humphrey (2002), Institute of Development Studies: *Business-to-business e-Commerce and access to global markets*.
- Johnson P.F., Klassen R.D., Leenders M.R. and Awaysheh A. (2007). Utilizing ebusiness technologies in supply chains: The impact of firm characteristics and teams. *Journal of Operational Management*, 25 (6), pp.1255-1274.
- Kalkota, R and Whinston, A. (1997), Electronic Commerce: A Manager's Guide, Addison-Wesley, Reading, MA.
- Karvalics, L. (2007), Information Society what is it exactly, the meaning, history and conceptual framework of an expression? *Budapest: Network for teaching Information Society* (NETiS).
- Key, J. P. (1997). *Research Design in Occupational Education*. Oklahoma State University.
- Kiran Bala (April, 2014), Supply Chain Management: Some issues and challenges a review; Accepted 10 April 2014. Available from 15 April 2014, Vol.4, No.2.
- Kosovo IT Strategy. (2016) Government: Ministry of Economic Development and STIKK, [Online] available report from: <u>http://www.kryeministri-ks.net/repository/docs/Kosovo IT Strategy.pdf</u>
- Kosovo e-Commerce. (2017) [Online] available article from: <u>https://www.export.gov/article?id=Kosovo-Ecommerce</u>
- Kritchanchai, D., (2012). A framework for healthcare supply chain improvement in Thailand. *Operations and Supply Chain Management* 5 (2), pp.103-113.

- Kumar, T.A., Sravanthi, G. and Deepthi, R.D. (2013) Competitive Advantage through Business Intelligence for e-Commerce. *International Journal of Computer & Organization Trends*, 3(11), pp. 579 - 585.
- Kvale, S. (1996) "Interviews An Introduction to Qualitative Research Interviewing", Sage Publications, 1996.
- Laudon, K. C., and Carol G. T. (2014) *e-Commerce: Business, Technology, Society*.
 10th ed. Prentice Hall.
- Laudon, K., and Traver, C., (2003) *e-Commerce; business, technology, society*. Upper Saddle River, New Jersey, Pearson Prentice Hall
- Lee, H.L., So, K.C., and Tang, C.S. The Value of Information Sharing in a Two-Level Supply Chain. *Management Science* (46:5) 2000a, pp 626-643.
- Levine, R. (1997) "Financial Development and Economic growth: Views and Agenda". *Journal of Economic Literature*, Vol. XXXV, (June), pp. 688-726.
- Masuda, Y (1980). The Information Society as Post-Industrial Society. *The World Future Society*, Tokyo, IIS, Washington D. C.
- Melnyk, S. A., Lummus, R. R., Vokurka, R. J., Burns, L. J., Sandor, J. (2009) Mapping the Future of Supply Chain Management: A Delphi Study. *International Journal of Production Research*. Vol. 47, No. 16, p. 4629–4653.
- Miles, M. B. and Huberman, A. M. (1994) "Qualitative Data Analysis: an Expanded Sourcebook", Thousand Oaks, California, Sage Publications.
- Militaru, G.and Sebranica, D. (2008) Competitive Advantage by Integrated E-Business In Supply Chains: A Strategic Approach, *Academy of Economic Studies Bucharest*, pp. 27 – 35.
- Mojtahed, R, Nunes, M, Martins, J., Peng, A. (2014). Equipping the Constructivist Researcher: The Combined use of Semi-Structured Interviews and Decision-Making maps. *Electronic Journal of Business Research Methods*, 12 (2) p.87-95, Business Source Complete, EBSCOhost, viewed 18 March 2015.
- Murillo, L. (2001) Supply Chain Management and the International Dissemination of e-Commerce. *Industrial and Management and Data Systems*, Vol. 101, No. 7, pp. 370-377.

- Murray L. (1975) Computers, Communications and Society. Oxford University Press New York, NY.
- Nah, F. F. H. (2002). Enterprise resource planning solutions and management. IRM Press.
- Nigel Slack, Alistair Brandon-Jones, Robert Johnston (2013), Operations Management, seventh edition, part III, pp 414-415.
- Nigel Slack, Stuart Chambers, Robert Johnston (2010), Operations Management, sixth edition, chapter 13, pp 381-382.
- OECD. (2000) ICTs, e-Commerce and the Information Economy. *OECD Information Technology Outlook 2000*
- Otchere, A. F., Annan, J., Quansah, E. (2013) Assessing the Challenge and Implementation of Supply Chain Integration in the Cocoa Industry: A Factor of Cocoa Farmers in Ashanti Region in Ghana; *International Journal of Business and Social Sciences*. Vol. 4, No. 5, p. 112–123.
- Oliver, R. K., & Weber, M. D. (1982). Supply-chain management: Logistics catches up with strategy. In M. L. Christopher (Ed.), Logistics: The strategic issues (pp. 63– 75). London: Chapman & Hall.
- Pallant, J. (2010) SPSS Survival Manual. 4th Edition. Open University Press.
- Pavlou, P and Fygenson, M. (2006). Understanding and Predicting Electronic Commerce Adoption: An Extension of the Theory of Planned Behavior, *MIS Quarterly*, Vol 30, Issue 1, pp 115-143.
- Porter M.E. (2001), Strategy and the Internet, *Harvard Business Review*, 79 (3), 62-78.
- Ramzan, M. (2004) Levels of information technology (IT) applications in Muslim world libraries, *The Electronic Library*, Vol. 22 No. 3, pp. 275.
- Robert, M., (2003). Putting 'strategic' into information management. *Information Management Journal.*
- Rodgers, J. A., Yen, D. C. & Chou, D. C. (2002) Developing e-business: a strategic approach. *Information Management & Computer Security*, 10(4), 184-192.
- Rowley, J. (2003). Designing student feedback questionnaires. Quality Assurance in Education, 11(3), p.142 – 149.

- Saunders, M. Lewis, P. & Thornhill, A. (2009) Research methods for business students, 4th Edition. London: Financial Times Prentice Hall.
- S. Mitra (2007), Revenue Management for Remanufactured Products, Omega 35, pp. 553–562.
- Sammy El Ghazaly (2005) eMarket Service –Swedish Trade Council: Benefits and barriers on B2B e-marketplaces, <u>www.emarketservices.com</u>
- Samara Mubeen et al., (2014) Selection of Supplier in B2B E-Commerce Using Work Flow Petri Net. International Journal of Managing Value and Supply Chains (IJMVSC), Vol.5, No.3.
- Sanders, N. R., Wagner, S. M. (2011) Multidisciplinary and Multimethod Research for Addressing Contemporary Supply Chain Challenges. Journal of Business Logistics. Vol. 32, No. 4, p. 317–323.
- Schneider, Gary. (2014) *Electronic Commerce*. 11th ed. Stamford CT: Cengage Learning.
- Seddon, P. B., Shanks, G., & Willcocks, L. (2003) *Second-Wave Enterprise Resource Planning Systems,* Cambridge University Press.
- Speier, Ch., Whipple, J. M., Closs, D. J., Voss, M. D. (2011) Global Supply Chain Design Considerations: Mitigating Product Safety and Security Risks. Journal of Operations Management. No.29, p. 721–736.
- STIKK (2013), [Online] available report from: <u>http://www.mfa-ks.net/repository/docs/STIKK raport eng 2013 short web.pdf</u>.
- Subramaniam C. and Shaw M.J. (2004). The effects of process characteristics on the value of B2B e-procurement. *Information Technology Management*, 5 (1-2), pp.161-180.
- Suchanek, P. (2010) Business Intelligence as a Support of E-Commerce Systems in Connection with Decision Making and Crossborder Online Shopping. *Journal of Applied Economic Sciences*, V(1(11)), pp. 94 – 102.
- Surbhi S. (2016) Difference Between Traditional Commerce and e-Commerce.
 [Online] available article from: <u>https://keydifferences.com/difference-between-traditional-commerce-and-e-commerce.html#ComparisonChart</u>

- Tashakkori, A., Teddlie, C. (eds) (2003). *Handbook of Mixed Methods in Social and Behavioural Research*, Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage.
- Tarasewich, P., Nickerson, R. C. and Warkentin, M. (2001) Wireless/Mobile e-Commerce: *Technologies, Applications, and Issues*. [Online] available from: <u>http://paws.kettering.edu//~aborcher/articles/CC001.pdf</u>
- Terri C.A., and William B. S., (2003). E-business Marketing. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- The Franklin Institute (2015) *Glossary of Terms* [online].
- The McKinsey (2001) Quarterly, Number 2.
- Turban, E., King, D., Warkentin, M. & Chung, M. (2002) Electronic commerce 2002: A managerial perspective, Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Vsourz, Benefits of marketplace. [Online] available report from: <u>http://www.marketplacecommerce.com/</u>
- W. Wilhelm, D. Liang, B. Rao, D. Warrier, X. Zhu, and Bulusu (2005) Design of international assembly systems and their supply chains under NAFTA, Transportation Research Part E: Logistics and Transportation Review 41 467–493.
- William, B.K & Sawyar, S.C(2005) Using Information Technology, 6th edition, McGra-Hill Publishing Co. U.S.A, pp 3-4,147, 446-457.
- Wimmer, R.D. and Dominick J.D. (1997) "Mass Media Research: An Introduction". Belmont, Massachusetts, Wadsworth.
- Wiengarten, F., Fynes, B., Humphreys, P., Chavez, R.C. and McKittrick, A. (2011). Assessing the value creation process of e-business along the supply chain. *Supply Chain Management: An International Journal*, 16 (4), pp.207-2019.
- Yang, M. (2012) Supply Chain Management under E-Commerce Environment. International Journal of Innovation, Management and Technology, 3(3), pp. 210-211.
- Zhang, P., Aikman, S., & Sun, H. (2008) Two types of attitudes in ICT acceptance and use. *International Journal of Human Interaction*, 24(7), 628-648.

7. Appendices

- Appendix 1 – Questionnaire in Albanian language



I/e nderuar,

Jam në përfundim të tezës së magjistraturës në lidhje me përcaktimin e ndikimit të Menaxhimit të Zinxhirit Furnizues ndërmejt bizneseve në tregun e Kosovës nëpërmjet web platformave.

Qëllimi i tezës është që të shikoj tek drejtuesit e mundshëm dhe pengesat e mundshme lidhur me implementimin e Menaxhimit të Zinxhirit të Furnizimit ndërmjet ndërmarrjeve kosovare. Gjithashtu ky hulumtim do të shikojë se në çfarë shkalle janë zbatuar aktualisht komponentët e Menaxhimit të Zinxhirit të Furnizimit nga ndërmarrjet kosovare dhe mundësitë e mbështetjes të sektorit të Teknologjisë Informative për këto ndërmarrje lidhur me implementimin e Menaxhimit të Zinxhirit të Furnizimit të Furnizimit në Furnizimit në përmjet platformave.

Kjo tezë është obligative për përfundimin e studimeve të mia të Magjistraturës në degën Business Informatics në Universitetin e Evropës Juglindore.

Më poshtë gjeni pyetësorin prej gjashtë faqeve i cili është i lehtë për tu mbushur dhe do të ju duhen diku 10 minuta për ta mbushur.

Pjesëmarrja juaj në këtë pyetësor është vullnetare dhe jam i vetëdijshëm që përgjigjet tuaja janë konfidenciale dhe se përgjigjet tuaja do të përdoren vetëm për qëllime të këtij studimi.

Për mua është shumë me rëndësi të kem/marr mendimin tuaj mbi pyetjet në vijim.

Ju faleminderit që keni gjetur kohë të përgjigjeni në këtë pyetësor!

Me respektin më të madh,

Besar Spahija

	Moduli A: Përdorimi i kompjuterëve dhe telefonave të mencur				
A1.	A përdorë kompania juaj kompjuterë? (Pyetje filtruese)	Po□	Jo/No⊡ ->shko te X1		
4.2	A jeni përdorues i telefonave të mencur (smartphone)? (Pyetje filtruese)				
A2.	Nëse po, cfarë sistemi operativ përdorni?	Po□	Jo□		
	IOS				
	Andorid				
	Moduli B: A ka kompania juaj webfaqe				
B1.	A ka kompania juaj webfaqe? (Pyetje filtruese)	Po□	Jo⊡ ->shko tek D1		
B2.	A përmban webfaqja juaj shërbime të mëposhtmet?				
		Po	Jo		
	a) Prezantimin e produkteve, listën e çmimeve të produkteve dhe përshkrimin e tyre!				
	b) Mundësinë për porosi online të produkteve nga konsumatorët!				
	c) Mundësine për pagesë online nga konsumatorët!				
	d) Link apo referim në profilet në mediat sociale të lokalit!				
	e) Të tjera!				

Moduli C: Bashkëveprimi elektronik me institucionet publike nëpërmjet web faqeve

C1.	A ka bashkëvepruar ndërmarrja/lokali juaj me institucione publike gjatë vitit 2017 përmes internetit, në ndonjërën nga mënyrat e poshtëshënuara?	Po	Jo
	a) Për të marrë informata të ndryshme ne forme elektronike!		
	b) Për të marrë formularë të ndryshëm p.sh. formularë tatimorë!		
	c) Për të paguara tatimet apo faturat komunale apo obligimet tjera nga institucioneve!		
	d) Për të bërë ankesa ndaj institucioneve!		

Moduli D: Ndarja e informatave në mënyrë elektronike me zinxhirin furnizues dhe porositë

	Ndarja e informatave në mënyrë elektronike në Menaxhimin e Zinxhirit Furnizues do të thotë shkëmbimi i çdo lloj informate me furnitorët dhe/ose konsumatorët rreth disponueshmërisë, prodhimit, zhvillimit apo distribuimit të mallrave ose shërbimeve.				
	Këtë informata mund të ndahen përmes webfaqes, rrjeteve apo mënyrave tjera të transferit elektronik, por përjashtim kanë email mesazhet e shtypura në mënyrë manuale.				
D1.	A ndanë kompania juaj informata me furnitorët mbi menaxhimin e zinxhirit furnizues?				
	(p.sh. Informata mbi gjendjen e stokut, kapacitetin e konsumit nga konsumatori juaj fundor, kapacitetin e shitjes së produkteve tuaja, parashikimet e kërkesave nga konsumatoret në të ardhmen, etj.).				
	Nese po, ne cfare forme keni bere porosite e produkteve, nga kompania juaj tek furnitoret gjate vitit 2017?	Po□	Jo⊡- >shko tek D2		
	a) Nëpërmjet komunikim të drejtëpërdrejt, takimeve informuese!				
	b) Nëpërmjet komunikimit përmes telefonit!				
	 c) Dërgim të porosisë nëpërmjet aplikacioneve përmes telefonit të mencur (Viber, WhatsApp, etj)! 				
	d) Nëpërmjet mënyres elektronike, përmes email-it!				
	d) Dërgim të porosive online nëpërmjet veglës që mundëson web platforma e integruar!				

	Porositë				
D2.	A do të dëshironit të bënit porositë e produkteve në mënyrën online nëpërmjet ndonjë web platforme të integruar, që mund të përdorej nga ana juaj?	Po⊟ kalo tek D3	JoE kalo D3	∃ tek	Hezit oj⊡
	(Pyetje filtruese) Nëse hezitoni të bëni porositë e produkteve në mënyrën online, cila është arsyeja?				
	 a) Mungesa e besimit lidhur me sigurinë e të dhënave personale brenda web platformës! 				
	b) Mungesa e besimit ndaj funksionimit të sistemit!				
	c) Nuk jam i familjarizuar për të manovruar me web plaftorma të tilla! Mungesë të përvojes në IT/ICT!				
	d) Faktorë tjerë!				
D3.	Kur bëni porosi të produkteve në cfarëdo forme, a është i përfshirë dhe transporti i produkteve brenda porosisë së produkteve?	Po⊟ ka E1	o tek	Jo te	□ kalo ek D4

D4.	Nëse jo, a dëshironi të jetë i përfshirë?	Po□	Jo□

	Moduli E: Faturat Elektronike						
	Ekzistojnë fatura të shtypura në letër dhe në formë elektronike të dy llojeve:	Ekzistojnë fatura të shtypura në letër dhe në formë elektronike. Faturat në formë elektronike janë të dy llojeve:					
	 eFaturat ne strukture standarde të përshtatshme për procesim automatik.(p.sh. EDI, UBL, XML,. Ato shkëmbehen ose direkt ose përmes operatorëve të shërbimeve ose përmes sistemit të e-banking. 						
	 Faturat në formë elektronike që nuk janë të përshtatshme për procesim automatik. (p.sh. e- mail, bashkëngjitje në email si pdf, foto në TIF, JPEG apo format tjetër) 						
E1.	A ka pranuar kompania juaj fatura elektronike ose të shtypura nga furnitorët gjatë vitit 2017? (Pyetje filtruese)	Po⊡ Jo⊡>-shko tek E3			-shko E3		
E2.	Nga të gjitha faturat që kompania juaj i <u>ka pranuar nga</u> <u>furnitor</u> ë <u>t gj</u> atë vitit 2017, sa përqind janë <u>pranuar</u> si:	(%))		
	a) eFatura në strukturën standarde të përshtatshme për procesim automatik	Ц	Ц	Ц	Ц	Ш	
	b) Fatura në formë eletronike jo të përshtatshme për procesim automatik? (p.sh. email, bashkangjitje në email si pdf etj)	Ц	Ш	Ц	Ш	Ш	
	c) Fatura vetëm të shtypura në letër?	Ш		Ц	Ш	Ш	
	TOTALI	100%	75%	50%	25%	0	
E3.	A do të dëshironit që faturat e juaja ti pranoni në formë elektronike si eFatura nga furnitorët?	Po□>	-kalo te	k F1	Hezitoj□		
	(Pyetje filtruese)						
	Nëse hezitoni të pranoni faturat në formë elektronike nga furnitorët, cila është arsyeja?						
	a) Shqetesimi lidhur me sigurinë e të dhënave personale brenda web platformës!						
	b) Mungesa e besimit ndaj funksionimit te sistemit!						
	c) Nuk jam i familjarizuar për të manovruar me web plaftorma të tilla! Mungesë të përvojës në IT/ICT!						
	d) Faktorë tjerë!						

	Moduli F: Pagesat elektronike	
F1.	Gjatë vitit 2017, në cforme ka bërë ndërmarrja juaj pagesat ndaj furnitorëve?	

	a) Nëpërmjet pagesave kesh!]	
	b) Nëpërmjet e-banking transfereve!			
	c) Nëpërmjet veglës për pagesë të integruar në ndonjë web platformë ndërmjetëse ose të furnitorëve!		ן	
	d) Përmes formave tjera, si p.sh palëve të treta, PayPal etj!		ן	
F2.	A do të dëshironit të bënit pagesa të porosive tek furnitorët në		Jo□	Hezitoi□
	forme elektronike permes web platformave? (Pyetje littuese)	Po□	kalo tek	kalo tek
	Nëse po, në cfare forme do të dëshironit të bënit këto pagesa?		X1	F3
	a) Nëpërmjet e-banking personal, përmes transferit!			
	b) Nëpërmjet web platformës së furnitorëve, të cilët e kanë të integruar modulin për pagesë (API bankar)!			
	c) Nëpërmjet web platformës të cilën e ka integruar një kompani e pavaruar ndërmjetëse që azhuron me proceset ndërmjet furnitorëve dhe blerësve, që e ka të integruar modulin për pagesë (API bankar)!			
	d) Forma tjera!	Ľ]	
	Nëse hezitoni të bëni pagesat e faturave në formë elektronike nga furnitorët, cila është arsyeja?			
F3.	a) Shqetësimi lidhur me sigurinë e të dhënave personale brenda web platformës!			
	b) Mungesa e besimit ndaj funksionimit të sistemit!]	
	c) Nuk jam i familjarizuar për të manovruar me web plaftorma të tilla! Mungesë të pervojës në IT/ICT!	C	ו	
	d) Faktorë të tjerë!	Ľ]	

F4.	Nëse jeni aktualisht duke procesuar me pagesa online nëpërmjet webfaqes, sa jeni të kënaqur me mënyrën e funksionimit të sistemit?		
	a) Shumë i knaqur, pagesat procesohen me sukses!		
	b) I knaqur, pagesat procesohen ngadal por me sukses!		
	c) Pjeserisht i knaqur, pasi pagesat procesohen me sukses por aplikacioni nuk eshte i adoptuar per perdorim te thjeshte!	Ц	
	 d) I pakënaqur, pasi ka veshtiresi gjate procesimit te pagesave, pagesa fshihet dhe duhet të bëhet nga fillimi! 	Ц	
	e) Nuk mund të pergjgjem!	Ц	

	Moduli X: Informata të përgjithshme mbi kompaninë dhe të tjera			
			(shkruaj)	
X1.	Aktiviteti kryesor ekonomik i kompanisë suaj			
X2.	Përshkruaj me pak fjalë për mënyrën aktuale të procesimit porosive të kompanisë tuaj tek furnitorët, mënyrën e prani të faturave nga furnitorët dhe mënyrën e pagesave ndaj furnitorëve!	të mit		
ХЗ.	A pajtoheni që mënyra elektronike e funksionimit me zinxh furnizues, i ka përparësitë e saj në krahasim me metodën tradicionale?	iirin		
	Pajtohem plotesisht□			
	Nuk jam i sigurt⊡			
	Nuk pajtohem □			
X4.	Cilat jane sfidat në implementimin e sistemit electronic për menaxhimin të zingjirit furnizues në Kosovë?	r		
	Penetrimi i ulët i internetit			
	Shqetësimet lidhur me sigurinë			
	Mungesë e besimit			
	Niveli i ulët i vetëdijes së konsumatorit	ב		
	Faktorë të tjerë			
X5.	Cila do të ishte mënyra e rekomanduar për promovim implementimit të sistemit electronic për menaxhimin të zin furnizues në Kosovë?	gjirit		
	Promovimi nëpërmjet internetit 🗆			
	Ngritje e vetëdijes së konsumatorëve □			
	Një casje promocionale të integruar □			
	Masa tjera □			
X6.	Sipas jush cila është e ardhmja e implementimit të sistemi menaxhimin e zingjirit furnizues në tregun e Kosovës?	t për		
	Do te kete sukses te jashtezakonshem □			
	Ka perspektive te mirë			
	Jo dhe aq premtuese			
	Nuk ka te ardhme			

- Appendix 2 – Questionnaire in English language



Dear,

I am at the end of my studies in master of business informatics and currently working on my thesis on the level of determining the impact of B2B Supply Chain Management in Kosovo marketplace!

The aim of this research is to look at possible drivers and barriers to the implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management by Kosovar enterprises.

The research will also look to what degree the components of B2B Supply Chain Management have currently been implemented by Kosovar enterprises, and the support possibilities from ICT sector for these enterprises for the implementation of B2B Supply Chain Management through platforms.

This dissertation is mandatory for me to finish my studies in Business Informatics at South East European University.

Please find below a questionnaire of six pages that is easy to fill and you will need maximum 10 minutes to fill.

Your participation in this questionnaire is voluntary and I am aware that your answers are confidential and that they will be used only for purposes of this study.

It is very important for me to have your opinion of the following questions.

Thank you in advance!

With the greatest respect,

Besar Spahija

	Module A: Use of computers and smart phones		
A1.	Does your enterprise use computers? (Filter question)	Yes 🗆	No 🗆
A2.	Do you use smartphones/tablets in your company? (Filter question) If yes, which operating system you use ?	Yes 🗆	No 🗆
	IOS		
	Andorid		

	Moduli B: Use of website		
B1.	Does your enterprise have a Website? (Filter question)	Yes □	No □ -> Go to D1
B2.	Does the Website have any of the following?		
		Po	Jo
	a) Description of goods or services, price lists and product specifications!		
	b) Possibility for online ordering or reservation!		
	c) Possibility for online payments!		
	d) Links or references to the enterprise's social media profiles!		
	e) Other services!		

	Moduli C: Interaction with public institutions through websites				
C1.	Did your enterprise interacted with public institutions during 2017 through internet, in any of the following ways?	Yes	No		
	a) To obtain different information				
	b) To obtain different forms e.g. tax forms				
	c) To pay taxes or other institutional fees				
	d) To file complains on institutions				

Module D: Sharing information electronically on Supply Chain Management

	Sharing information electronically on Supply Chain Management means exchanging all types of information with suppliers and/or customers about the availability, production, development and distribution of goods or services. This information may be exchanged via websites, networks or other means of electronic data transfer, but it excludes manually typed e-mail messages.			
D1.	Does your enterprise share supply chain management information with its suppliers? (e.g. Information on inventory levels, production plans, planning or progress in the provision of services, demand forecasts or progress of deliveries, etc.). In which of any below ways, your company order products toward supplier?	Yes □	No 🗆	
	a) Through direct communication, and meetings!			
	b) Through phone communication!			
	c) Sending orders through any of mobile social application (Viber, WhatsApp, etj)!			
	d) Sending orders through electronic mails!			
	d) Making online orders through any integrated web platforms!			

	Orders					
D2.	Would you prefer making orders through any integrated online		No□		Hesitate	
	web platforms, which would be accessible from you to use it?	Yes□	Go to)		
	(Filter question)		20			
	If you hesitate making orders through online web platforms, what is the reason?					
	a) Concern regarding the security of business data within the web platform!	Ľ				
	b) Lack of confidence regarding the system functionality!					
	c) I'm not familiar to operate with such web platforms! Lack of experience on ICT!	C				
	d) Other factors!					
D3.	While you are making orders in any form, is the transport	Ye	s□		No□	
	Included by the supplier?	Go te	o E1	(Go to D4	
D4.	If not, do you want it to be included?	Ye	s□		No□	

	Module E: Electronic invoicing						
	 There are invoices in paper form and electronic form. Invoices in electronic form are of two types: e-Invoices in a standard structure suitable for automated processing. (e.g. EDI, UBL, XML, <i>[please add national examples]</i>). They are exchanged either directly or via service operators or via an electronic banking system. Invoices in electronic form not suitable for automated processing. (e.g. e-mails, e-mail attachment as pdf, images in TIF, JPEG or other format) 						
E1.	Did your enterprise receive any electronic or printed invoices from suppliers during 2017? (Filter question)	Yes□ No□>-go to E3				>-go Ξ3	
E2.	From all invoices that enterprise <u>received from</u> <u>suppliers</u> during 2017, what percentage was received as:	(%)					
	a) e-Invoices in a standard structure suitable for automated processing?	Ш	Ш	Ш	Ш	Ш	
	b) Invoices in electronic form not suitable for automated processing? (e.g. emails, e-mail attachment as pdf etc.)	Ш	Ш			Ц	
	c) Invoices only in paper form?	Ц	Ц	Ц	Ц	Ц	
	TOTAL	100%	75%	50%	25%	0	
E3.	Would you like to receive invoices in electronic form as e-invoices from your supplier?	YesD]>-go to	5 F1	Hesitate□		
	(filter question) If you hesitate receiving invoices in electronic form through online web platforms, what is the reason?						
	 a) Concern regarding the security of business data within the web platform! 						
	b) Lack of confidence regarding the system functionality!						
	c) I'm not familiar to operate with such web platforms! Lack of experience on ICT!						
	d) Other factors!						

	Module F: Electronic payment	
F1.	During 2017, in which way your enterprise made payments towards suppliers?	
	a) Through cash payment!	

	b) Through e-banking transfers!				
	c) Through suppliers or any intermediary web platforms which have integrated payment gateway!	C]		
	d) Through other forms, such third-party payment, PayPal etc!]		
F2.	Would you prefer making orders payment toward suppliers through any electronic way? If yes, in which way would you like to make these payments?	Yes□ >-go to X1	No⊡>- go to X1	F	lesitate]>-go to F3
	a) Through e-banking transfers!	C]	-	
	b) Through any supplier web platforms which have integrated payment gateway (API)!	C]		
	c) Through any intermediary web platforms with integrated payment gateway (API), which enables operation activities between buyers and suppliers!	C]		
	d) Forma tjera!	C]		
E2	If you hesitate making orders payment toward suppliers through any electronic way, what is the reason?				
	a) Concern regarding the security of business data within the web platform!	C]		
	b) Lack of confidence regarding the system functionality!	C]		
	c) I'm not familiar to operate with such web platforms! Lack of experience on ICT!	C]		
	d) Other factors!	C]		
	If you are currently processing with online payments via the web platform, how satisfied are you with how the system works?				
	a) Very satisfied, payments are processed successfully!				
F4.	b) Satisfied, payments are processed slowly but successfully!				
	c) Somewhat satisfied, as payments are processed successfully but the application is not adopted for easy use!	Ц			
	d) Dissatisfied, as there is a difficulty in processing payments, the payment is lost during processing and should be done from the beginning!	Ц			
	e) I can't give an answer!	Ц			

Module X: General information about the enterprises

(write)

X1.	Main economic activity of the enterprise!	
X2.	Describe in a nutshell the current way of processing with orders, how orders are made, how your company receive invoices from suppliers, and which payment way you use!	
X3.	Do you agree that an integrated supply chain management system, has its advantages compared with the traditional way?	
	Completely agree!	-
	Agree!	
	Disagree!	
X4.	What are the challenges on implementing the Supply Chain Management system in Kosovo market?	
	Low internet penetration!	
	Concern about security of personal data!	
	Lack of trust on system functionality!	
	Low level of consumer awareness!	
	Other factors!	-
X5.	What would be the recommended way of promoting the integration of Supply Chain Management in Kosovo local market?	
	Promotion through the internet!	-
	Raising consumer awareness!	
	An integrated promotional approach form!	
	Other measures!	
X6.	What is the future of implementation of electronic Supply Chain Management system in Kosovo local market?	
	Extraordinary success!	
	It has perspective!	
	Not enough promising!	
	There is no future!	
	I don't know!	

- Appendix 3 – Interview open-ended question in Albanian Language

Ju lutemi shënoni kutinë nëse pajtoheni për kushtet e intervistës!		No
Unë pajtohem të intervistohem nga intervistuesi.		
Unë pajtohem të pëgjigjem në pyetjet lidhur me proceset tona në organizimin dhe menaxhimin e zingjirit furnizues.		
Unë e kuptoj se pjesëmarrja ime në këtë studim është vullnetare.		
Unë e kuptoj se mund të vendos të tërhiqem nga ky hulumtim në çdo kohë, pa pasoja negative për mua.		
Unë e kuptoj se privatësia dhe konfidencialiteti personal, do të ruhet dhe respektohet nga të gjitha analizat e të dhënave të botuara dhe të shkruara në këtë studim.		
Unë e kuptoj se studiuesi do të përdorë dhe një regjistrues zanor për të regjistruar zërin tim gjatë intervistës, i cili regjistrim do të përdoret vetëm për evidencë interne të studiuesit.		

Q1. Cili është aktiviteti kryesor i kompanisë suaj, a ofroni produkte dhe shërbime vetëm për HORECA apo edhe industri tjera? Sa punëtor i keni, dhe a keni depo fizike?

Q2. Si është i organizuar procesi i logjistikës në kompaninë tuaj duke përfshirë marrjen e porosisë nga konsumatorët dhe dorëzimin e mallit?

Q3. Si bëhet faturimi ndaj konsumatorëve (në kopje fizike, në formë elektronike, ose...), dhe në cfarë forme bëhet pagesa e faturave nga konsumatorët?

Q4. A keni të zhvilluar dhe integurar ndonjë platformë ose web platformë, dhe nëse po, a mund të bëhen porosi, pranim i faturave dhe pagesa përmes kësaj platforme?

- nëse përgjigja është po, mbyllet intervista....

Q5. A do të kishit gatishmëri që të transformonit proceset tuaja manuale në elektronike, si pranimin e porosive nga konsumatorët, faturimin dhe pagesat, duke përfshirë implementimin e ndonjë platforme, në menyrë që të krijoni avantazh në treg? Nëse hezitoni, cilat janë arsyet?

Faleminderit shumë për kohën tuaj!

- Appendix 4 – Interview open-ended question in English Language

Please tick the box that applies!		No
I agree to be interviewed by the researcher.		
I agree to complete questionnaires asking me about our processes related to supply chain management.		
I understand that my participation in this study is voluntary.		
I understand that I can choose to withdraw from this research at any time, without negative consequence to me.		
I understand that my individual privacy and confidentiality will be maintained in all published and written data analysis of this study.		
I understand that the researcher will use a voice recorder to record my own voice during the interview.		

Q1. What is your main Company activity, do you provide products and services just for HORECA industry, or also for other industries? How many employees do you have, and do you have your own warehouse?

Q2. Can explain how are organized logistic operations including receiving orders from customers until the delivery of shipment?

Q3. In which way order invoices are delivered from your side to customer (print invoice, electronic invoice through mail or...), and how the customers make payment of invoices?

Q4. Do you have any web platform or any kind of application platform which provides supply chain services, if yes, what type of services are offered?

- If the question is yes, the interview will be closed...

Q5. If your communication and cooperation way towards customers is still organized through traditional way, would you prefer to transform your processes such as receiving orders from customers, sending invoices to customers and payment system, on such electronic way through any kind of application platform, in order to have competitive advantages in market? If you hesitate, what are the reasons about it?

Thank you very much for your time!